

# BBIS

Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory  
with open peer commentary  
Volume 37 | Issue 1 | February 2014 | ISSN: 0140-525X

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

## Editors

Paul Bloom  
Barbara L. Finlay

URL: <http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs>

## E-mail: [bbsjournal@cambridge.org](mailto:bbsjournal@cambridge.org)

Behavioral and Brain Sciences  
Journals Department  
Cambridge University Press  
32 Avenue of The Americas  
New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

## Managing Editor

Gennifer Levey

## Chief Copy Editor

Sumitra Mukerji

## Proofreaders

Sylvia Elvin  
Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

## Editorial Board

### *Affective Neuroscience*

Stephanie D. Preston/U. of Michigan

### *Atypical Neurodevelopment*

Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

### *Behavioral Neurogenetics*

Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

### *Cognition and Artificial Intelligence*

Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

### *Cognitive and Decision Sciences*

Nick Chater/University College London

### *Cognitive Development*

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

### *Cognitive Neuroscience*

Moshe Bar/Harvard Medical School

### *Computational Neuroscience*

Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

### *Evolution of Brain and Cognition*

Dean Falk/Florida State U.

### *Evolution of Cognition*

Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

### *Experimental Analysis of Behavior*

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

### *Language and Language Disorders*

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

### *Linguistics*

Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

### *Perception*

Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

### *Philosophy of Science*

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

### *Primate Cognition*

Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

### *Social Cognition*

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

### *Social Cognitive Neuroscience*

Rebecca Saxe/MIT

### *Vision, Language and Computation*

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

## FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001)

Stevan Harnad

**Editorial Policy** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary\* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst>) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/BBSAssoc>).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc> and then email [bbsjournal@cambridge.org](mailto:bbsjournal@cambridge.org).

© Cambridge University Press 2014. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).

**Subscriptions** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 37 (2014) for *institutions* is US \$1391.00 for print and online and US \$1118.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £820.00 for print and online and UK £661.00 for online only elsewhere. The subscription price for *individuals* is US \$392.00 for print and online and US \$353.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £229.00 for print and online and UK £208.00 for online only elsewhere. For *BBS Associates*, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$139.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £87.00 elsewhere. For *students*, with proof of eligibility with order, \$116.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £68.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$263.00 (UK £131.00) plus postage. *Institutional* orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: [journals\\_subscriptions@cambridge.org](mailto:journals_subscriptions@cambridge.org); in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England, e-mail: [journals\\_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk](mailto:journals_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk). *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs>.

**Postmaster:** Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England.

**Online availability** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

*Institutional subscribers:* Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see <http://cambridge.journals.org>.

**Advertising** Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

\*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

# Contents Volume 37:1 February 2014

<b>Newell, B. R. &amp; Shanks, D. R.</b> Unconscious influences on decision making: A critical review	1
<b>Open Peer Commentary:</b>	
<b>Antony, L.</b> Degraded conditions: Confounds in the study of decision making	19
<b>Baumeister, R. F., Vohs, K. D. &amp; Masicampo, E. J.</b> Maybe it helps to be conscious, after all	20
<b>Bernacer, J., Balderas, G., Martinez-Valbuena, I., Pastor, M. A. &amp; Murillo J. I.</b> The problem of consciousness in habitual decision making	21
<b>Brogaard, B., Marlow, K. &amp; Rice, K.</b> Unconscious influences on decision making in blindsight	22
<b>Brooks, S. J. &amp; Stein, D. J.</b> Unconscious influences on decision making: Neuroimaging and neuroevolutionary perspectives	23
<b>Coppin, G.</b> Unconscious influences of, not just on, decision making	24
<b>Dijksterhuis, A., van Knippenberg, A., Holland, R. W. &amp; Veling, H.</b> Newell and Shanks' approach to psychology is a dead end	25
<b>Evans, J. St. B. T.</b> The presumption of consciousness	26
<b>Finkbeiner, M. &amp; Coltheart, M.</b> Dismissing subliminal perception because of its famous problems is classic "baby with the bathwater"	27
<b>González-Vallejo, C., Stewart, T. R., Lassiter, G. D. &amp; Weindhardt, J. M.</b> How necessary is the unconscious as a predictive, explanatory, or prescriptive construct?	28
<b>Hahn, A. &amp; Gawronski, B.</b> Do implicit evaluations reflect unconscious attitudes?	28
<b>Hassin, R. R. &amp; Milyavsky, M.</b> But what if the default is defaulting?	29
<b>Helzer, E. G. &amp; Dunning, D.</b> Context, as well as inputs, shape decisions, but are people aware of it?	30
<b>Hogarth, R. M.</b> Automatic processes, emotions, and the causal field	31
<b>Huizenga, H. M., van Duijvenvoorde, A. C. K., van Ravenzwaaij, D., Wetzels, R. &amp; Jansen, B. R. J.</b> Is the unconscious, if it exists, a superior decision maker?	32
<b>Hytönen, K.</b> Neuroscientific evidence for contextual effects in decision making	33
<b>Ingram, G. P. D. &amp; Prochownik, K.</b> Restrictive and dynamic conceptions of the unconscious: Perspectives from moral and developmental psychology	34
<b>McLaren, I. P. L., Dunn, B. D., Lawrence, N. S., Milton, F. N., Verbruggen, F., Stevens, T., McAndrew, A. &amp; Yeates, F.</b> Why decision making may not require awareness	35
<b>Ogilvie, R. &amp; Carruthers, P.</b> Better tests of consciousness are needed, but skepticism about unconscious processes is unwarranted	36
<b>Persaud, N. &amp; McLeod, P.</b> Demonstrations of subconscious processing with the binary exclusion task	37
<b>Rakow, T.</b> Self-insight research as (double) model recovery	37
<b>Sher, S. &amp; Winkielman, P.</b> What we (don't) know about what we know	38
<b>Snodgrass, M., Shevrin, H. &amp; Abelson, J. A.</b> Extremely rigorous subliminal paradigms demonstrate unconscious influences on simple decisions	39
<b>Srinivasan, N. &amp; Mukherjee, S.</b> Even "unconscious thought" is influenced by attentional mechanisms	40
<b>Steingroever, H. &amp; Wagenmakers, E.-J.</b> Performance and awareness in the Iowa Gambling Task	41
<b>Uhlmann, E. L.</b> The problem of the null in the verification of unconscious cognition	42
<b>Velmans, M.</b> What makes a conscious process conscious?	43
<b>Waroquier, L., Abadie, M., Klein, O. &amp; Cleeremans, A.</b> The effect of the cognitive demands of the distraction task on unconscious thought	44
<b>Authors' Response:</b>	
<b>Shanks, D. R. &amp; Newell, B. R.</b> The primacy of conscious decision making	45

**Bentley, R. A., O'Brien, M. J. & Brock, W. A.** Mapping collective behavior in the big-data era

63

**Open Peer Commentary:**

**Analytis, P. P., Moussaïd, M., Artinger, F., Kämmer, J. E., & Gigerenzer, G.** “Big data” needs an analysis of decision processes 76  
**Bookstein, F. L.** “The map is not the territory” 78  
**Buck, R.** Extending the global village: Emotional communication in the online age 79  
**Christen, M. & Brugger, P.** Mapping collective behavior – beware of looping 80  
**Durlauf, S. N.** Modesty can be constructive: Linking theory and evidence in social science 81  
**Fan, J. E. & Suchow, J. W.** The crowd is self-aware 81  
**Fortunato, S., Saramäki, J. & Onnela, J.-P.** Adding network structure onto the map of collective behavior 82  
**García, A. N., Torralba, J. M. & González, A. M.** Missing emotions: The Z-axis of collective behavior 83  
**Godzińska, E. J. & Wróbel, A.** Capturing the essence of decision making should not be oversimplified 85  
**Hopfensitz, A., Lorini, E. & Moisan, F.** Conflicting goals and their impact on games where payoffs are more or less ambiguous 85  
**Keane, M. T. & Gerow, A.** It’s distributions all the way down!: Second order changes in statistical distributions also occur 87  
**Le Mens, G.** Keeping conceptual boundaries distinct between decision making and learning is necessary to understand social influence 87  
**MacCoun, R. J.** Alternative maps of the world of collective behaviors 88  
**McCain, R. A. & Hamilton, R.** Coordination games, anti-coordination games, and imitative learning 90  
**Mesoudi, A.** Cultural evolution in more than two dimensions: Distinguishing social learning biases and identifying payoff structures 91

**Moat, H. S., Preis, T., Olivola, C. Y., Liu, C. & Chater, N.** Using big data to predict collective behavior in the real world 92  
**Norgate, S. H., Davies, N., Speed, C., Cherrett, T. & Dickinson, J.** The missing dimension: The relevance of people’s conception of time 93  
**O’Donnell, M. B., Falk, E. B. & Konrath, S.** Big data in the new media environment 94  
**Pfister, H.-R. & Böhm, G.** Independent decisions are fictional from a psychological perspective 95  
**Reader, S. M. & Leris, I.** What shapes social decision making? 96  
**Roesch, E. B., Stahl, F. & Gaber, M. M.** Bigger data for big data: From Twitter to brain–computer interfaces 97  
**Ross, D.** Economics is all over the map 98  
**Ruths, D. & Shultz, T.** Understanding social networks requires more than two dimensions 99  
**Schmidt, C. T.** The global shift: Shadows of identifiability 99  
**Spurrett, D.** A map of *where*? Problems with the “transparency” dimension 100  
**Swain, J. E., Sripada, C. & Swain, J. D.** Using big data to map the network organization of the brain 101  
**Taquet, M., Quidbach, J., de Montjoye, Y.-A. & Desseilles, M.** Mapping collective emotions to make sense of collective behavior 102  
**Uhlmann, E. L. & Silberzahn, R.** Conformity under uncertainty: Reliance on gender stereotypes in online hiring decisions 103  
**Zhou, X., Xie, W. & Ye, M.** Interaction between social influence and payoff transparency 104  
**Authors’ Response:**  
**Bentley, R. A., O’Brien, M. J. & Brock, W. A.** More on maps, terrains, and behaviors 105