

May 2025
Volume 140 Number 3

PMLA

Publications of the Modern Language Association of America

Achieve



bedford/st.martin's
macmillan learning

Achieve Solves Writing Classroom Challenges

Achieve for English offers a dedicated composition space for writing instructors and for students at varying levels of preparedness. Achieve's writing tools break down the writing process for students, make revision choices visible to instructors, and guide students through drafting, peer review, plagiarism check, reflection, and revision.

- **Integrate with your LMS**
- **Engage and support students at all levels**
- **Give students actionable feedback and agency over the revision process**

New in Titles in Literature



Inspire what's possible. To learn more about Achieve or contact your local Bedford/St. Martin's representative visit go.macmillanlearning.com/english2025

May 2025
Volume 140 Number 3

PMLA

Publications of the Modern Language Association of America

Published five times a year by the
Modern Language Association of America
and Cambridge University Press

THE MODERN LANGUAGE
ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA
[Organized 1883, Incorporated 1900]

Officers

FOR THE TERM ENDING 11 JANUARY 2026

President

TINA LU
Yale University

First Vice President

HERMAN BEAVERS
University of Pennsylvania

Second Vice President

WAIL S. HASSAN
University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign

Executive Director

PAULA M. KREBS

Executive Council

FOR THE TERM ENDING 11 JANUARY 2026

AMA BEMMA ADWETWEA-BADU
Washington University in St. Louis

BRENDA BRUEGGEMANN
University of Connecticut, Storrs

LEAH S. MARCUS
Vanderbilt University

IFEOMA C. KIDDOE NWANKWO
San Francisco State University

FOR THE TERM ENDING 10 JANUARY 2027

DAVID DAMROSCH
Harvard University

STACEY LEE DONOHUE
Central Oregon Community College

VIRGINIA RAMOS
University of San Francisco

FOR THE TERM ENDING 9 JANUARY 2028

RITA BERNICE DANDRIDGE
Virginia State University

MARISA GALVEZ
Stanford University

DEBORA MALDONADO-DEOLIVEIRA
Meredith College

LUANA REIS
Princeton University

FOR THE TERM ENDING 7 JANUARY 2029

ALAIN-PHILIPPE DURAND
University of Arizona, Tucson

MAGANA KABUGI
University of North Carolina, Greensboro

MIRIAM WALLACE
University of Illinois, Springfield

Trustees of Invested Funds

MARISA GALVEZ
TINA LU

WILLIAM H. JANEWAY
(Managing Trustee)
New York, New York

DOMNA C. STANTON
New York, New York

CATHARINE R. STIMPSON
New York, New York

PMLA

PUBLICATIONS OF
THE MODERN LANGUAGE ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA

[Published five times a year]

Available online at *JSTOR* and *Cambridge Core*;
indexed in the *MLA International Bibliography*.



Editor

BRENT HAYES EDWARDS
Columbia University

Senior Director of Operational Strategy
ANGELA GIBSON

Senior Advertising Manager and
Submissions Associate
ANNABEL SCHNEIDER

Associate Director of Periodical Publications
SARA PASTEL

Editorial Assistant
EMILY KAUFMAN

Associate Editors
ANNE FREELAND
JOHN D. GOLBACH
JOSEPH WALLACE

PMLA (ISSN 0030-8129) is published five times a year, in January, March, May, September, and October, by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, and the Modern Language Association of America. Membership in the association is open to persons who are professionally interested in the modern languages and literatures. Information about annual dues, which include subscription to *PMLA*, is available at www.mla.org/Membership/About-Membership. Membership applications are available on request and at www.mla.org/Membership/Join-the-MLA.

For libraries and other institutions, a subscription in 2025 to the print or electronic format of *PMLA* can be purchased through a Cambridge University Press library sales representative. Subscriptions include online access to the 2002–24 volumes. Single copies of issues for the current year and the previous one are also available for purchase. Claims for undelivered issues will be honored if they are received within six months of the publication date; thereafter the single-issue price will be charged. In the Americas, write to subscriptions_newyork@cambridge.org. In all other parts of the world, write to journals@cambridge.org.

The MLA publication and editorial offices are located at 85 Broad Street, New York, NY 10004 (646 576-5000; pmlasubmissions@mla.org).

All communications concerning membership should be sent to Member and Administrative Services, MLA, 85 Broad Street, New York, NY 10004 (646 576-5151; membership@mla.org).

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY, and at additional mailing offices.

© 2025 Published by Cambridge University Press on behalf of Modern Language Association of America. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America. MLA and the MODERN LANGUAGE ASSOCIATION are trademarks owned by the Modern Language Association of America.

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 12-32040.

United States Postal Service Number 449-660.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *PMLA*, Member and Administrative Services, MLA, 85 Broad Street, New York, NY 10004.

Contents

MAY 2025

- 379 Submitting Manuscripts to *PMLA*
 379 Forthcoming in *PMLA*
 380 Features in *PMLA*
 383 Guest Column—Unfinished Business: Reckoning with Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture
 DONNA LANDRY, JAMES MULHOLLAND, AND CHARLOTTE SUSSMAN

- 391 The Persons of the Play: Falstaff and the Thickening of Dramatic Character
 ALLISON K. DEUTERMANN
 406 Diasporic World Literature: *The Vale of Cedars* in the Global Haskalah
 LITAL LEVY
 428 Life with a Cut: Historical Time and the Mediation of Coloniality in Francisco Balagtas's *Florante at Laura* and Lope K. Santos's *Banaag at Sikat*
 CHRIS CAÑETE RODRIGUEZ KELLY
 443 Phillis Wheatley's Georgics of Repair
 KATARINA O'BRIAIN
 460 The Chairman's Voice: Revolutionary Classicism and Lyric Ventriloquism in Maoist China
 ZHIYI YANG

LITTLE-KNOWN DOCUMENTS

- 476 "The Greek-Egyptian Poet Cavafy" and "Meeting with Marinetti"
 FILIPPO TOMMASO MARINETTI AND ATANASIO CATRARO
 INTRODUCTION BY NICOLETTA ASCIUTO; TRANSLATIONS BY ASCIUTO AND STEPHEN MINTA

THEORIES AND METHODOLOGIES

On Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture

- 485 In the Thickets: Stuart Hall in 1983
 NICK BEECH
 492 Theory Camp versus Commie Camp
 ANDY HINES
 499 The Infinite Articulation: Althusser, Balibar, and the Crisis of Marxism
 GAVIN WALKER

Editorial Board

- HOLLY CROCKER, 2026
Boston College
 ANNABEL L. KIM, 2026
Harvard University
 CHARLES W. MAHONEY, 2025
University of Connecticut, Storrs
 WILLIAM J. MAXWELL, 2026
Washington University in St. Louis
 JUAN G. RAMOS, 2025
College of the Holy Cross
 JONATHAN STONE, 2025
Franklin and Marshall College

Advisory Committee

- REMY ATTIG, 2026
Bowling Green State University
 GEOFFREY BAKER, 2027
Yale-NUS College
 SARAH BALKIN, 2027
University of Melbourne
 BARBARA BLACK, 2025
Skidmore College
 KAREN BRITLAND, 2027
University of Wisconsin, Madison
 MARK STEPHEN BYRON, 2025
University of Sydney
 CHRISTOPHER CANNON, 2027
Johns Hopkins University, MD
 LOGAN CONNORS, 2026
University of Miami
 CAROLYN DEVER, 2027
Dartmouth College
 CHRISTOPHER DUNN, 2025
Tulane University
 YASSER ELHARIRY, 2027
Dartmouth College
 JACOB EMERY, 2025
Indiana University, Bloomington
 BRIGITTE FIELDER, 2027
University of Wisconsin, Madison
 HANNAH FREED-THALL, 2027
New York University
 VERONIKA FUECHTNER, 2025
Dartmouth College
 VERÓNICA GARIBOTTO, 2026
University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill
 LEIGH GILMORE, 2026
Ohio State University, Columbus
 JENNIFER CAROLINA GÓMEZ MENJÍVAR, 2026
University of North Texas
 MARISSA GREENBERG, 2027
University of New Mexico, Albuquerque
 JULIAN DANIEL GUTIERREZ-ALBILLA, 2026
University of Southern California
 STEFAN HELGESSON, 2027
Stockholm University

(continued)

Advisory Committee (continued)

MAY 2025

JANE HIDDLESTON, 2027
University of Oxford

DEBORAH H. HOLDSTEIN, 2026
Columbia College, IL

SERENELLA IOVINO, 2025
University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill

JAVIER IRIGOYEN-GARCIA, 2026
University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign

PRITI JOSHI, 2026
University of Puget Sound

ERIC KEENAGHAN, 2027
University at Albany, State University of New York

STEPHEN KNADLER, 2027
Spelman College

BENJAMIN KOHLMANN, 2027
University of Regensburg

PETER LEMAN, 2027
Brigham Young University, UT

LAURA LOMAS, 2027
Rutgers University, Newark

DANA LUCIANO, 2025
Rutgers University, New Brunswick

AYMAN MOHAMED, 2026
Michigan State University

BARBARA NAGEL, 2025
Princeton University

JOHN F. O'BRIEN, 2025
University of Virginia

YOUNG KYUN OH, 2027
Arizona State University, Tempe

SERPIL OPPERMAN, 2027
Cappadocia University

LEAH ORR, 2027
University of Louisiana, Lafayette

ANDREW C. PARKER, 2026
Rutgers University, New Brunswick

VINCENT PECORA, 2025
University of Utah

SARAH RIVETT, 2025
Princeton University

RICHARD T. RODRÍGUEZ, 2025
University of California, Riverside

MICHAEL SAWYER, 2026
University of Pittsburgh

AKSHYA SAXENA, 2026
Vanderbilt University

CATHY SCHLUND-VIALS, 2025
University of Texas, Austin

YASMIN SOLOMONESCU, 2027
University of Notre Dame

ANNA R. ZIAJKA STANTON, 2027
Penn State University, University Park

RICHARD A. STRIER, 2026
University of Chicago

M. REMI YERGEAU, 2026
Carleton University

- 507 **African Marxism, Jean Franco, and South-South Studies**
SARAH M. QUESADA
- 514 **Pearl Diving without Guarantees: Heresy and Salvage Work in the Black Atlantic**
IDA DANEWID
- 520 **Marxism, Cultural Studies, and the Rise of Indigenous Studies**
ROBBIE RICHARDSON
- 526 **Marxist Feminism in Flight**
LISA L. MOORE
- 533 **Negative Totalization**
RONJAUNEE CHATTERJEE
- 540 **Henri Lefebvre's (Every)Day Care**
LILITH TODD
- 547 **"Del Otro Lado": Latinx, Latin American, Caribbean, and Feminist Contributions to Cultural Studies**
LAURA LOMAS
- 555 **Totality, Revisited**
CRYSTAL BARTOLOVICH
- 562 **The Slogan and the Map**
JONATHAN FLATLEY
- 569 **The "Lost Cause" of Cultural Studies: Laclau after Hall**
P. KHALIL SAUCIER AND TRYON P. WOODS
- 576 **To Speak from a Place Which Is Moving: Black Diasporas, African Migrations, and the Ongoing Importance of Stuart Hall**
MADELINE JAYE BASS
- 583 **In Memoriam**

Index of Advertisers

Submitting Manuscripts to *PMLA*

Editorial Policy for Essays

PMLA welcomes essays of interest to those concerned with the study of language and literature. As the publication of a large and heterogeneous association, the journal is receptive to a variety of topics, whether general or specific, and to all scholarly methods and theoretical perspectives. The ideal *PMLA* essay exemplifies the best of its kind, whatever the kind; addresses a significant problem; draws out clearly the implications of its findings; and engages the attention of its audience through a concise, readable presentation.

Eligibility

To be eligible for review, manuscripts must meet the following requirements:

MLA membership. Authors must be members of the MLA. (For a collaboratively written essay to be eligible for review, all coauthors must be members of the MLA.) Following the guidelines established by the journal's publishing partner, Cambridge University Press, AI tools cannot be considered authors of works submitted to the journal.

Author anonymity. Authors should not refer to themselves in the first person in the submitted text or notes if such references would identify them; any necessary references to the author's previous work, for example, should be in the third person.

Word length. Articles must be between 6,000 and 9,000 words. The word count includes discursive notes but excludes works-cited lists and translations.

Originality. Articles cannot have been previously published in any language. (Uploading the submitted version of the article to an institutional repository does not count as previous publication.) Authors must fully cite in the manuscript, at submission, their use of all content (whether text, images, data, or other) created by an AI tool.

Simultaneous submission. Articles cannot be under consideration by other journals or publishers. An article found to have been simultaneously submitted elsewhere will not be published in *PMLA* even if it has already been accepted for publication by the editorial board. The MLA reserves the right not to consider submissions from authors who already have a submission under review with the journal, as well as the right to desk-reject submissions sent by the same author within a year of a previous submission to the journal.

Language. Manuscripts in languages other than English must be accompanied by a detailed summary in English (generally of 1,000 to 1,500 words) and must be translated into English if they are recommended to the editorial board. Translations should accompany all quotations in languages other than English.

Scope. *PMLA* does not publish book reviews or new works of fiction. Submissions should be broadly of interest to those concerned with the study of language and literature.

Forthcoming in *PMLA*

IN THE OCTOBER ISSUE

MATTHEW SMITH. "Breath Piece: On Paul Celan and John Coltrane"

ETHAN PLAUE. "The Patent Form: Norbert Rillieux, Solomon Northup, and the Production of Means in the Atlantic World"

JAMES DRANEY. "The Creep's Dilemma: Novel Privacy in the Age of Surveillance Capitalism"

PATRICK KINDIG. "Cruising as Contact (at a Distance)"

ESTHER YU. "First-Person Prose Narration and William Baldwin's *Beware the Cat*"

Little-Known Documents

Liberty Hyde Bailey. *Outlook*. Introduction by John Linstrom

Theories and Methodologies

Race, Racialization, and Whiteness before and after The Invention of Race

Coordinated by Nahir Otaño Gracia and Tiffany N. Florvil. Essays by Alexander Ponomareff, Otaño Gracia, Belinda Deneen Wallace and Kathy L. Powers, Adrienne N. Merritt, Amrita Dhar, Sunnie Rucker-Chang, Angelica Pesarini and Justin Randolph Thompson, Florvil, and Nicholas R. Jones; response by Geraldine Heng

Forthcoming in *PMLA*

IN OTHER ISSUES

- DOUG BATTERSBY. "Free Indirect Style in the English Novel: Literary History and Critical Pleasure"
- ELIZABETH BLAKE. "Gourmet, Sodomite, Woman: Djuna Barnes's Multihyphenate Doctor"
- COREY BYRNES. "Of Beasts and Animals; or, The 'Chinese' Ends of the Post-human"
- BEN DAVIES. "Critical Reading and the Fantasy of Method"
- PATRICK EICHHOLZ. "The Latent Baroque in English Literary History"
- MARIANNA HAGLER. "Reading in Reverie: Identifying Anne Carson's Gertrude Stein"
- RAYE HENDRIX. "Deaf Spectacle: Rupture and Resistance in Ilya Kaminsky's *Deaf Republic*"
- LAUREN HORST. "Fantasies of Limitless Growth: Ngũgĩ wa Thiong'o and the Magical Thinking of Sustainable Development"
- BENJAMIN HULETT. "Portage Epistemologies: Wabanaki Perceptual Grammar in Thoreau's Late Natural Histories"
- CAJETAN IHEKA. "Poetics for the City: Africa, Extraction, and the Worliding of Literature"
- WEI LIU. "'Revisioning' the Caribbean Mother: Kamau Brathwaite, Lorna Goodison, and Pathways toward a Located Literariness"
- ADAM MAHLER. "Sailing the Franco-Portuguese Seas in Colonial Macau: A Blue Poetics of Citation in Camilo Pessanha's *Clepsydra*"
- JUSTIN PARKS. "At the Expense of Energy: John Ashbery's 'The Skaters' and the Postwar Poetics of Entropy"
- JACOB ROMANOW. "Provincializing Victorian Studies: A Native's *Marita* among Literary Traditions"
- DEENA RYMHS. "Kin Objects: Repurposing as Relational Practice in Leanne Simpson's *Noopiming*"
- GERÓNIMO SARMIENTO CRUZ. "Borderlands Tropologies: (Re)Production in Jimmy Santiago Baca and Tommy Pico"

(continued)

Quality. *PMLA* publishes the best of its kind. Works that demonstrate egregious signs of poor quality (e.g., lack of scholarly apparatus when relevant, evidence of extreme carelessness in preparation) cannot be sent for review.

Submission Procedures

MLA style. Manuscripts should follow MLA style as set out in the most recent edition of the *MLA Handbook*. The MLA urges its contributors to be sensitive to the social implications of language and to seek wording free of discriminatory overtones.

Cover sheet. Authors' names should not appear on manuscripts; instead, a cover sheet, with the author's name and address and the title of the article, should accompany each manuscript.

Permissions. If the contribution includes any materials (e.g., quotations that exceed fair use, illustrations, charts, other graphics) that have been taken from another source, the author must obtain written permission to reproduce them in print and electronic formats.

Please submit manuscripts (as *Word* files) through *PMLA*'s ScholarOne site (mc.manuscriptcentral.com/pmla).

Review Process

Each article submitted and eligible for peer review is sent to at least two reviewers. Articles recommended by these readers are then sent to the members of the editorial board, who meet periodically with the editor to make final decisions. Until a final decision is reached, the author's name is not made known to readers, to members of the editorial board, or to the editor. For detailed information on the review process for submitted essays, please send an inquiry to pmlasubmissions@mila.org.

Features in *PMLA*

Criticism in Translation

MLA members are invited to submit to the *PMLA* Editorial Board proposals for translations. Articles, as well as chapters or sections of books that can function as independent units, will be considered. The originals may be in any language. Two types of proposals are welcome: (1) significant scholarship from earlier periods that has not lost its forcefulness and whose retrieval in English in *PMLA* would be a noteworthy event for a broad body of readers and (2) contemporary work of sufficient weight and potential influence to merit the attention of the field as a whole.

A member who wishes to make a proposal should first ascertain that no previous English translation exists. The proposer should then submit the following materials through PMLA's ScholarOne site (mc.manuscriptcentral.com/pmla): (1) a photocopy of the original essay, (2) an extended summary of the entire essay in English, (3) an introductory statement of approximately 2,500 words, prepared in accordance with MLA style and submitted as a *Word* file, that will be published with the essay if the essay is accepted, (4) information on the copyright status of the original (if the translation is accepted for publication, the proposer will be responsible for obtaining permission to print it). In addition, a 1,000-word sample of the translation should be submitted (as a *Word* file). The proposer may either serve as translator of the essay or designate a translator (who must also be an MLA member).

The translated essays should normally not exceed PMLA's 9,000-word limit. The editorial board will approve or decline the proposals and evaluate the quality of the translations.

Little-Known Documents

MLA members are invited to submit to the PMLA Editorial Board proposals regarding little-known documentary material that merits the attention of a broad range of readers. Consideration will be given to archival data from any period and in any language that do not exceed PMLA's 9,000-word limit.

A member who wishes to make a proposal should send submit the following material through PMLA's ScholarOne site (mc.manuscriptcentral.com/pmla): (1) a photocopy of the document, (2) an extended summary of the document in English, (3) an introductory statement of approximately 2,500 words, prepared in accordance with MLA style and submitted as a *Word* file, that will be published with the document if it is accepted, (4) information on the copyright status of the original (if the document is accepted for publication, the proposer will be responsible for obtaining permission to print it). In addition, if the document is not in English, the proposal should include a 1,000-word sample of the translation. The proposer may either serve as translator of the document or designate a translator (who must also be an MLA member). The editorial board will approve or decline the proposals and evaluate the quality of the translations, if applicable.

Special Issues

From time to time the PMLA Editorial Board invites essays on special topics designed to attract a wide readership. These groupings allow dialogue among essays and encourage in-depth investigation of the selected subjects. Special issues appear about once every three years and are composed primarily of full-length essays that go through the regular PMLA review process; in

Forthcoming in PMLA (continued)

- JORDAN STEIN. "Overreading *Little Women*"
 EMILY STEINLIGHT. "Victorian Studies and the American State"
 LLOYD KEVIN SY. "Nedawi Learns to Play: Ludic Indigeneity and the Plum-Stone Game"
 GRANT WIEDENFELD. "The Paragraph in Literary Aesthetics: Examples from Flaubert's *Bouvard and Pécuchet*"
 JOHN YARGO. "Experiencing the Plantationocene in Aphra Behn's *Oroonoko*"

Little-Known Documents

- EDWARD KAMAU BRATHWAITE. "Andrew Salkey's *A Quality of Violence* and the Practice of 'Communal/Impersonal' Criticism." Introduction by René Kooiker
 RALPH ELLISON. "Remarks on the American Novel." Introduction by Tanya Clement
 "Manifesto to the Oppressed Peoples of America!!" Introduction and translation by Carlos Alonso Nugent
 CLAUDE MCKAY. "Group Life and Literature." Introduction by Jean-Christophe Cloutier
 LYNNE ANNE MUNSON. "Memorandum to Lynne V. Cheney on the 1991 MLA Annual Convention." Introduction by Mark Hlavacik
 RENE RICARD. "BASQUIAT: The Poems." Introduction by Paul Benzon
 WALLACE THURMAN. *God Sends Sunday*. Introduction by Sarah Gleeson-White

Criticism in Translation

- ABŪ AL-QĀSIM AL-SHĀBBĪ. "Poetic Imagination among the Arabs." Introduction and translation by Dima Nasser

addition, coordinators write an introduction to the topic and can commission up to two full-length essays and material for Theories and Methodologies and The Changing Profession (among other sections of the journal), to round out the submissions received through peer review.

Special Features

Each fall, the *PMLA* Editorial Board welcomes proposals for clusters of essays on a topic of wide interest, to appear in the following special features: Theories and Methodologies, which addresses a timely issue or recent work of scholarship, and The Changing Profession, which takes up new and emerging fields in the humanities. Please visit the MLA website for more details about proposing special features for the journal (www.mla.org/PMLA-Submissions).