

# THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

## Edited by

Salvatore Florio, *Coordinating Editor*

Rohan French

Silvio Ghilardi

Hans Halvorson

Simon Huttegger

Juliette Kennedy

Graham Leigh

Jon Litland

Marko Malink

Gil Sagi

**VOLUME 16 • NUMBER 2 • JUNE 2023 • ISSN 1755-0203**

Copyright © 2023 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.  
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.



PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.  
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL MEMBERS.

# ***THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC***

## ***Coordinating Editor***

Salvatore Florio

*Department of Philosophy, University of Birmingham*

and

*Department of Philosophy, Classics, History of Art and Ideas, University of Oslo*

## ***Editors***

Rohan French

*Department of Philosophy  
University of California, Davis*

Silvio Ghilardi

*Department of Mathematics  
Università degli Studi di Milano*

Hans Halvorson

*Department of Philosophy  
Princeton University*

Simon Huttegger

*Department of Logic and Philosophy  
of Science, University of California, Irvine*

Juliette Kennedy

*Department of Mathematics and Statistics  
University of Helsinki*

Graham Leigh

*Department of Philosophy, Linguistics, Theory of Science  
University of Gothenburg*

Jon Litland

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Texas at Austin*

Marko Malink

*Department of Philosophy  
New York University*

Gil Sagi

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Haifa*

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

A Note on Choice Principles in Second-Order Logic BENJAMIN SISKIND, PAOLO MANCOSU, AND STEWART SHAPIRO .....	339
Probabilistic Entailment on First Order Languages and Reasoning with Inconsistencies SOROUSH RAFIEE RAD .....	351
A Correctness Proof for Al-Barakāt's Logical Diagrams WILFRID HODGES .....	369
Self-Reference Upfront: A Study of Self-Referential Gödel Numberings BALTHASAR GRABMAYR AND ALBERT VISSER .....	385
Nonclassical truth with Classical Strength. A Proof-Theoretic Analysis of Compositional Truth Over HYPE MARTIN FISCHER, CARLO NICOLAI, AND PABLO DOPICO.....	425
Abstract Forms of Quantification in the Quantified Argument Calculus EDI PAVLOVIĆ AND NORBERT GRATZL .....	449
Rigour and Proof OLIVER TATTON-BROWN.....	480
Grzegorzczuk Points and Filters in Boolean Contact Algebras RAFAŁ GRUSZCZYŃSKI AND ANDRZEJ PIETRUSZCZAK .....	509
Conditional Logic is Complete for Convexity in the Plane JOHANNES MARTI.....	529
The Potential in Frege's Theorem WILL STAFFORD .....	553
Carnap's Problem for Modal Logic DENIS BONNAY AND DAG WESTERSTÅHL.....	578
The Semantic Foundations of Philosophical Analysis SAMUEL Z. ELGIN .....	603
Russellian Definite Description Theory—A Proof Theoretic Approach ANDRZEJ INDRZEJCZAK .....	624
Gödel's Theorem and Direct Self-Reference SAUL A. KRIPKE.....	650

**Subscription Information:** *Review of Symbolic Logic* (ISSN 1755-0203) is published quarterly by Cambridge University Press & Assessment for the Association for Symbolic Logic. Annual subscription rates for Volume 16 (2023): Institutional subscription rates, print and online: US \$1386.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £871.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, online only: US \$1135.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £735.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, print only: US \$1376.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £857.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, online only: US \$273.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £171.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, print only: US \$339.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £189.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription correspondence should be sent to: Cambridge University Press & Assessment, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, USA, for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press & Assessment, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to: **Association for Symbolic Logic, c/o Journals Customer Services Department, Cambridge University Press & Assessment, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, USA**, [USmemberservices@cambridge.org](mailto:USmemberservices@cambridge.org).

**Association for Symbolic Logic.** Individual Members of the Association for Symbolic Logic may receive a print subscription to *The Review of Symbolic Logic* as a benefit of membership. Requests for information, applications for membership, orders for back volumes, business correspondence, and notices and announcements for publication in the *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic* should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association: **ASL, Department of Mathematics, University of Connecticut, 341 Mansfield Road, U-1009, Storrs, CT 06269-1009, USA**. The email address of the Association's business office is [asl@uconn.edu](mailto:asl@uconn.edu). The ASL website is located at <http://www.aslonline.org>. Links from that site provide further information on the *Review* and on submitting papers for publication.

*Individual* membership in the Association is open to anyone interested in its work. Annual dues for members are US\$108, £82 sterling or €96 (\$54, £43 sterling or €50 for student, emeritus and unemployed members; see <http://aslonline.org/membership/individual-membership/> for more information, including conditions and privileges). Dues include subscriptions to the current volumes of the JOURNAL, the BULLETIN, and the REVIEW.

*Institutional* membership in the Association is available to any academic institution or department. Annual institutional membership dues for 2023 are US\$1200 (full) or \$790 (basic); privileges include choices of current subscriptions, back volumes, and student memberships. Requests for information, renewals of institutional membership, business correspondence, and notices or announcements for publication in the BULLETIN should be sent to **ASL, Department of Mathematics, University of Connecticut, 341 Mansfield Road, U-1009, Storrs, CT 06269-1009, USA**. The electronic mail address of the Association's business office [asl@uconn.edu](mailto:asl@uconn.edu). Requests for back issues should be sent to Cambridge University Press & Assessment, address above.

**Coordinating Editor:** Salvatore Florio, Department of Philosophy, University of Birmingham Edgbaston, Birmingham B15 2TT, UK. Email: [s.florio@bham.ac.uk](mailto:s.florio@bham.ac.uk).

**Copyright:** All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press & Assessment. Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.: Copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press & Assessment <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm); enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>

Copyright © The Association for Symbolic Logic, 2023