

GALANO, J. (1977) Treatment effectiveness as a function of client involvement in goal-setting and goal-planning. *Goal Attainment Review*, **3**, 17–32.  
 LA BARBERA, J., MARTIN, J. & DOZIER, E. (1982) Residential treatment of males: the influential role of parental attitude. *Journal of the American Academy of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry*, **21**, 286–290.  
 WELLS, P. G., MORRIS, A., JONES, R. M. & ALLEN, D. J. (1978) An adolescent unit assessed: A consumer survey. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, **132**, 300–308.

2. a) who decides the problems are sufficiently alleviated before the adolescent can be discharged?  
 b) How will that person/s know?  
 c) What is the earliest time the adolescent could be discharged?  
 . . . . . weeks
3. What would each party like to achieve before the next family meeting?  
 a) parents  
 b) adolescent  
 c) RAU staff  
 d) referrer
4. When should this agreement be re-negotiated?
5. After one year how will admission be judged a success and by whom?

**Appendix 1**

**AUDIT AGREEMENT BETWEEN FAMILY AND ADOLESCENT UNIT**

Name . . . . . Date . . . . .

1. a) Are there any problems requiring admission? If so what?  
 b) Does adolescent agree? If not please comment.

Signed by: Parent/s . . . . .  
 Unit case manager . . . . .  
 Adolescent . . . . .

*Psychiatric Bulletin* (1992), **16**, 693–695

**The journal clubs at St Edward’s Hospital – a ten year audit**

**From The Keele Rotation, North Staffordshire**

J. A. (TONY) HUTCHINSON, lately Senior Clinical Lecturer and Clinical Tutor; and  
 A. PURANIK, Senior Registrar, UMDS Scheme, South Western Hospital,  
 London SW9 9NU

During their period of training, trainee psychiatrists are usually involved in multiple educational activities. Clinical activities include case demonstrations at the bedside, ward rounds, and other multidisciplinary team meetings. Another group of activities, not directly clinical, include didactic teaching in the form of lectures, case presentations at conferences, seminars, audit and journal clubs.

On average, the time (in hours) spent in the latter activities per annum at Keele are lectures 60; seminars & other interactive teaching 60; case presentations 30; audit 15; and journal clubs 30.

This article deals with the last of these not directly clinical activities – journal clubs (JCs).

**Historical background**

There is very little recorded information relating to JCs and the views of Mark Linzer (1987; Linzer

*et al*, 1986) have, since the mid 1980s, been the beacon light. In his historical review of the journal club and medical education in the last 100 years he gives the results of his literature search: “The first ever record of Journal Clubs was by Cushing who described Osler’s first Journal Club in Montreal in 1875.” Much earlier than that was a reference to the term journal club in Stephen Paget’s work as reported by James Paget in the years 1835–1854 (Linzer, 1987). Since then journal clubs have been held regularly and it is hoped that this article will serve as an impetus for further research into this important activity.

The word “journal” comes from the Latin “diurnus” (dies = day) through Middle English and Old French (“jurnal”), Modern French (journal), Italian (“giornale”), which refers to either a periodical issued on a daily, fortnightly, monthly or yearly basis, or to a newspaper, a newsletter, or

any bookkeeping procedure. Mattingley (1966) concluded that journal clubs were "an important form of communication with the printed word, being the basic agent for distribution of a repository of knowledge".

### *What are the functions of a journal club?*

The prime purpose of Sir William Osler's journal club at McGill university was 'to make available articles whose purchase and distribution could ill be afforded for financial reasons' (Linzer, 1987). This principle still applies but in addition this forum seems ideal for updating both trainees and experienced staff on issues of importance; a group which aims critically to analyse an article also serves to maintain interest and, if held regularly, offers an occasion for social exchange. It must be mentioned that initially journal clubs started as a semi-social occasion with the discussion of the article usually followed by refreshments.

### *Experience in North Staffordshire*

Our knowledge of the Cheddleton story begins in the 1950s when a group of enthusiastic consultants and junior doctors met after hours at the hospital and later at the house of one of the consultants. The meetings were held in the evening, on a regular basis, to discuss articles of interest. Following the appointment of Professor Sir William Trethowan to the Chair of Psychiatry in the University of Birmingham in 1963 and the formalisation of teaching in the region under the Clinical Tutor Scheme, meetings began to be held in hospital time. Then the intention was to invite all interested medical, psychology, and social work graduates working in the Mental Health Service in North Staffordshire at St Edward's Hospital, City General Hospital, and Stallington Hospital to attend and present journal articles. Gradually, 12.30 p.m. on Mondays during term-time at St Edward's Hospital became the rule and has remained so now for over 20 years.

A trigger for this study, a form of audit, was a recent *Lancet* Editorial (1989). The raw material was derived from the records of the senior author, and as a result, it was possible to audit ten years of journal club meetings at St Edward's Hospital, Cheddleton.

### *Format*

The method followed was similar to the Montefiore Medical Centre method (Inui, 1981): the club met once a week during term time for about an hour. Usually one article, (sometimes more than one) was chosen by a consultant or senior registrar and a

TABLE I  
*Which journals were used?*

Rank order	Name of journal	Times used	(%)
1	<i>British Journal of Psychiatry</i>	152	48.3
2	<i>British Journal of Hospital Medicine</i>	26	7.9
3	<i>British Medical Journal</i>	16	5.1
4	<i>Journal of Clin. Psychology &amp; Psychiatry</i>	14	4.4
5	<i>Psychological Medicine</i>	12	3.8

trainee would be given a week to prepare his presentation – the latter preceded by lunch-time refreshments. Scrutiny of the attendance register revealed a typical attendance figure of 10–12 including 3–4 consultant psychiatrists, 5–6 psychiatric trainees, 1–3 psychologists and an occasional medical student on rotation from Birmingham University.

Meetings were held in the Psychiatric Library. Chairs were grouped closely around the projection equipment in a closely-packed U-shaped formation creating an informal environment. Normally, the consultant who selected the article for presentation made some introductory remarks before the trainee's presentation, which he informally 'chaired'. Discussion for about 20 minutes followed with closing remarks by the chairman and/or clinical tutor.

The clinical tutor had overall responsibility for the organisation of the journal clubs.

### *Findings*

The duration of the audit was 10 years; the number of journal clubs surveyed was 315; and the number of journals used was 55 (Table I). While the above were the top five of the 55 journals used, nine other journals were used three or more times, nine were used twice and it is of interest that 33 made their debut but failed to score after that! (The full classified list is available from the authors).

### *What topics were discussed?*

The topics covered could easily form part of a major psychiatric textbook and of interest is the finding that personality and personality disorders were the least discussed. Among the 20 topics that were covered, organic psychiatry, psychotherapy, child psychiatry, and neurotic disorders formed the top four in rank order.

The top ten list of topics, in rank order and with total number of times discussed is given in Table II.

TABLE II

Rank order	Topic	Frequency of use	(%)
1	Organic, epilepsy, dementia	36	11.4
2	Treatment – psychotherapy	33	10.5
3	Child & adolescent psychiatry	26	8.3
4	Neurotic disorders	25	7.9
5	Mental handicap	24	7.6
6	Legal & forensic psychiatry	24	7.6
7	Diagnosis, epidemiology, classification	17	5.4
8	Schizophrenia	16	5.1
9	Drug treatments	16	5.1
10	Biological sciences	14	4.4

### Comments

This study revealed that the journal clubs at St Edward's Hospital, Cheddleton, occurred at remarkably regular intervals and that there was a constant attendance of consultants, trainees and other mental health graduates. A broad range of topics were dealt with but there was some suggestion that general psychiatry was discussed more than the sub-specialties. It was also noted that of the 55 journals used, only 18 were found to be available in the Library of the Royal College of Psychiatrists.

The journals used reflected local availability as 33 of the 55 were found to be available in and around North Staffordshire. Of 55 journals used, 36 (65.5%) were British as were 272 (86.3%) of 315 of the papers read. Of British journals 16 (44.4%) were in general psychiatry and 20 (55.6%) specialist. *The British Journal of Psychiatry* was used in almost half of all meetings. The question arises as to whether this should be an in-house journal and ideally not used in journal club meetings as it should be an aid to standard textbooks and trainees should be exposed to views and reviews from around the world in order to gain a global perspective of their subject. In fact, although 19 (34.5%) non-British journals were used, only 43 (13.7%) papers from them were read.

Why only the *British Journal of Psychiatry* was used in such a high proportion of meetings needs to be interpreted. One possibility is that it is easily available to consultants choosing articles: another might be that it contains a great variety of types of article, or perhaps it is thought to be appropriate to the level of the expertise required of the trainee. Consultants may have wished to draw trainees' attention to this journal as there is still a relatively low rate of inceptorship locally.

The reasons for the choice of articles were not entirely clear. It seems an article may be selected because it presents a major review of a confusing subject; is topical; seems to meet course require-

ments; represents a major advance in psychiatry; was selected by the author; or is of special interest to the selector.

In general it was felt that the success of the journal club at St Edward's Hospital has depended on a variety of factors.

- The meetings have taken place on a very regular basis during the University term, always on Monday, at 12.30 p.m., usually in the same room, normally preceded by simple lunch
- A very high proportion of the North Staffordshire psychiatric consultants have participated and attended meetings at which their chosen articles were presented: the clinical tutor attended regularly.
- The duration of meetings has not exceeded one hour (usually 50 minutes) so that members attending could be sure of getting away in time for afternoon commitments.
- The meetings have provided a useful point of contact between clinical colleagues who may be dispersed over a wide geographical area in the course of their work.

### Suggestions

Some suggestions may be offered regarding the organisation of journal clubs. Greater uniformity should auger well for a rounded traineeship; the relevance of journal clubs to Membership examinations needs to be considered but GP trainees may have different needs. The College publishes no guidelines relating to journal clubs. Linzer was the pioneer in evaluation of the efficiency and use of journal clubs; since then the American literature shows that trainees' reading habits are greatly influenced by the journal club experience (Linzer *et al*, 1986). However there has not been any such study in Britain. The need for further evaluation of the usefulness of journal clubs, and how this can be optimised would be welcome.

We hope to present further implications of this audit in a future article.

### References

- INUI, T. S. (1981) Critical reading seminars for medical residents. *Medical Care*, **19**, 122–124.
- Lancet* (Editorial, 18 March 1989), 594.
- LINZER, M. (1987) The journal club and medical education: over 100 years of unrecorded history. *Postgraduate Medical Education*, **63**, 475–478.
- , MERCANDO, A. & HUBART, K. H. (1986) Role of a journal club in residency training. *Journal of Medical Education*, **61**, 471–473.
- MATTINGLEY, D. (1966) Journal clubs. *Postgraduate Medical Journal*, **42**, 120–121.

A full list of references is available on request to the authors.