

ORDINATION, CANON LAW AND PNEUMATOLOGY: VALIDITY AND VITALITY IN ANGLICAN-ROMAN CATHOLIC DIALOGUE

NORMAN DOE

Director of the Centre for Law and Religion, Cardiff University¹

*The subject of the sixth meeting of the Colloquium of Anglican and Roman Catholic Canon Lawyers in Rome 2005 was the Roman Catholic position that Anglican orders are invalid. The meeting employed a canonical framework to explore the status and terms of *Apostolicae curae* (1896) and the modern applicability of the canonical issues of intent, matter, form, and minister to the question of Anglican orders. The meeting did not examine pneumatological aspects of ordination. This article seeks to set alongside each other the ritual elements of the liturgy for the ordination of priests in both the Anglican and Roman Catholic Churches in their respective canonical contexts. It proposes the value of a pneumatological approach for possible Roman Catholic recognition of the vitality of Anglican orders. A draft of this paper was presented to the seventh meeting of the Colloquium of Anglican and Roman Catholic Canon Lawyers in Johannesburg in February 2006, where it was favourably received.²*

INTRODUCTION

The Colloquium of Anglican and Roman Catholic Canon Lawyers was established (in Rome, 1999) to explore ways in which their respective laws enable or disable greater visible unity between the two communions. At its sixth meeting (Rome, April 2005),³ the Colloquium addressed the Roman Catholic position that Anglican orders are invalid, seeking to understand this position and discuss (in a preliminary fashion) ways to overcome it.⁴ The meeting was (in hindsight) exclusively focused on, conditioned by, and proposed possible avenues for agreement on, the issues of intent, matter, form, and minister. Pneumatological aspects of ordination were

¹ I am indebted to Myra Blyth, Regents Park College, Oxford, to the graduates of the LL.M. in Canon Law, meeting at Magdalen College, Oxford, in September 2005, and to my colleagues on the Colloquium of Anglican and Roman Catholic Canon Lawyers for their comments on drafts of this study. An earlier version of this paper was submitted on the M.Th. in Applied Theology at Oxford University.

² A brief report of the Seventh Colloquium appears at p 484 of this Issue.

³ Present were also liturgists, and staff from the International Anglican-Roman Catholic Commission for Unity and Mission, and the Pontifical Council for Promoting Christian Unity.

⁴ The Colloquium returned to the subject at Johannesburg in February 2006: see below.

neither raised nor explored. This study, therefore, examines each ritual element of the liturgy for presbyteral ordination, and compares what the Anglican and Roman Catholic Churches (alongside, briefly, other selected Churches) understand happens spiritually in their own ordinations. It also proposes the usefulness of understandings of the work of the Holy Spirit in ordination (in energising it) for Anglican-Roman Catholic dialogue on Anglican orders.

ANGLICAN ORDERS IN ANGLICAN-ROMAN CATHOLIC RELATIONS

For the Roman Catholic Church the sacraments are ‘the actions of Christ and the Church’; requirements for their valid administration are determined by the supreme authority of the Church.⁵ A valid sacrament is one capable of producing the effects it is ordered to produce. The sacrament of holy orders is valid if it possesses the requisite (i) *matter* (action), the bishop’s imposition of hands on the candidate’s head; and (ii) *form* (words), the bishop’s consecratory prayer ‘asking God for the outpouring of the Holy Spirit and his gifts proper to the ministry’ received; (iii) its *minister* is a validly ordained bishop: since ordination is ‘the sacrament of the apostolic ministry, it is for the bishops as successors of the apostles to hand on the “gift of the Spirit”’ (ie those ‘in the “apostolic line”’ ‘validly confer ... the sacrament’); (iv) its *recipient* must freely consent and ‘Only a baptized man (*vir*) validly receives sacred ordination’; (v) *intention*: the bishop and recipient must intend what the Church intends.⁶ Rome recognises pneumatological dimensions of Roman orders,⁷ but official texts do not seem to relate these to the requisites of validity. It is submitted here that these requisites actually concern the action of the Church (touching, asking, intending etc); a pneumatology of ordination represents the action of Christ operative in the actions of the Church: the Holy Spirit animates ordination.

The requirements for validity, and pneumatology of ordination, have not officially and explicitly been applied by Rome to the question of Anglican orders. Pope Leo XIII in *Apostolicae curae* (1896), treating the Church of England 1550-2 and 1662 ordinals, held Anglican ordinations defective for lack of form, minister and intention. The 1550-2 Ordinal words ‘Receive the Holy Ghost’ did not ‘in the least definitely express the sacred Order of Priesthood (*sacerdotium*) or its grace and power’. The 1662 addition of

⁵ That is: the pope or college of bishops: Code of Canon Law 1983, Canons 840, 841.

⁶ *Catechism of the Catholic Church* (London, 1994), 1573-1576; Code of Canon Law 1983, Canons 1009, 1012, 1024-1026; J A Coriden, T J Green, D E Heintschel (eds), *Code of Canon Law: Text and Commentary* (New York, 1985) 724: if unfree, ‘invalidity ... arises’; J Beal, J A Coriden, and T J Green (eds), *New Commentary on the Code of Canon Law* (New York, 2000) 1202.

⁷ *Directory on the Ministry and Life of Priests*, issued by the Congregation for the Clergy 31 March 1994 (Vatican, 1994), 8. At ordination a priest receives ‘the seal of the Holy Spirit which has marked him ... always to be the minister of Christ and the Church’: he never loses ‘the presence and ... power’ of the Spirit.

'... for the office and work of a priest' 'shows ... Anglicans themselves perceived that the first form was defective'; also, this addition came a century too late: 'as the Hierarchy had become extinct, there remained no power of ordaining'. Nor did the 1662 Ordinal express the sacerdotal nature of priesthood. Moreover, the defect in form of the Ordinals, failing to effect 'the reality which Christ instituted', produced lack of requisite intention, as the authors' intent was 'destructive of the sacrament', 'rejecting what the Church does'. Thus: 'ordinations carried out according to the Anglican rite have been, and are, absolutely null and utterly void'.⁸

In 1998 Cardinal Ratzinger understood *Apostolicae curae* to be teaching historically related to divine revelation and therefore definitive.⁹ Nevertheless, Rome may ordain Anglican priests conditionally,¹⁰ due to the involvement, 'in some Anglican episcopal ordinations', of 'validly ordained' Old Catholic bishops; then, there may be a 'prudent doubt' as to ordinations of individual Anglican ministers received 'in this line of succession'.¹¹ Moreover, recently Cardinal Kasper proposed viewing apostolic succession not as 'an individual historical chain' but 'a collegial membership'; Anglican orders may be an 'uninterrupted sharing' in 'the same apostolic faith and ... mission'; laying-on of hands is 'a sign of co-optation in [this] *collegium*'.¹²

As Rome offers no explicit pneumatology of Anglican ordinations, so the Anglican Roman Catholic International Commission (ARCIC) does not treat the validity of Anglican orders; but it recommends a 'reappraisal' of *Apostolicae curae* and provides a 'new context' for this: (1) ordained ministries are 'the work' of and 'used by the Holy Spirit' for leadership and unity; (2) the vocation of priests is from Christ, and 'their qualification' for ministry 'the gift of the Spirit'; (3) at ordination 'the gift of God is bestowed upon the ministers, with the promise of divine grace for their work and ... sanctification'; the ministry of Christ is 'a model for their own; and the Spirit seals those ... he has chosen and consecrated'; (4) imposition of hands is 'the outward sign' of the gift; episcopal participation ensures continuity with the apostolic Church and 'the original apostolic ministry';

⁸ Paras. 25-36. The English archbishops refuted this (1897); see generally E W Franklin (ed), *Anglican Orders: Essays on the Centenary of Apostolicae Curae: 1896-1996* (London, 1996).

⁹ J Ratzinger, commentary on the apostolic letter *Motu proprio* (18 May 1998) of Pope John Paul II *Ad tuendam fidem* (29 June 1998); see also J Conn, 'Valid sacraments in Roman Catholic canon law', unpublished paper, Sixth Colloquium of Roman Catholic and Anglican Canon Lawyers (April 2005). See also F Clark, *Anglican Orders and the Doctrine of Intention* (London, 1956) 9: the 'practical infallibility' of the position on Anglican orders.

¹⁰ Code of Canon Law 1983, Canon 845 §2: conditional ordination in cases of 'prudent doubt' as to validity.

¹¹ Cardinal Basil Hume, public statement (26 April 1994) following the conditional ordination of Dr Graham Leonard on 23 April 1994; Conn, 11.

¹² W Kasper, 'May they all be one? But how? A vision of Christian unity for a new generation', address by the President of the Pontifical Council for Christian Unity given at the Conference of the Society for Ecumenical Studies at St Albans, England, *Tablet* (24 May 2003).

(5) priestly ministry has 'a particular sacramental relationship with Christ the High Priest', and 'belongs to another realm of the gifts of the Spirit'; the priest is 'an authoritative representative of Christ'; (6) a sacramental rite ('a visible sign through which the grace of God is given by the Holy Spirit'), 'those ordained by prayer and the laying on of hands receive their ministry from Christ through those designated in the Church to hand it on'. In sum, ARCIC's pneumatology proposes: 'the Holy Spirit commissions through ordination' and 'gives to each person power to fulfil his particular function'.¹³

PNEUMATIC ACTIVITY IN ORDINATION

A key aspect of pneumatology¹⁴ is the interaction of the work of the Holy Spirit, the mysterious invisible power, energy or breath of God which guides, directs and rules,¹⁵ and the human spirit (or soul),¹⁶ breathed into humankind at creation (Gen 2 : 7), the entire human person created in the image of God, and animated as 'a temple of the Spirit' (1 Cor 6 : 19-20).¹⁷ The Holy Spirit is 'poured out' on, 'distributed' or 'given' to, and 'dwells' in,¹⁸ believers; they 'receive', 'have', or are 'filled' with the Holy Spirit, so they live, walk and serve 'in the Spirit'.¹⁹ This part of the study aims to identify these and other actions of the Holy Spirit, and of the spirit of the faithful, as portrayed in each of the respective ritual elements of Anglican and Roman ordination services (gathering etc).²⁰ As (broadly) with Rome, in Anglicanism, no-one receives holy orders unless called, tried, examined and admitted according to the rite of ordination.²¹ So too

¹³ ARCIC I, *The Final Report: Ministry and Ordination* (1982), Statement (1973) 16,17; *Authority in the Church I*, Statement (1976) 5; (1981) 5. The Official Roman Catholic Response seeks clarification on sacramentality of orders and apostolic succession: C Hill and E Yarnold (eds), *Anglicans and Roman Catholics: The Search for Unity* (London, 1994) 156.

¹⁴ Pneumatology: 'the theology of the Holy Spirit': J A Komonchak, M Collins, and D A Lane (eds), *The New Dictionary of Theology* (Dublin, 1987) 488; 'a way of talking about God active in the world and in our experience': A E McGrath (ed), *The Blackwell Encyclopaedia of Modern Christian Thought* (Oxford, 1993) 448.

¹⁵ N Lossky, J M Bonino, J Pobee, T F Stransky, G Wainwright, and P Webb (eds), *Dictionary of the Ecumenical Movement* (hereafter Lossky) (WCC, Geneva, 2002) 534: the Spirit is 'the divine power working in the church'; A Schmemmann, *Of Water and the Spirit* (St Vladimir Seminary Press, New York, 1976) 107.

¹⁶ J Macquarrie, *Paths in Spirituality* (2nd edn., London, 1992) 40-21,153: spirituality involves 'the perfecting of personal being'.

¹⁷ *Gaudium et spes*, Vatican II, Pastoral Constitution (1966) 14.1; *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 362.

¹⁸ Eg Acts 2 : 17f; 10 : 45; 2 Cor 1 : 22; Heb 2 : 4.

¹⁹ Eg Acts 1 : 8; 2 : 4, 38; 9 : 17; 1 Cor 2 : 12; 14 : 16; Gal 3 : 14; 5 : 16, 25.

²⁰ For ritual, see S White, *Christian Worship* (Peterborough, 1997) 71f: 'the form and manner of religious worship' which shapes, stabilises, orders and transmits 'deeply-held values and ideals'; also K Flanagan, *Sociology and Liturgy: Representations of the Holy* (London, 1991) 150ff. For an Orthodox perspective, see C Andronikof, 'The meaning of rite', 20 *St Vladimir's Theological Quarterly* (1976) 3.

²¹ Eg Church of England, Canon C 1, para 1; Code of Canon Law 1983, Canons 232, 1009, 1029.

in (eg) Methodism: persons must be 'examined tested and approved before they are authorised to minister in holy things'.²²

The gathering: liturgical fellowship for worship in the presence of God

The ordination service opens with the gathering of the people. Anglicanism and Rome agree that the *gathering* of the people is an action of the Church and of God: the faithful are called by God to corporate fellowship; ordination is a liturgical act of worship of the gathered faithful involving the spiritual activity of praise, prayer and thanksgiving; ordination as worship is an act of God present in the liturgy.

For Anglicans, following 'the ancient custom of the church', ordination must occur in the presence of the congregation.²³ The minister is the bishop.²⁴ So too for Rome: with the bishop as minister, the faithful attend to enable the greatest number to be present at the celebration.²⁵ The gathering itself is a spiritual event.²⁶ First, as a manifestation of the Church, the gathering is called by God. In Anglicanism, the bishop says (typically): 'God our Father ... through your Son you have called us into the fellowship of your universal Church'.²⁷ With Rome, the faithful attend so 'the ceremony may truly reflect the fact that this is not a private matter but a celebration of and for the Church'.²⁸ For ARCIC, 'ordination is an act in which the whole Church of God is involved'.²⁹ The gathering also has a place in Methodist ordinations.³⁰

Secondly, the gathering is a spiritual event because it is integral to a liturgical act of worship. For Anglicans, worship, fundamental to the Body of Christ, is a spiritual activity which involves praise, prayer and thanksgiving, through which the faithful 'advance in their knowledge of God's nature, and may hope to penetrate further into his mysteries'.³¹ The faithful respond 'to God's love', by 'the corporate offering of prayer, celebration of the Sacraments and reading of his holy Word'.³² 'Liturgy' (public worship) 'becomes worship when the people of God make the prayers their own prayers, and turn in faith, to God'.³³ As the ordination service comprises an encounter with the Word of God, prayer, praise, thanksgiving, and a eucharistic celebration, so it is a spiritual act of worship. Similarly, for

²² The Constitutional Practice and Discipline of the Methodist Church, Deed of Union, 2.4.

²³ Eg Church of England, *Alternative Service Book* (hereafter ASB), Ordinal, 3 (amended 2000; in use to 31 December 2005, when *Common Worship* came in).

²⁴ Eg Church of Ireland, Constitution, IX, 18.

²⁵ Code of Canon Law 1983, Canons 1011, 1012; Rite, 1.

²⁶ Lossky, 534: 'the Spirit ... assembles people' (see n 15 above).

²⁷ Eg Church of England, ASB, 3; Church in Wales, Ordinal 2004: the Church is 'the dwelling place of the Holy Spirit'.

²⁸ *The Canon Law: Letter and Spirit*, Canon Law Society of Great Britain and Ireland (Dublin 1995), 1976.

²⁹ ARCIC I, 14.

³⁰ Ordination of Presbyters (Methodist Church, Ordination Services), 4.

³¹ Lambeth Conference 1930, Resolution 8.

³² Eg Church in Wales, *Book of Common Prayer* (1984), Catechism, 695.

³³ Eg Church of Ireland, *Alternative Prayer Book* (1984) 8.

Rome ordination is liturgical; as liturgy, it is a public work or service, 'the participation of the People of God in "the work of God"'. As 'the one *leitourgos* (Heb 8 : 2, 6)', in worship the common priesthood of Christ's faithful is exercised. Liturgy is 'the visible sign of the communion in Christ between God and men', and produces 'its fruits in the lives of the faithful', including 'new life in the Spirit'.³⁴

Thirdly, as ordination comprises worship so it involves the active presence of God. For Anglicans, worship is 'the response of the people of God to the presence of God'; and liturgy exists 'to enable a community to pray ... to provide conditions in which [God's] presence may be experienced'.³⁵ As a *sacramental* celebration, ordination is a sign and pledge of God's grace, a means by which the faithful receive his gifts.³⁶ Similarly, for Rome, Christ is 'present when the Church prays', 'for he promised "where two or three are gathered together in my name there am I in the midst of them"' (Mt 18: 20). Thus, a liturgical celebration, 'an action of Christ ... and of ... the Church', is 'a sacred action', in which 'the Holy Spirit is sent ... to bring us into communion with Christ'; an 'intimate co-operation of the Holy Spirit and the Church is achieved in the liturgy'. Moreover, as a sacrament ordination is an action of Christ: in it 'the Holy Spirit puts us unto communion with Christ'; the fruit of the sacraments (*ex opere operato*) is sanctification of the faithful whom the Spirit makes 'partakers in the divine nature by uniting them in a living union with the only Son'.³⁷

The ministry of the word: God speaks with the people

Anglicanism and Rome agree that the *ministry of the word* is an action of the Church and of God, and directed to the ordination: in it God speaks and the people hear and so are energised by the Holy Spirit and put in a living relationship with God. The Spirit is both present and active in the Ministry of the Word.

In Anglicanism, in the reading of scripture, the 'inspired witness to divine revelation', 'God *by the Spirit communicates his word* in the Church' and enables the 'people to respond with understanding and faith'.³⁸ In 'hearing and obeying God *as he speaks* in scripture', the faithful engage in 'the dynamic life of the Spirit'; by scripture 'God *directs ... energises ... shapes and unites*' the Church in its mission, 'the Spirit's work in energising the Church ... and shaping it in the holiness of the new creation'.³⁹ In the English rite, the Old Testament and New Testament readings tell how God

³⁴ *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 1069, 1071, 1072; *Sacrosanctum concilium* Vatican II (1963) 5, 9, 11; Code of Canon Law 1983, Canons 836, 1009 §2.

³⁵ Eg Anglican Church in Aotearoa, New Zealand and Polynesia, *A New Zealand Prayer Book* (1989) xiii-xiv. For Orthodoxy, see A Schmemmann, *Introduction to Liturgical Theology* (New York, 1996).

³⁶ Church in Wales, *Book of Common Prayer* (1984), Catechism, 696.

³⁷ *Sacrosanctum concilium*, 7, 59; *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 687, 1069, 1084-1112, 1127-1129.

³⁸ *The Virginia Report, Official Report of the Lambeth Conference 1998* (Harrisburg, 1998) 32.

³⁹ The Lambeth Commission, *The Windsor Report* (London, 2004) paras. 55, 56.

empowers by the Spirit those he calls to ministry: 'The spirit of the Lord God is upon me because the Lord has anointed me' (Is 61 : 1-3a); or: 'For men hang upon the words of the priest and seek knowledge and instruction from him, because he is the messenger of the Lord' (Mal 2 : 5-7). Following Psalm 145, in 2 Cor 5 : 14-19 God calls the faithful to new life in union with Christ, and the Gospel (Jn 20 : 19-23) recalls: "'As the Father sent me, so I send you". Then he breathed on them, saying: "Receive the Holy Spirit"'".⁴⁰ A sermon (offered 'to the glory of God and to the edification of the people'),⁴¹ is followed by the Nicene Creed.

The pneumatic dimension of the Liturgy of the Word in the Roman ordination may be understood likewise by reference to the teaching of Rome on scripture: 'Christ is present in his word since it is he himself who speaks when the Holy Scriptures are read in the Church'. By 'giving life to the Word of God', 'the grace of the Holy Spirit seeks to awaken faith, conversion of heart and adherence to the Father's will'. The Holy Spirit 'gives a spiritual understanding of the Word of God to those who read or hear it, according to the disposition of their heart'. Moreover, through the words, 'the Spirit puts both the faithful and the ministers into a living relationship with Christ, the Word and Image of the Father, so that they can live out the meaning of what they hear'.⁴² In Methodism too, the Ministry of the Word follows the gathering.⁴³

The presentation: an account of prior spiritual activity

For both Anglicans and Rome the *presentation* contains no obvious spiritual activity of itself, but rather points to prior spiritual events which occur with the grace of God: a person is called by God to ordained ministry (to use gifts invested by the Spirit); this vocation is tested by the Church, whose selectors engage in a spiritual activity of discernment, and recognised in the people's assent; and candidates undergo a spiritual formation in training.

At the presentation, a feature of both Anglican and Roman liturgies, candidates are presented to the bishop who presents them to the people. The rite involves no obvious spiritual activity in itself: it is not an action of God (except God continues to call the candidate). Rather the liturgy recounts prior events with a pneumatic element: vocation, selection; training. These are fundamental to the vitality of ordination.

Vocation: It is commonly understood that in the Old Testament vocation is 'a call from God to a selected person' (eg Moses), and in the New Testament, 'a call to follow Jesus, or to salvation'.⁴⁴ For Anglicans, first,

⁴⁰ ASB, 4-8.

⁴¹ Eg Church of England: Canon B18; WCC, Montreal 1963: Christ is 'present' in 'the proclamation of the Word'.

⁴² Rite, 6-8; *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 1088, 1092-1112, 1544.

⁴³ Ordination of Presbyters (Methodist Church, Ordination Services), 5-10.

⁴⁴ B Ferguson and D F Wright (eds), *New Dictionary of Theology* (Leicester, 1988) 711.

ordination is an initiative of God: 'persons ... are ... called by God to the ordained ministry', when they know this 'in [their] own heart'.⁴⁵ Secondly, bishops should foster vocations, and clergy, teachers, and parents should 'seek for and encourage' vocations. Thirdly, 'a call to this [ordained] life of sacrifice and devotion' should be discerned initially by the person involved.⁴⁶ English guidance provides how 'a person may recognise a call': a 'deep inner conviction that God is calling' may come 'like a bolt from the blue' or 'a still small voice', through 'listening to a sermon', 'during a time of prayer', or friends who have 'spotted God's calling' in the person. A key is prayer: 'Ask God what it is He would like you to do'; 'pray through what you are thinking and feeling', and ask others to pray for and with you.⁴⁷ Fourthly, recognition of a call may involve a person acknowledging their gifts for ordained ministry which the Spirit bestows on them.⁴⁸ Fifthly, then, vocation is discerned by grace, 'the help that God gives', through 'personal relations between God and man'.⁴⁹ The 'gifts of God's grace' are received in fellowship, worship, prayer, bible reading, sacraments, and daily life, and in 'gifts for the spiritual life ... bestowed on the soul by the Holy Spirit'.⁵⁰

Similarly, for Rome the whole Christian community should foster vocations (especially families and bishops).⁵¹ Ordination is a divine gift: it 'can be received only as an unmerited gift'; 'no one claims [ordination] for himself; he is called to it by God'.⁵² The candidate, who 'has seriously considered this step',⁵³ 'thinks he recognizes the signs of God's call to the ordained ministry'.⁵⁴ As in Anglicanism, for Rome discernment is an encounter with the Spirit 'whom Christ ... pours out on his members'. The gifts of the Spirit, 'permanent dispositions which make man docile in following the promptings of the Holy Spirit' (wisdom, understanding, etc) may operate in vocation insofar as they make the faithful docile in 'obeying divine inspiration'. Grace itself is 'the help God gives us to respond to our vocation', a free gift of the Spirit.⁵⁵ For ARCIC, 'the Holy Spirit gives to some individuals ... special gifts for the benefit of the Church, which entitle them to speak and be heeded'.⁵⁶

⁴⁵ Protestant Episcopal Church in the USA (hereafter ECUSA), *Book of Common Prayer* (1979) 577.

⁴⁶ Lambeth Conference 1948, Resolutions 38, 83; 1958, Resolution 81.

⁴⁷ Church of England: Material for Vocations Sunday.

⁴⁸ *Virginia Report* (see above n 37), 29, 34.

⁴⁹ Eg Church in Wales, *Book of Common Prayer* (1984), Catechism, 694; Lambeth Conference 1948, Resolution 101.

⁵⁰ Eg Church in Wales, *Book of Common Prayer* (1984), Catechism, 694; G Thomas, *The Catholic Faith: A Manual of Instruction for Members of the Church of England* (Revised edn., London, 1971) 87ff.

⁵¹ Code of Canon Law 1983, Canon 233.

⁵² *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 1578.

⁵³ Rites, 14.

⁵⁴ *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 1578; Code of Canon Law 1983, Canon 233 § 2.

⁵⁵ *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 742-747, 1830-1832, 1996-2005, 2021.

⁵⁶ *Authority in the Church* (1976) 3, 5.

These ideas are more fully set out in Methodism. 'Some are called' to ordained ministry by a 'personal call' of God. There must be 'a sense of inward pressure'; a person must be 'convinced that he has no choice but to offer himself for the ordained ministry'. The presence of gifts enables the call to be recognised: it is 'the gifts of the Spirit the grace and the fruit which indicate those whom He has chosen'.⁵⁷ Again, in Methodist-Roman Catholic dialogue: 'the movement of the Holy Spirit to call persons at will into ministry' may be experienced: 'as an internal compulsion'; or through: the convergence of several external factors; the influence of the Church; or 'the indication of a need and the ability under God to fulfil' it.⁵⁸ Recognition of gifts as a mode of discernment also appears in United Reformed Church⁵⁹ and World Council of Churches texts: 'Ordination is an acknowledgement by the church of the gifts of the Spirit in the one ordained'.⁶⁰

Selection: The presentation next provides that the Church recognises the call to ordained ministry. As in Methodism,⁶¹ in Anglicanism 'the assent of the people that the candidate should be ordained is an integral part of the service'.⁶² In the English rite, the bishop explains that those who have examined the candidates 'believe' them 'to be duly called to serve God in his ministry'; the people then assent to the ordination.⁶³ In the Roman rite, a priest testifies the candidate is found worthy 'after inquiry among the people of Christ and upon recommendation of those concerned with his training'; the bishop then elects, and the people consent, the bishop saying: 'We rely on the help of the Lord ... and we chose this man ... for priesthood'.⁶⁴ The work of the Spirit is rather more implicit than explicit as to the selection process.

For Anglicans only 'persons ... chosen and recognized by the Church as being called by God to the ordained ministry are admitted to ... sacred orders'.⁶⁵ At English selection conferences, candidates should: speak of their 'vocation ... referring ... to their own conviction and the extent to which others have confirmed it', and their 'sense of vocation should be obedient, realistic and informed'; and show 'evidence' of (eg): 'personal commitment to Christ' and 'to a spiritual discipline, involving individual

⁵⁷ The Constitutional Practice and Discipline of the Methodist Church, Deed of Union, 2.4; *Statements of the Methodist Church on Faith and Order 1933-1983* (London, 1984), 135.

⁵⁸ Methodist-Roman Catholic Dialogue: *The Apostolic Tradition* (Paris, 1991), 79; see J Gros, H Meyer, W G Rush (eds), *Growth in Agreement: Reports and Agreed Statements of Ecumenical Conversations on a World Level 1982-1998* (WCC, Geneva, 2000) (hereafter Gros), 597.

⁵⁹ United Reformed Church, *Manual* (including Basis of Union) A.20.

⁶⁰ *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry*, Faith and Order Paper No. 111 (WCC, Geneva, 1982), 30-31, 42-44.

⁶¹ The president: 'Their call has been tested'; the people assent: Ordination of Presbyters (Methodist Church, Ordination Services), 301.

⁶² Eg *A New Zealand Prayer Book* (1989) 887.

⁶³ Church of England, ASB, 12.

⁶⁴ Rite, 13.

⁶⁵ ECUSA, *Book of Common Prayer* (1979) 577.

and corporate prayer and worship', to 'energise them in their daily lives'. For the selectors too discernment is a spiritual process: the conference aim is 'to search out God's will for the future of the candidates' and 'his Church'; thus: 'times set aside for worship and meditation are ... central to the whole conference'.⁶⁶

The pneumatic element is less explicit in Roman texts: 'No one has the right to receive ... Orders'. So, one claiming a vocation must 'submit his desire to the authority of the Church' which has 'the responsibility and right to call someone to receive orders'. The bishop admits to seminary only those 'whose human, moral, spiritual and intellectual gifts', 'physical and psychological health and right intention', show them capable of dedication to ordained ministry. These and other qualities (eg sound faith, moral probity, genuine piety) also represent prerequisites to ordination.⁶⁷ Similarly, only those 'the Methodist Church recognises as called of God ... shall be ordained'; they must be 'examined tested and approved'. Whilst the 'individual sense of call must be recognized and confirmed by the corporate judgment of the Church', the official texts do not state that the Church must do so in the Spirit: this is understood. Nevertheless, prior to ordination the candidate must answer: 'Are you *still* convinced of your call to the ministry as you were when you were accepted?'⁶⁸ Other Churches have similar approaches: 'A call must be tested by the Church'.⁶⁹

Training: The presentation also refers to the candidate's training.⁷⁰ Anglican candidates should be instructed in listed subjects (eg scripture, theology, ministry, worship), and, before priestly ordination, must satisfy their bishop of their continuing studies, 'spiritual development', and growth in ministry.⁷¹ In England, training is 'to equip [candidates] for a ministry in which [they] are continually learning and growing' in faith and (eg) 'disciplined, personal communion with God'. As in Methodism,⁷² training is 'part of continuing to discern [their] vocation' and involves their 'spiritual and devotional life'.⁷³ For Rome, seminarians should develop human maturity, the spirit of the Gospel, and 'a close relationship with

⁶⁶ Ministry Division, Guidance: Summary of Criteria for Selection for Ministry (2005).

⁶⁷ *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 1578; *Optatum totius*, Vatican II (1966) 6; Code of Canon Law 1983, Canons 241, 1029.

⁶⁸ The Constitutional Practice and Discipline of the Methodist Church, Deed of Union, 2.4; 716; *Statements of the Methodist Church on Faith and Order 1933-1983*, 135; see Methodist-Roman Catholic Dialogue: *The Apostolic Tradition*, 79; Anglican-Methodist Dialogue, *Sharing in the Apostolic Communion* (Kanuga, North Carolina, USA, January 1996) 41, 42; Gros, 55 (see n 58 above).

⁶⁹ J.L. Weatherhead, *The Constitution and Laws of the Church of Scotland* (Edinburgh, 1997) 112; see also United Reformed Church, *Manual*, A.13, K.

⁷⁰ ASB, 12; Rite, 12; Ordination of Presbyters (Methodist Church, Ordination Services), 301.

⁷¹ Province of the West Indies, Canons.16-17; Scottish Episcopal Church, Canon 11.4.

⁷² The Constitutional Practice and Discipline of the Methodist Church, 716.

⁷³ Church of England, Ministry Division Guidance (2005); also *Mission and Ministry* (2003); *Spirituality and Training* (1981).

Christ', learning that a faithful ministry 'contributes effectively to their personal sanctification'. The Eucharist is a source for them of 'strength of soul for their apostolic labour and ... spiritual life'. Spiritual formation also involves (eg): the hours; mental prayer; exercises to acquire 'the spirit of prayer and be strengthened in their vocation'; working with 'a director of his spiritual life'; and an annual retreat. Theological formation in catholic teaching is 'a nourishment of their own spiritual lives'.⁷⁴

The examination: spiritual commitments

For both Anglicans and Roman Catholics, at the *examination*: the charge points to the action of God (in the divine gift of ordained ministry and the divine distribution of priestly functions) and to the action of God and the priest (in the spiritual life of communion between priest and God); and the examination comprises the spiritual commitment of the candidate to priesthood.

The Anglican examination consists of a description of the work of a priest (sometimes called 'the charge'),⁷⁵ and the declaration (in which the candidate makes various undertakings). In the Roman service, the homily describes the work of priesthood and the examination contains undertakings about the exercise of ministry.⁷⁶

The charge: This is not a rite in which the Spirit seems active directly. Rather, the charge spells out priestly work following ordination. Yet, the Church understands the priestly tasks the charge describes as having been assigned by God outside ordination. First, ordained ministry itself is a gift of God. Whilst all the faithful have a royal priesthood, for Anglicans the historic threefold ordained ministry (bishops, priests, deacons) is 'not the exclusive property' of any individual Church but 'a gift from God' or 'of Divine Institution'.⁷⁷ Ordained ministries are 'given by God as instruments of his grace', 'possessing not only the inward call of the Spirit but also Christ's commission through ... the Church'.⁷⁸ Likewise for Rome: all the faithful form a royal priesthood, but ministerial priesthood is a 'divine institution', 'a gift' to the Church.⁷⁹

Secondly, in Anglicanism the existence of specific priestly functions 'may be rightly attributed to the guidance of the Holy Spirit'.⁸⁰ 'A priest is called *by God to*': work with the bishop and fellow-priests 'as servant and

⁷⁴ *Optatam totius*, Vatican II (1966) 4, 8-9, 12; *Presbyterorum ordinis*, Vatican II (1965) 3, 8-9; *The Canon Law: Letter and Spirit*, Canon Law Society of Great Britain and Ireland (Dublin 1995), 519; Code of Canon Law 1983, Canons 235-236, 244-246, 252.

⁷⁵ Church in Wales (charge); Church of England (declaration).

⁷⁶ Rite, 14-16.

⁷⁷ ECUSA, *Book of Common Prayer* (1979) 557; Scottish Episcopal Church, Canon 11.

⁷⁸ Church in Wales, Canon 28-9-1995.

⁷⁹ *Directory on the Ministry and Life of Priests*, 1; Code of Canon Law 1983, Canon 1008.

⁸⁰ Province of West Africa, Constitution II(d)(i).

shepherd', proclaim the Word, call his hearers to repent, absolve, baptise, prepare people for confirmation, preside at the Eucharist, lead in prayer and worship (etc). Priests, as 'messengers, watchmen, and stewards of the Lord', must teach, admonish, feed, search, guide 'so that [the people] may be saved through Christ'.⁸¹ Rome also sees the divine will as the source of priestly functions of teaching, sanctifying and governing, all exercised to lead the faithful 'through Christ and in the Holy Spirit to God the Father'.⁸²

Thirdly, prospectively, the Anglican charge points to the spiritual life of a priest,⁸³ who must 'set the Good Shepherd always before him as the pattern of his calling', and 'by the grace ... of God, pray earnestly for his Holy Spirit',⁸⁴ 'fully determined, by the grace of God, to give [of self] wholly to his service and devote to him [their] best powers of mind and spirit'.⁸⁵ Thus, 'to assist the spiritual life', clergy are exhorted to: say Morning and Evening Prayer; engage in personal prayer, self-examination and study (especially scripture); 'be open to ... the promptings of the Holy Spirit'; and devote time and resources to their own 'spiritual life'; 'spiritual discernment' can be facilitated by 'sharing the journey of faith' with a spiritual director.⁸⁶ Similarly, Roman priests maintain their ministry with 'a spiritual life to which they give absolute pre-eminence', enabling them 'to breathe ... in a climate of friendship and personal encounter with the Lord'. This involves (eg): daily Eucharist, liturgy of the hours, divine reading, silence and prayer (in periodical spiritual exercises and retreats), Marian devotions; and reading the saints' lives.⁸⁷ Methodism also exhorts ministers to 'pray without ceasing', recognising that 'the Holy Spirit will sustain [them] by his grace',⁸⁸ and the United Reformed Church exhorts in ministry a 'deeper discipleship'.⁸⁹

Fourthly, rites indicate purposes and effects of spirituality in priestly life. The English rite (eg) provides: 'as you daily follow ... our Lord, with the heavenly assistance of his Holy Spirit, you may grow up into his likeness, and sanctify ... all with whom you have to do'.⁹⁰ A Roman priest should seek 'to unite [himself] more closely every day to Christ',⁹¹ in 'a special and profound rapport', in which Christ is 'the principal protagonist'.⁹² Equally, however, spirituality is not confined to clergy. For Anglicans 'wholeness of

⁸¹ These (eg) may be seen as divine commands: proclaiming (1 Tim 4), baptising (Mt 28 : 19).

⁸² Rite, 14.

⁸³ Lossky, 1070: spirituality: 'the way Christians take to be Christian, to fulfil their ... vocation' (see n 15 above).

⁸⁴ *Book of Common Prayer* 1662 (Ordinal).

⁸⁵ ASB, 13.

⁸⁶ Anglican Church of Papua New Guinea, *Anglican Prayer Book* (1991) 227; Church of England, Canon C 2, para 1: Guidelines (2003).

⁸⁷ *Directory on the Ministry and Life of Priests*, 38, 39.

⁸⁸ Ordination of Presbyters (Methodist Church, Ordination Services), 13.

⁸⁹ URC, *Manual*, K.

⁹⁰ ASB, 13.

⁹¹ Rite, 15.

⁹² *Directory on the Ministry and Life of Priests*, 38.

personality can be attained only in so far as a man is consciously associated with Jesus Christ'.⁹³ For Rome, all the faithful must make 'a wholehearted effort to lead a holy life', as 'spiritual growth tends towards ever more intimate union with Christ'.⁹⁴ This parallels Orthodoxy's 'deification' (*theosis*): 'the whole purpose of Christian life [is] the acquisition of the Holy Spirit'.⁹⁵ Anglicans 'do not reject' this Orthodox doctrine of 'the energies of God and "divinization"'.⁹⁶

Examination-declarations: Anglican ordination texts do not clearly indicate pneumatological aspects of the examination. Indeed, for the English rite its aim is so that the Church 'may know your mind and purpose, and that you may be strengthened in your resolve to fulfil your ministry'. The candidate makes eight declarations. Three comprise spiritual action ostensibly on the part of the candidate (eg belief in scripture).⁹⁷ Five indicate action of both God and candidate, who undertakes 'By the help of God' (eg) to accept Church discipline.⁹⁸ The declarations end: 'God ... has given [the candidate] the will to undertake all these things', and the bishop prays that 'Almighty God ... gives to [the person] also the strength to perform' the undertakings 'that he [God] may complete the work he has begun in [them]'.⁹⁹

The Roman examination also consists of declarations to undertake the priestly office and promises of obedience to the bishop, personal commitments without any obvious pneumatic aspect beyond: 'May God who has begun the good work in you bring it to fulfilment'.¹⁰⁰ The Methodist examination is similarly unilateral (declarations of 'lifelong commitment to this ministry'), but ends: 'May God who has called you to this ministry give you the grace and power to do his will';¹⁰¹ and United Reformed Church candidates undertake ministry 'by the grace of God'.¹⁰² Covenantal theology might provide a more satisfactory appreciation of spiritual aspects of the examination.

⁹³ G S Wakefield, 'Anglican spirituality' in L Dupré and E Saliers (eds), *Christian Spirituality: Post-Reformation and Modern* (London, 1989) 257; Lambeth Conference 1948, Resolutions 39ff.

⁹⁴ *Lumen gentium*, Vatican II, Dogmatic Constitution (1964) 39-42; *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 2014-2015.

⁹⁵ Lossky (1957) 196 (see n 15. above); D J Constantelos, *Understanding the Greek Orthodox Church* (3rd edn., Brookline, Mass., 1998) 68; T Ware, *The Orthodox Church* (London, 1964) 236.

⁹⁶ *Anglican-Orthodox Agreed Statement* (Dublin, 1984) 89 (Gros, 81); Methodist-Roman Catholic dialogue: *The Word of Life: A Statement on Revelation and Faith* (Baar, Switzerland, 1995) 43-47 (Gros, 618 (see n 58 above)).

⁹⁷ ASB, 14: they declare belief in their call and the faith, and undertake to teach that faith.

⁹⁸ *Ibid*: to be diligent in prayer, scripture-reading, study; to fashion their life on Christ; to promote unity etc; 'in the strength of the Holy Spirit', to stir up God's gift in them and make Christ known to all.

⁹⁹ ASB, 14.

¹⁰⁰ Rite, 15, 16.

¹⁰¹ Ordination of Presbyters (Methodist Church, Ordination Services), 13.

¹⁰² URC, *Manual*, A, Sch C.

Prayer (litany): The church calls the Holy Spirit and speaks with God

For both Anglicanism and Rome the *prayers* (and litany) of the people (invoking the Holy Spirit) is an action of the people in the Spirit, a response to God, and an action initiated by God. That is: the prayers of the people contain an obvious mutual spiritual action of the faithful and God.¹⁰³

In the English rite, after invocation of the Holy Spirit (*epiclesis*) in singing *Veni Creator Spiritus*, the people offer intercessory prayer for the candidates and for ministry; the rite contains petitions (eg for God to enlighten all ministers).¹⁰⁴ The bishop affirms that God hears the prayers: 'Grant that what we have asked in faith we may obtain according to your will'.¹⁰⁵ The prayer is a spiritual action of the faithful: 'the soul *talking* to God', effectual when 'in the Holy Spirit', offered in faith and Christ's name, submissive, earnest; and a '*response* to God' in which God is adored, praised and thanked, sins confessed and forgiveness requested. Equally, it is an action of God: in prayer we listen to God to know his will; though 'at one level a human activity, at a deeper level [prayer] is the activity of God the Holy Spirit, who dwells in our hearts by faith'.¹⁰⁶ The Roman equivalents are the invitation to pray, and litany: 'Hear us, Lord our God, and pour out upon this servant ... the blessing of the Holy Spirit and the grace and power of the priesthood'.¹⁰⁷ The prayer is both an action of the faithful, 'raising mind and heart to God', requesting good things from Him, and 'a gift of God': 'springing forth from both the Holy Spirit and ourselves', prayer is 'being in the presence of ... God and in communion with him'.¹⁰⁸ The litany itself is a petition: in it we 'ask, beseech, plead, invoke' and 'express awareness of our relationship with God'; forgiveness is a prerequisite to effectual prayer.¹⁰⁹

The ordination: consecratory prayer and imposition of hands

In both Anglicanism and Roman Catholicism, the *consecratory prayer and imposition of hands* petition God for the outpouring and grace of the Holy Spirit on the candidate for the office and work of priest, an action performed in the assurance of its reception in the candidate.

On the one hand, this ritual is an act of the Church. In Anglicanism, 'the central act of ordination consists of the imposition of hands by a bishop, together with prayer for the Holy Spirit to give grace for the particular order being bestowed'.¹¹⁰ First, in the English rite, the bishop stretches out

¹⁰³ Litany: petitions preceding prayer: P Bradshaw (ed), *The New SCM Dictionary of Liturgy and Worship* (London, 2002) 281; its aim, 'encounter with God': O Cullmann, *Prayer in the New Testament* (London, 1995) 143.

¹⁰⁴ Ie for God to have mercy upon them and hear their petitions (etc).

¹⁰⁵ ASB, 16, 17.

¹⁰⁶ Thomas, 92; Church in Wales, *Book of Common Prayer* (1984) 693; Anglican-Orthodox *Agreed Statement* (Dublin, 1984) 38-42.

¹⁰⁷ Rite, 17-19.

¹⁰⁸ *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 2590, 2559, 2564, 2565, 2725, 2738, 2567; *Sacrosanctum concilium*, 9, 10.

¹⁰⁹ For forms of prayer: *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 2626-2643.

¹¹⁰ Church of the Province of Southern Africa, *Prayer Book* (1989) 571; ECUSA,

his hands towards the candidates, praising and glorifying the Father (for Christ's gifts in 'making some apostles, ... some, pastors' (etc)) and thanking God to 'have called these your servants ... to share this ministry'. Secondly, the bishop and priests present lay hands on the head of each candidate, the bishop saying: 'Send down the Holy Spirit upon your servant N for the office and work of a priest in your Church'. Having laid on hands, the bishop petitions the Father: (a) 'give to these your servants grace and power to fulfil their ministry' (to watch over and care for the people; to absolve and bless them in his name; to proclaim the gospel); (b) 'Set them among your people to offer with them spiritual sacrifices ... and to minister the sacraments'; (c) 'make them worthy of their calling'; and (d) 'Give them wisdom and discipline to work faithfully with all their fellow-servants in Christ'. The bishop concludes: 'Accept our prayers ... Amen.'¹¹¹

On the other hand, the ritual is also an action of God: the 'prayer is made for the Spirit to come upon each ordinand for the particular ministry in the Church of God.'¹¹² Its pneumatic aspect is clear: in ordination 'God gives authority and the grace of the Holy Spirit to those being made ... priests ... through [the] prayer and the laying on of hands by bishops'; 'God ... bestows on, and assures those, whom He has called and His Church has accepted for any particular form of ministry, a commission for it and the grace appropriate to it'.¹¹³ Classically, God bestows the Spirit by the imposition of hands.¹¹⁴ Invocation is an asking for the gift of the Spirit to the ordinand; answering that prayer lies in the freedom of the Father to whom the prayer is addressed.¹¹⁵

For Rome, similarly, orders 'are conferred by the laying on of hands and the prayer of consecration which the liturgical books prescribe'.¹¹⁶ At imposition (by bishop and priests present), the bishop administers the consecratory prayer which includes: 'Come to our help, Lord, ... Father, grant to this servant of yours the dignity of the priesthood. Renew within him the Spirit of holiness ... may he be faithful to the ministry that he receives from you ... and be to others a model of right conduct'.¹¹⁷ Confidence in the effectiveness of the work of the Spirit here is based on Jesus' assurance: 'Ask, and it shall be given to you' (Matt 7:7). The bishop's act has a pneumatic aspect: when 'the Holy Spirit ... appointed [the apostles] to shepherd the Church', this was 'a charge destined to be exercised without interruption by the ... bishops'; 'Christ continues to act through the bishops'; as holy orders is the sacrament of apostolic ministry,

Book of Common Prayer (1979) 577.

¹¹¹ ASB, 18, 19; see John 20 : 22, 23.

¹¹² The Anglican Church of Australia, *A Prayer Book for Australia* (1995) 781.

¹¹³ Church in Wales, *Book of Common Prayer* (1984) 699; United Church of North India, Constitution I.I.VIII. 2.

¹¹⁴ *Book of Common Prayer* 1662: 'Receive the Holy Ghost ... by the Imposition of our hands'.

¹¹⁵ Anglican-Reformed dialogue: *God's Reign and Our Unity* (Woking, 1984) 80, 86, 87, 90 (Gros, 114 (see n 58 above)).

¹¹⁶ Code of Canon Law 1983, Canon 1009 § 2.

¹¹⁷ Rite, 22.

‘it is for the bishops as the successors of the apostles to hand on the “gift of the Spirit”, the “apostolic line”’.¹¹⁸

An understanding that the Holy Spirit empowers the person for the office and work of presbyter appears in Methodism,¹¹⁹ and, for ministry, in the United Reformed Church.¹²⁰ For the World Council of Churches, ‘Ordination is an invocation to God that the new minister be given the power of the Holy Spirit in the new relation which is established between that minister and the local community and, by intention, the church universal’; the Church is dependent on but confident in God for the outcome of its prayer: ordination is ‘a sign performed in faith that the spiritual relationship signified is present in, with and through the words spoken, the gestures made and the forms employed’.¹²¹

The presentation of gifts and Eucharist

The presentation of gifts expresses an understanding that in ordination the Holy Spirit empowers the person for priestly ministry: both traditions are assured that God answers the Church’s prayer. For Anglicans, ordination constitutes the grant of authority to the priest as a representative of Christ in the church universal. For Rome, ordination configures the priest to Christ ontologically to act *in persona Christi*. Eucharistic pneumatology is another story.

The liturgy for the presentation of gifts sums up, rather than constitutes, the pneumatological dimension of the preceding rites. In English ritual, the bishop gives a Bible to each new priest: ‘Receive this Book, *as a sign of the authority which God has given you this day* to preach the gospel of Christ and to minister his Holy Sacraments’. This divine gift of authority means the priest (and priesthood itself) is ‘to represent Christ and his Church’.¹²² And, with the help of the Spirit, the priest is to ‘grow up into [the] likeness’ of Christ,¹²³ ‘an instrument of [his] love’.¹²⁴ Ordination ‘constitutes and acknowledges this special ministry of representation and leadership within ... the church both locally and universally’; and is intended to admit ‘to the ministry of his universal church carrying an authorization universally valid’.¹²⁵ Ordination cannot be repeated. Then follows the Holy Communion.¹²⁶

¹¹⁸ *Lumen gentium*, 10, 20, 21; *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 1538, 1575-1577.

¹¹⁹ Ordination of Presbyters (Methodist Church, Ordination Services), 16: ‘Father, send the Holy Spirit upon N for the office ... of a Presbyter in your Church’.

¹²⁰ URC, *Manual*, A.20.

¹²¹ *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry*, Faith and Order Paper No. 111, 30-31, 42-44.

¹²² Province of Southern Africa, *Prayer Book* (1989) 433-434. For experiential approaches, see generally K Wilson (ed), *The Experience of Ordination* (London, 1979).

¹²³ ASB, 13.

¹²⁴ *Book of Common Prayer 1662* (Ordinal).

¹²⁵ Anglican-Reformed Dialogue: *God’s Reign and Our Unity* (Woking, 1984) 80, 86, 87, 90 (Gros, 114 (see n 58 above)).

¹²⁶ ASB, 20-22; Church in Wales, Ordinal 2004: the new priest may also be vested and anointed.

The Roman rite ends with investiture, anointing of hands, presentation of gifts, kiss of peace and liturgy of the Eucharist.¹²⁷ Several pneumatic features of priesthood emerge here: 'priests by the anointing of the Holy Spirit are signed with a special character and so are configured to Christ the priest in such a way that they are able to act in the person of Christ the head'; ordination 'confers an *indelible spiritual character*',¹²⁸ and ministerial priesthood is Christological and ontological.¹²⁹ The Anglican position that a priest represents Christ and may grow into his likeness, and the Roman that a priest is configured to Christ, may be contrasted with (eg) Methodism: presbyters 'hold no priesthood differing in kind from that which is common to all the Lord's people'.¹³⁰ Yet, in Anglican-Methodist dialogue ordained ministries 'possess both the inward call of the Holy Spirit and Christ's commission given through the Church';¹³¹ similarly in Methodist-Roman Catholic dialogue, 'the Holy Spirit empowers all ministry, both ordained and lay'.¹³² For the World Council of Churches: 'the risen Lord ... is the true ordainer'.¹³³

CONCLUSION

1. Interpretation of ordination rites necessitates discussion of a host of theological doctrines (on eg spirituality, prayer, grace, priesthood). A pneumatological approach to ordination helps Anglicans to understand more fully Roman ideas of validity of orders. For Rome, validity of the sacrament of orders is acquired through the requisites of matter, form, minister, recipient and intent; Anglican ordinations are invalid for want of minister and (perhaps) intent. However, for Rome, sacraments are 'actions of Christ and the Church'. I interpret these requisites for validity as 'actions of the Church'; vitality of orders is achieved when the 'action of Christ' is operative in these actions of the Church. A pneumatology of ordination provides such an understanding. The actions of the Church (matter, form etc) are the outward signs of ecclesiastical validity which are animated by the interior work of the Holy Spirit in the ordination liturgy. The consummation of matter-form-minister-recipient-intent validity is wholly dependent on the work of the Spirit in each element of ordination. It is believed that the ecclesiastical acts performed at ordination provide confirmatory assurance of the action of Christ in the work of the Holy Spirit at ordination.

2. Both Anglicanism and Roman Catholicism accept the canonical

¹²⁷ Rite, 23-29.

¹²⁸ *Presbyterorum ordinis*, 2; *Catechism of the Catholic Church*, 1534-1583; *Lumen gentium*, 26-29.

¹²⁹ *Directory on the Ministry and Life of Priests*, 1-3, 8.

¹³⁰ The Constitutional Practice and Discipline of the Methodist Church, Deed of Union, 2.4.

¹³¹ *Anglican-Methodist Covenant*, Common Statement of the Formal Conversations between the Methodist Church of Great Britain and the Church of England (London, 2001) 61.

¹³² *Methodist-Roman Catholic Dialogue: The Apostolic Tradition*, 90.

¹³³ *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry*, Faith and Order Paper No. 111, 30-31, 42-44.

importance of pneumatology in ordination. A pneumatology of the liturgical texts reveals substantial agreement between Anglicanism and Rome that a particular spiritual activity either occurs in or is indicated as operating outside (prior to or following) each ritual element of ordination. For both traditions:

- (1) The *gathering* of the people is an action of the Church and of God: the faithful are called by God to corporate fellowship; ordination is a liturgical act of worship of the gathered faithful involving the spiritual activity of praise, prayer and thanksgiving; ordination as worship is an act of God present in the liturgy.
- (2) The *ministry of the word* is an action of the Church and of God, and directed to the ordination: in it God speaks and the people hear and so are energised by the Holy Spirit and put in a living relationship with God.
- (3) The *presentation* contains no obvious spiritual activity of itself, but rather points to prior spiritual events which occur with the grace of God: a person is called by God to ordained ministry (to use gifts invested by the Spirit); this vocation is tested by the Church, whose selectors engage in a spiritual activity of discernment, and recognised in the assent of the people; and candidates undergo a spiritual formation in training.
- (4) At the *examination*: the charge points to the action of God (in the divine gift of ordained ministry and the divine distribution of priestly functions) and to the action of God and the priest (in the spiritual life of communion between priest and God); and the examination comprises the spiritual commitment of the candidate to priesthood.
- (5) The *prayers* (and litany) of the people (invoking the Holy Spirit) is an action of the people in the Spirit, a response to God, and an action initiated by God.
- (6) The *consecratory prayer and imposition of hands*, shared canonical requirements, petition God for the outpouring and grace of the Holy Spirit on the candidate for the office and work of priest, an action performed in the assurance of its reception in the candidate.
- (7) The *presentation of gifts* expresses an understanding that in ordination the Holy Spirit empowers the person for priestly ministry: both traditions are assured that God answers the Church's prayer. For Anglicans, ordination constitutes the grant of authority to the priest as a representative of Christ in the Church universal. For Rome, ordination configures the priest to Christ ontologically to act *in persona Christi*. Eucharistic pneumatology is another story.

3. These similarities, in Anglican and Roman canonical and spiritual understandings of ordination (as an interaction between the divine and human spirits), indicate a convergence of the two communions in the area of pneumatology: God initiates, animates and effects ordination, and the Church acknowledges and administers this in a ritual action governed by canon law. However, it is *not* suggested here that this pneumatological approach establishes equivalence between Anglican and Roman orders,

and thereby solves the question of the (in)validity of Anglican orders in Anglican-Roman Catholic relations. Rather, it is proposed here that pneumatology, in its canonical context, might be of value, on the basis of convergence in shared understandings of the role of the Holy Spirit in ordination, as a step towards mutual recognition by Rome and Anglicans of the fruits or vitality (if not validity) of their respective ordinations (and ordained ministries). Further exploration of the pneumatology of ordination could also offer an avenue for reappraisal of *Apostolicae curae* (called for by ARCIC) in terms of historical equivalence of orders.¹³⁴

4. Indeed, the Seventh Colloquium of Anglican and Roman Catholic Canon Lawyers (Johannesburg, 2006),¹³⁵ has agreed, *inter alia*, that: (1) For Roman Catholics and Anglicans 'the fundamental elements prescribed for the Rite of Ordination are common to both traditions', and from these 'we are led to a deeper common understanding of the nature and basis of sacred ordination'; (2) 'Both Roman Catholics and Anglicans agree in the belief that the Holy Spirit is active in Ordination. The essential ecclesial acts performed in the liturgy provide assurance that ordination is the action of God through His Church. The juridical act is a visible affirmation of the work of the Spirit'; (3) 'Roman Catholics and Anglicans agree that in canon law ordination is of divine institution, confers an indelible character, and consists in fulfilment of what the Church intends, with the free consent of the ordinand, through the imposition of hands by a bishop together with prayer invoking the Holy Spirit to give grace for the work of a deacon, priest, or bishop whichever particular order is bestowed'; (4) Because of 'the definitive Roman Catholic teaching [in] *Apostolicae curae*, the Roman Catholic Church cannot under canon law generically affirm the validity of Anglican Orders'; (5) Anglican and Roman Catholic canonists share 'an interest in discovering how new theological formulations of apostolicity and apostolic succession can be expressed in classical canonical categories. Neither Roman Catholic nor Anglican canon laws provide a clear definition of apostolicity, nor do they prevent a shared understanding of apostolic succession that may provide an opportunity for recognition of ministries'; and (6) 'There are normative positive affirmations of the vitality of Anglican ministry within the Roman Catholic *Ecumenical Directory*'.

¹³⁴ More work needs to be done, needless to say, on the pneumatology of apostolic succession, not to mention the place of maleness.

¹³⁵ For a report on the Colloquium, at which a version of this paper was tabled, see p 484 of this Issue.