

drawn...into the triune God's re-creative action in the world such that it serves to reveal something of the being and action of this God' (p. 187).

Here, then, is the real payoff of the book for Begbie: a deeper, richer appreciation 'for the ways in which the arts can be taken up in the life and witness of the church, as well as for the enterprise of Christian theology' (p. 185); and the final two chapters are eloquent arguments for the centrality of 'uncontainable' art as the bedrock of Christian collective life (worship) and talk about God (theology).

One could quibble with various moments of analysis throughout, but the bigger question left unanswered is why Begbie needed to write the book in the first place. If he is right about the inherent claims of Christianity about the revelation of God and God's engagement with the world, why does he have to make the case for the resonance between theology and the 'more than' powers of art-making and art experience? In other words, there is not, perhaps, enough discussion of the way Christian theology has historically contributed to these reductive tendencies and has absorbed these reductive aims, in its own cultural, social and intellectual life, such that Christians have to be persuaded otherwise. Nor is there a discussion of the way the same multivalence of interpretation can cut in different ways. The power of corporate singing, for example, may 'enable a bodily, emotionally energized awareness of and engagement with each other' (p. 206) and intimate an ecstatic jubilation and giving over to the spirit. Those same powers, however, can also be marshalled as ritualised coercion and disciplining containment.

There is a kind of shadow argument running throughout or behind the book, one that assumes that many Christians – ordinary faithful and academic theologian alike – may have to be persuaded to take seriously the counter-reductive powers of the arts to 'play a key role in the renewal of the church's life and worship' (p. 216). The fact that Begbie chooses not to stage this as an explicit argument may itself enact some of his larger hopes for the book. Arguing about the value of art, after all, plays into the hands of reductionist thinking, shutting down possibilities, hardening lines of interpretation, forcing art to prove its value as a proxy for something else. Instead, Begbie pulls his reader through the flow of the book into the open-ended, multi-valent interpretation he wants to model. Let those who have ears hear.

doi:10.1017/S0036930624000474

Nimi Wariboko, *Transcripts of the Sacred in Nigeria: Beautiful, Monstrous, Ridiculous*

**(Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 2023), pp. xvi + 227.
\$40.00**

Michael Austin Kamenicky

Lee University, Cleveland, TN, USA and Emory University, Atlanta, GA, USA (michael.kamenicky@emory.edu)

Few thinkers are more indispensable than Nimi Wariboko for the scholarly task of understanding the Pentecostal movement's global social implications. His new volume,

Transcripts of the Sacred in Nigeria: Beautiful, Monstrous, Ridiculous, builds on the theological and ethical foundations of his previous work while situating them in the concrete context of contemporary Nigeria. By weaving his often dense and complex concepts into an exploration of his home country, Wariboko renders his thought freshly comprehensible and its implications clearly valuable.

The easiest way to summarise *Transcripts of the Sacred* is by exegeting its title. Principally, all of the essays in the book are concerned with 'the sacred', which in Wariboko's parlance is the network of possibilities available to a community and its members. The sacred can be beautiful, monstrous or ridiculous depending on how its possibilities comport with human flourishing (conducively, repressively or disruptively). The sacred is calcified into transcripts, which are the concrete forms that the sacred takes in social life (practices, institutions, ideas, etc.), which allow scholars to observe the possibilities available to a community. Armed with this terminology, Wariboko charges into the volume's six chapters.

The first chapter is primarily a contextual exposition of Wariboko's definition of the sacred as sets of possibilities in relation to Kalabari and African Pentecostal theology. One of the chapter's chief conceptual insights is that the sacred as possibilities is facilitated by a backdrop of impossibilities (a point made through ample dialogue with Catherine Keller). The second chapter uses the sacred as a lens for understanding the aesthetics of Nigerian Pentecostal 'hot prayers'. Wariboko demonstrates that these exorcistic prayers can be coherently understood aesthetically, as the worshippers utilise tropes found in African traditional religions to manifest the real presence of God in ways that affect their possibilities for flourishing. The third chapter surveys what Wariboko calls 'the Pentecostal incredible'. This is his term for the deformed side of Pentecostalism that responds to the incoherence of postcolonial Nigeria with an incoherent spirituality. This incoherence is often counterproductive for political development, though it could be the grounds for revolutionary movement. In order to actualise this revolutionary potential, however, the destructive impulse of the incredible must be paired with the Christic security of promise. The fourth chapter reads the problem of violence within postcolonial Nigeria in terms of the sacred. The fifth chapter is a fascinating exploration of the belief of some Nigerian Pentecostals that they are destined to evangelize the world and facilitate the uplifting of the Black race globally. Wariboko criticises this notion, because it fails to fulfil the potential of Pentecostalism to disrupt nationalism. The final chapter returns to concepts introduced in his earlier chapter on 'the Pentecostal incredible'. He turns to some instances of resistance to authority within Nigerian Pentecostalism and presents five possible ways of reconceiving Pentecostalism's relationship to cultural development.

One important result of Wariboko's framing of the sacred as social possibilities is to highlight the ambiguous relationship between religion and sacredness. In this framework, religion is merely one of many ways that the sacred manifests within society. Indeed, religion can and does work against the beauty of the sacred when it becomes a means of stifling broader human flourishing. Religion can both create and destroy social possibilities. This reverses the stereotypical view that majority world scholars have of impoverished countries' piety: 'What poor countries have more of is religion, not the sacred' (p. 193).

For readers familiar with Wariboko's other work on Pentecostalism, such as *The Pentecostal Principle* or *The Pentecostal Hypothesis*, *Transcripts of the Sacred* has much to offer in the way of practical clarity. Here, application to the definite global and temporal space of contemporary Nigeria gives flesh to the principles and paradigms

presented in his other work. This may help readers who have found his previous work inscrutable. Furthermore, the second chapter, ‘The Demons as Guests’, which surveys the aesthetics of Nigerian Pentecostal hot prayers, is one of the best places for new readers to start with Wariboko’s work as it applies some of his more abstract ideas to a single practice.

Readers interested in the relationship between religion and politics in twenty-first century Nigeria will find here a stimulating companion to Ebenzer Obadare’s *Pastoral Power, Clerical State*. Wariboko provides an affirmation of Obadare’s diagnosis of Nigeria’s clerical/political gridlock while also articulating the manner in which religion might play a liberatory role in opening new possibilities for social flourishing. *Transcripts of the Sacred* is demanding reading. It requires the reader to follow Wariboko’s thought across widely different essays and often into the furrows of complex economic and political theory. But when one looks over the terrain as a whole, one finds that the journey has rendered the map legible.

doi:10.1017/S0036930624000401

Joseph Carola, S.J. *Engaging the Church Fathers in Nineteenth-Century Catholicism: The Patristic Legacy of the Scuola Romana*

(Steubenville, OH: Emmaus Academic, 2023), pp. xiii + 518. \$54.95

John Nepil

St. John Vianney Theological Seminary, Denver, CO, USA (father.nepil@gmail.com)

‘In this somewhat precarious theological situation, I regard it as salutary to move forward by first moving backward, upstream, and listening to the sources.’¹ If John Betz has given us direction, Joseph Carola has taken us upstream. Wading through the long title of *Engaging the Church Fathers in Nineteenth-Century Catholicism: The Patristic Legacy of the Scuola Romana*, we arrive at a powerful confluence: ‘Not only did the Rhine flow into the Tiber, but the Tiber also mixed with the Thames as it flowed past Ostia into the Mediterranean Sea’ (p. 6).

The story of the *Scuola Romana* sits at the heart of nineteenth-century Catholic theology. It is a story of audacious genius in a time of massive cultural upheaval. It is likewise the story of men; some inspiring, others melodramatic, all of whom had a deeply Catholic vision of reality. Carola’s book is a powerful testimony to the life and legacy of seven major thinkers, who comprised what Heribert Schaaf first called the *Römanische Schule* (Italian: *Scuola Romana*) in 1941. Exceptionally comprehensive, the work offers a compelling *promozione* of a ‘much neglected’ theological legacy (p. 24).

Strictly speaking, the *Scuola Romana* consisted of four leading Jesuit theologians at the Roman College: Giovanni Perrone (1794–1876), Carlo Passaglia (1812–1887),

¹J. Betz, ‘Review: P. Griffiths and R. Hütter, *Reason and the Reasons of Faith*’, *Pro Ecclesia* 16 (2007), p. 222.