

much more impressive than Mr Trimble suggests, all the more so when one considers that in the 1560's, and indeed long after, there were many Catholics who thought that they could in good conscience conform outwardly. Again, on p. 122, he argues, with reference to the missionary efforts of the secular priests and the Jesuits, 'By 1584 the attempted revivification of Catholicism was evidently beginning to fail'. Here, too, it might be argued that the evidence does not support the generalisation. The information from the taxation returns of the later Elizabethan period is used to show that the Catholic gentry were relatively insignificant and poor. One wonders whether Mr Trimble is not pressing this evidence too far. As he himself points out, there are many problems involved in deciding how far it is a reliable guide to the real wealth of those concerned. If one took the lay subsidy figures of the Elizabethan or early Jacobean period as indicating the wealth of the gentry, one would be seriously misled, since, as Raleigh pointed out, the gentry were notoriously under-assessed in the taxation returns.

One particularly interesting point that emerges from this study is that the government's pressure on the gentry to conform was steady and persistent from the early years of the reign. The Catholic gentleman was not normally in danger of death or imprisonment but the heat was turned on him in other ways. He was in many respects regarded as a second-class citizen, he was leaderless, suspected of disloyalty and often without access to the sacraments. The surprising fact is not that so many conformed but that so many held out when all their instincts as loyal subjects of the Queen urged them to submit.

PATRICK MCGRATH

TUDOR BOOKS OF SAINTS AND MARTYRS, by Helen C. White; University of Wisconsin Press; \$6.75.

FOXÉ'S BOOK OF MARTYRS AND THE ELECT NATION, by William Haller; Jonathan Cape; 30s.

Inherent in any study of the past is the wish, so seldom fulfilled, to penetrate behind the data to the living human reality. Dr White's earlier study of Tudor Books of Private Devotion and her new work on Tudor Books of Saints and Martyrs do much to bring to life the age of faith in conflict. Although her sympathies appear to be closer to the old, rather than to the reformed religion, Dr White has gone far towards capturing the elusive insights of private religious expression and one of the sources of its nourishment. Professor Haller's study of Foxe's Book of Martyrs presents a telling picture of a very different type of religious experience, exteriorised in a highly individual view of the working of God through history. He brings into the foreground the importance of the open Bible in the creation of a new emphasis on individual response to the apocalyptic vision of the New Israel, gathered from among the nations and established most perfectly in England. Professor Haller reflects on Foxe's image of Elizabeth, the

godly prince, as one who needed to be encouraged and manoeuvred by the Elect into doing what was right in the eyes of the Lord, in contrast with the 'bright, Occidental Star' of later adulation. The martyrs of the New Israel died for the truth revealed to them in the Scriptures. The Book of Martyrs certainly contains hagiographic elements in the old sense, but the emphasis is on the overall working out of the historical process, of God's plan, to which the martyrs witnessed. Professor Haller gives a proper weight to the importance of the Book of Martyrs as a presentation of salvation history, rather than as simply the record of those who had fought the good fight of faith. It is in this sense that Foxe's work has lived as the inspiration of a significant section of the elect within Protestantism up to our own time, who find in the idea of a ecumenical coming together a betrayal, theologically as well as historically, of the faith committed to the Saints.

JOY ROWE

SENSE, NONSENSE, AND CHRISTIANITY, by Hugo Meynell; Sheed and Ward (Stagbooks); 12s. 6d.

Dr Meynell describes his book as an essay in the logical analysis of religious statements. Recent analyses of theology by empiricist philosophers have been sometimes hostile and sometimes friendly, but always unsatisfactory to the orthodox believer. Dr Meynell argues that some of the empiricist criteria of meaningfulness are fulfilled by the doctrines of traditional Christianity, while the remainder can be shown on philosophical grounds to be themselves invalid. Thus he believes, perhaps optimistically, that it has been shown that it is not logically impossible for disembodied souls to exist, on the grounds that there is no logical connection between private and public events. As a piece of religious language for analysis Dr Meynell chooses, very sensibly, the Apostles' Creed. He argues that the beliefs contained in it are concerned with three distinct classes of matter: (1) past events, (2) present experiences, (3) future events. Many theologians have at different times attempted to regard statements of class (1) and class (3)—such as 'He rose again from the dead' and 'He shall come to judge both the quick and the dead'—as mere picturesque reformulations of the present experiences recorded by class (2) statements. Dr Meynell is properly critical of such reductionist theologians and discusses with erudition, clarity, and acumen four of the principal versions of reductionism: the moral reductionism of Kant, the aesthetic reductionism of Schleiermacher, the metaphysical reductionism of Hegel and the existentialist reductionism of Bultmann. Unfortunately, when it comes to the discussion of class (2) statements, Dr Meynell's own account is likely to appear to many readers to be infected with reductionism. Thus he says that the words 'I believe in God, the Father Almighty, maker of heaven and earth' express 'our feelings of confidence in relation to what we find about us, as though it had all been arranged by someone who loved and cared for us'; and though it is not clear that he