

ON THE LATTICE OF σ -ALGEBRAS

MARLON C. RAYBURN

1. Introduction. In this paper I consider the relations between the lattice of topologies on a fixed space and the lattice of σ -algebras on that space. It is found that the intersection of these two lattices is the lattice of complete Boolean algebras, and that this lattice is anti-atomically generated. Some sufficient conditions for a topology to contain a maximal σ -algebra are noted.

2. Preliminary remarks. Fröhlich (1) characterized the ultraspaces (anti-atoms) in the lattice Σ of topologies as being of the form $G(x, U) = P(X \setminus \{x\}) \cup U$, where U is an ultrafilter on X other than the principal ultrafilter at x . If U is a principal ultrafilter at some other point, say $U(y)$, then $G(x, U(y))$ is called a principal ultraspace. A principal topology is a topology which is the intersection of principal ultraspaces. Steiner (7) characterized principal topologies as those which have a base of open sets minimal at each point, or equivalently, those which are closed under arbitrary intersection.

On a finite space, every topology is principal. Hence, it is possible to discuss any topology on a finite space by explicitly exhibiting its base of open sets minimal at each point.

An $n \times n$ “ K -matrix” is a 0-1 matrix (a_{ij}) such that

$$\begin{aligned} a_{ii} &= 1 \quad \text{for all } i, \\ a_{ij} = 1 &\Rightarrow [(a_{jk} = 1) \Rightarrow (a_{ik} = 1)] \quad \text{for all } i, j. \end{aligned}$$

Krishnamurthy (3) established a one-to-one correspondence between these matrices and the topologies on a space of n points. Indeed, for each $x_i \in X$, the i th row of the K -matrix corresponds to the minimal open set containing x_i . This minimal open set contains x_j if $a_{ij} = 1$. In (5), it was shown that those symmetric with respect to the main diagonal correspond to the σ -algebras.

3. Complete Boolean algebras.

THEOREM 1. *Every σ -algebra over X is a complete Boolean algebra if and only if X is countable.*

Proof. If X is uncountable, let B be the countable, co-countable sets of X ;

Received February 6, 1968 and in revised form August 15, 1968. A portion of this research was done while the author was supported by the National Science Foundation through its Research Participation for College Teachers program at The University of Oklahoma, summer of 1967.

i.e., $B = \{T: T \text{ is countable or } X \setminus T \text{ is countable}\}$. It is easy to check that B is a σ -algebra, but is not closed under arbitrary unions.

For the converse, the only point perhaps not immediately obvious is that an uncountable σ -algebra, B , over a countably infinite set is closed under arbitrary unions. Let $\{B_\alpha | \alpha \in \Lambda\}$ be an arbitrary family of sets in B . However, $\bigcup_\Lambda B_\alpha \subseteq X$, thus,

$$\bigcup_\Lambda B_\alpha = \bigcup_{i=1}^\infty \{p_i\}, \quad p_i \in X.$$

For each $i = 1, 2, \dots$, choose one B_i in the family for which $p_i \in B_i$. Then

$$\bigcup_{i=1}^\infty \{p_i\} \subseteq \bigcup_{i=1}^\infty B_i \subseteq \bigcup_\Lambda B_\alpha.$$

Since B is closed under countable unions, the result follows.

THEOREM 2. *The lattice of complete Boolean algebras is precisely the intersection of the lattice of σ -algebras with the lattice of topologies.*

The proof is immediate from De Morgan’s laws.

COROLLARY. *The complete Boolean algebras on X are principal topologies.*

Proof. The complete Boolean algebras on X are precisely the closed-open topologies on X . Hence, in them, arbitrary intersections of open sets are open. However, this characterizes the principal topologies.

4. A generating map of σ -algebras. Every topology can be generated by a Kuratowski closure operator from $P(X)$ to $P(X)$ (2). By analogy with topology, we ask about operators from $P(X)$ to $P(X)$ which generate σ -algebras. The method of outer measures is close to this approach: If $m^*: P(X) \rightarrow \{\text{real numbers}\}$, such that $m^*(\emptyset) = 0$, and m^* is monotone and subadditive, then $B = \{T: \forall A \subseteq X, m^*(A) \geq m^*(A \cap T) + m^*(A \setminus T)\}$ is a σ -algebra on X (4, p. 87).

Partial success is given by the following approach. Let the complementation operator $C: P(X) \rightarrow P(X)$ be given by $C(A) = X \setminus A$.

Definition. Let $k: P(X) \rightarrow P(X)$ be such that for all A, B in $P(X)$,

- (1) $A \subseteq k(A)$;
- (2) $k(A) = k^2(A)$;
- (3) $k(A \cup B) = k(A) \cup k(B)$;
- (4) $k \circ C = C \circ k$.

THEOREM 3. *If $B = \{A: k(A) = A\}$, then B is a complete Boolean algebra.*

Proof. From (1) and (4), X and \emptyset are in B . Since $k = C \circ k \circ C$, if $k(A) = A$, then $C \circ k \circ C(X \setminus A) = X \setminus A = k(X \setminus A)$. Therefore, $A \in B$ if and only if $X \setminus A \in B$. Thus, k is a Kuratowski closure operator, and B is a closed-open topology. However, these are the complete Boolean algebras.

COROLLARY. *On a countable space, every σ -algebra can be so obtained.*

5. Topological σ -algebras and topologies from σ -algebras. Let Σ be the lattice of topologies and Δ the lattice of σ -algebras over a fixed space X . Suppose that $\tau: \Sigma \rightarrow \Delta$ is given by $\tau(T) = \bigcap \{B \in \Delta: T \subseteq B\}$.

Notice that τ comes close to being a Kuratowski operator.

- THEOREM 4.** (a) $\tau(\emptyset, X) = \{\emptyset, X\}$.
 (b) $T \subseteq \tau(T)$ and $T = \tau(T)$ if and only if T is a complete Boolean algebra.
 (c) If $T_1 \subseteq T_2$, then $\tau(T_1) \subseteq \tau(T_2)$.
 (d) If $\tau(T)$ is a complete Boolean algebra, then $\tau^2(T) = \tau(T)$.
 (e) $\tau(T_1 \wedge T_2) \subseteq \tau(T_1) \wedge \tau(T_2)$.
 (f) $\tau(T_1 \vee T_2) \supseteq \tau(T_1) \vee \tau(T_2)$.

The proofs are immediate. Note that in (d), it suffices that the space be countable. To see, e.g., that (e) is sharp, let T_1 and T_2 be the two Sierpiński (proper) topologies on a space of two points.

It is equally easy to define a map from Δ to Σ in exactly the same manner.

Definition. Let $\mu: \Delta \rightarrow \Sigma$ be given by $\mu(B) = \bigcap \{T \in \Sigma: B \subseteq T\}$. Since for any B in Δ , $B \subseteq P(X) \in \Sigma$, this is well-defined.

THEOREM 5. *The same results hold as in Theorem 4, when Δ and Σ are interchanged, and τ is replaced by μ everywhere.*

There are several unanswered questions concerning these maps, e.g., in parts (e) and (f) of Theorem 4, under what conditions will equality hold? Furthermore, since $P(X)$ is a complete Boolean algebra and the intersection of any family of complete Boolean algebras is a complete Boolean algebra, every topology T is contained in a unique smallest complete Boolean algebra, $A(T)$. For what T in Σ will the ascending chain:

$$T \rightarrow \tau(T) \rightarrow \mu\tau(T) \rightarrow \dots \rightarrow A(T)$$

terminate in a finite number of steps? For atomic topologies, ultraspaces, door spaces, and T_1 topologies (see Theorem 17 below), the chain terminates in not more than two steps. What about, e.g., extremally disconnected spaces?

6. Components. For each point p in the topological space (X, T) , let $C(p)$ be the T -component of p . Note that each component is closed and

$$\{C(p): p \in X\}$$

is a partition of X .

Definition. (a) Let $C[T]$ be the σ -algebra generated by $\{C(p): p \in X\}$. Note: $C[T] \subseteq \tau(T)$.

(b) The “component topology” T_c of T is given by the base

$$\{\emptyset, C(p): p \in X\}.$$

Note: $T_c \subseteq \mu C[T]$.

THEOREM 6. *If T has a finite number of components, or if T is locally connected, then $C[T] \subseteq T$.*

Proof. In either case, each $C(p)$ in $C[T]$ is T -open as well as T -closed.

COROLLARY. *In these cases, T is a complete Boolean algebra if and only if $C[T] = \tau[T]$.*

THEOREM 7. *If $C[T] \subseteq T$ and T has at most a countable number of components, then $C[T]$ is the largest σ -algebra contained in T .*

Proof. Let $B \in \Delta$ and $B \subseteq T$. Then each $H \in B$ is closed and open in T . Let $p \in H$. Claim: $C(p) \subseteq H$. For suppose not. Then $H \cap C(p) \neq \emptyset$ and is closed and open in $C(p)$. Moreover, $(X \setminus H) \cap C(p) \neq \emptyset$ and is closed and open in $C(p)$. These disconnect $C(p)$, a contradiction. Hence, $H = \cup\{C(p) : p \in H\}$. Since this is a countable union, $H \in C[T]$. Hence, $B \subseteq C[T]$.

COROLLARY 1. *If $C[T]$ is the largest σ -algebra contained in T , then T and T_c are Borel-equivalent (see § 8 below).*

Proof. Since $C[T] \subseteq T$, then every component of T is open in T . Indeed, $C[T] \subseteq \mu C[T] = T_c \subseteq T \subseteq \tau(T)$.

Notice that if T is connected or if X is finite, then T has only a finite number of components.

COROLLARY 2. *If T is a connected topology, then it contains no proper σ -algebras.*

In (5), it was shown that if X is finite and T has K -matrix (a_{ij}) , then $\tau(T)$ has K -matrix (b_{ij}) , where $b_{ij} = 1$ if and only if $a_{ij} = a_{ji} = 1$.

COROLLARY 3. *If X is finite and T has K -matrix (a_{ij}) , then $C[T]$ has K -matrix (c_{ij}) , where $c_{ij} = 1$ if and only if $a_{ij} = 1$ or $a_{ii} = 1$.*

7. Atoms and anti-atoms in Δ .

THEOREM 8. *Δ is an atomically generated lattice.*

Proof. Let $\{\emptyset, X\} \neq B \in \Delta$. If $\emptyset \neq A \in B$, then clearly

$$B_A = \{\emptyset, X, A, X \setminus A\} \subseteq B$$

and is atomic. Claim: $B = \vee\{B_A : \emptyset \neq A \in B\}$. For $\cup B_A \subseteq B$, thus $\vee B_A \subseteq B$. If $\emptyset \neq C \in B$, then $C \in B_C \subseteq \vee B_A$. Therefore, $B \subseteq \vee B_A$.

THEOREM 9. *If B is a proper complete Boolean algebra over X , then B must miss at least two singletons.*

Proof. Suppose the contrary. Suppose that $\{p\}$ is the only singleton not in B . Then B contains all other singletons, hence contains their union, and also the complement of that union, namely, $\{p\}$. Hence, B contains all singletons,

and is closed under arbitrary union. But then B must be $P(X)$, contradicting B proper.

COROLLARY. *If X is a countable space, and B is a proper σ -algebra over X , then B must miss at least two singletons.*

Definition. Suppose $\text{card}(X) \geq 3$ and that $p \neq q$ in X . Suppose that $\{p, q\} \subseteq A$. Then we let $G(p, q, U(A)) = P(X \setminus \{p, q\}) \cup U(A)$, where $U(A)$ is the family of all subsets of X which contain A . If $A = \{p, q\}$, write $G(p, q, U(p, q))$.

THEOREM 10. $G(p, q, U(A))$ is a principal topology.

Proof. $X \in U(A)$ and $\emptyset \in P(X \setminus \{p, q\})$. Clearly, each of P and U are closed under arbitrary unions and arbitrary intersections. Let $D \in P$ and $E \in U$. Then $D \cup E \in U$ and $D \cap E \subseteq D$, thus $D \cap E \in P$. Hence, G is closed under arbitrary unions and arbitrary intersections.

THEOREM 11. *The σ -algebras generated by the $G(p, q, U(A))$ are of the form $G(p, q, U(p, q))$, and are anti-atomic in the lattice of complete Boolean algebras.*

Proof. It follows from the definition that $G(p, q, U(p, q))$ is a σ -algebra, and contains $G(p, q, U(A))$. Notice that for any set B , $\{p, q\} \subseteq B \subseteq A$, we see that $X \setminus B \in P(X \setminus \{p, q\}) \subseteq G(p, q, U(A))$. Therefore, the smallest family containing $G(p, q, U(A))$ and closed under complementation is $G(p, q, U(p, q))$. Hence, this is the generated σ -algebra.

Now suppose that B is a complete Boolean algebra and

$$G(p, q, U(p, q)) \subset B \subseteq P(X)$$

(in this paper, \subset denotes proper containment). However,

$$P(X) \setminus G(p, q, U(p, q)) = \{H: H \subseteq X, p \in H \text{ and } q \notin H\} \cup \{K: K \subseteq X, q \in K \text{ and } p \notin K\}.$$

Thus, B must contain at least one of these, say H with $p \in H$. Since $H \setminus \{p\} \in P(X \setminus \{p, q\})$, we find $\{p\} \in B$. Therefore, B contains all but at most one singleton, and $B = P(X)$.

COROLLARY. *If X is countable, the σ -algebras generated by the $G(p, q, U(A))$ are anti-atomic in Δ .*

LEMMA. $G(p, q, U(p, q)) = G(p, U(q)) \cap G(q, U(p))$.

The proof is immediate upon expanding by the definitions. Notice that $G(p, U(q))$ and $G(q, U(p))$ are principal ultraspaces in Σ .

THEOREM 12. *The lattice of complete Boolean algebras is anti-atomically generated.*

Proof. By the corollary to Theorem 2, if B is a complete Boolean algebra,

then it is a principal topology. Hence, $B = \bigwedge \{G(x, U(y)) : B \subseteq G(x, U(y))\}$.
 Claim: if $B \subseteq G(x, U(y))$, then $B \subseteq G(y, U(x))$, thus

$$B \subseteq G(x, U(y)) \cap G(y, U(x)) = G(x, y, U(x, y)).$$

For, let $T \in B$. Then $X \setminus T \in B$, thus $x \notin X \setminus T$ or $y \in X \setminus T$. Hence, $x \in T$ or $y \in T$, and $T \in G(y, U(x))$.

COROLLARY. *On a countable space, the lattice Δ of σ -algebras is anti-atomically generated.*

THEOREM 13. *If $\text{card}(X) = n$, then Δ has precisely $n(n - 1)/2$ anti-atoms.*

Note the anti-atom $G(x_i, x_j, U(x_i, x_j))$ has K -matrix (a_{km}) , where $a_{kk} = 1$, $a_{ij} = a_{ji} = 1$, and $a_{km} = 0$ otherwise. Call a matrix of this type an i - j elementary K -matrix. It is easy to decompose a symmetric K -matrix as the meet of its i - j elementary K -matrices; e.g.,

$$\begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \wedge \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \wedge \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

8. A sublattice of Δ . In § 5, given a topology T on X , $\tau(T)$ was defined to be the generated σ -algebra. In a previous paper (5), I defined two topologies to be “Borel-equivalent”, $T_1 \sim T_2$, if $\tau(T_1) = \tau(T_2)$.

It follows from a result of Sharp (6), that on a finite space, columns in a K -matrix can be interpreted as the closures of the points. In (5), it was shown that if (a_{ij}) is a K -matrix, then $|a_{ij}| = 0$ or 1, and $|a_{ij}| = 1$ if and only if (a_{ij}) generates the K -matrix of the power set $P(X)$.

Noting that distinct points have distinct closures with respect to a topology over a finite space if and only if the K -matrix of the topology has pairwise distinct columns, we deduced that over a finite space, topology T is Borel-equivalent to $P(X)$ if and only if T is T_0 .

My thanks are due to the referee for his remark that the same result holds true if the space is countable, and indeed obtain a more general result.

THEOREM 14. *Over an arbitrary space, if $T \sim P(X)$, then T is T_0 .*

Proof. Suppose that T is not T_0 . Then there are distinct points p and q such that each open set containing p contains q and vice versa. Consider the σ -algebra $G(p, q, U(p, q))$. Plainly, $T \subseteq G(p, q, U(p, q))$, hence

$$T \subseteq \tau(T) \subseteq G(p, q, U(p, q)) \subset P(X).$$

Hence, $\tau(T) \neq P(X)$ and T and $P(X)$ are not Borel equivalent.

COROLLARY. *If X is countable, then $T \sim P(X)$ if and only if T is T_0 .*

Proof. Suppose that T is T_0 and let $p \in X$. Write $X \setminus \{p\} = \{q_n: n = 1, 2, \dots\}$. Then for each n , there exists U_n (which is either open or closed in T) such that $p \in U_n$ and $q_n \notin U_n$. Note that $U_n \in \tau(T)$. Hence, $\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} U_n = \{p\} \in \tau(T)$. This is true for each point of X , thus $\tau(T)$ contains all singletons and is closed under countable unions. Thus, $\tau(T) = P(X)$ and $T \sim P(X)$.

Note that the converse of the corollary is also true. If the space is uncountable, then there are certainly T_0 topologies which do not generate $P(X)$.

Definition. Let S_B be the family of all singletons in a σ -algebra B , let $S = S_{P(X)}$, and let W be the family of all σ -algebras B for which $S_B = S$.

THEOREM 15. *W is a complete sublattice of Δ , with the countable, co-countable σ -algebra as 0-element, and $P(X)$ as 1-element.*

Proof. Clearly, if $B \in W$, then the countable, co-countable σ -algebra is contained in B . Let $B, C \in W$. Then $S \subseteq B$ and $S \subseteq C$, hence, $S \subseteq B \cap C = B \wedge C$ and $S \subseteq B \cup C \subseteq B \vee C$. This argument clearly holds for arbitrary families of elements of W .

COROLLARY. *On a countable space, the only element of W is $P(X)$.*

THEOREM 16. *If T is a T_1 topology, then $\tau(T) \in W$. Moreover, the 0-element of W is generated by the 0-element of the lattice of T_1 topologies, namely the co-finite topology.*

THEOREM 17. *If T is a T_1 topology, then $\mu\tau(T) = P(X)$.*

Proof. If T is T_1 , then each point is closed. Hence, every singleton is an element of $\tau(T)$, and so of $\mu\tau(T)$. However, $\mu\tau(T)$ is a topology. Thus, $\mu\tau(T) = P(X)$.

REFERENCES

1. O. Fröhlich, *Das Halbordnungssystem der topologischen Räume auf einer Menge*, Math. Ann. 156 (1964), 79–95.
2. P. J. Kelley, *General topology* (Van Nostrand, New York, 1955).
3. V. Krishnamurthy, *On the number of topologies on a finite set*, Amer. Math. Monthly 73 (1966), 154–157.
4. M. E. Munroe, *Introduction to measure and integration* (Addison-Wesley, Reading, Mass., 1953).
5. M. Rayburn, *On the Borel fields of a finite set*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 19 (1968), 885–889.
6. H. Sharp, *Homeomorphisms on finite sets*, Math. Mag. 40 (1967), 152–155.
7. A. K. Steiner, *The lattice of topologies: structure and complementation*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 121 (1966), 379–398.

State University of New York at Geneseo,
Geneseo, New York;
The University of Kentucky,
Lexington, Kentucky