

# PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

*Official Journal of the Philosophy of  
Science Association*



VOLUME 63, NUMBER 4

**December, 1996**

# PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

JOURNAL OF THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE ASSOCIATION

## EDITORIAL BOARD:

PHILIP KITCHER, *Editor-in-Chief*

PAUL CHURCHLAND, PATRICIA KITCHER, and PAUL TELLER, *Associate Editors*

PETER ACHINSTEIN	GARY GUTTING	THOMAS NICKLES
FRANK ARNTZENIUS	IAN HACKING	ILKKA NIINILUOTO
PETER ASQUITH	WILLIAM HARPER	JOHN NORTON
JOHN BEATTY	GARY HATFIELD	ALEXANDER ROSENBERG
WILLIAM BECHTEL	GEOFFREY HELLMAN	MICHAEL RUSE
JEFFREY BUB	DAVID HULL	KENNETH SCHAFFNER
RICHARD BURIAN	PAUL HUMPHREYS	DUDLEY SHAPERE
ROBERT BUTTS	HENRY KYBURG	LAWRENCE SKLAR
NANCY CARTWRIGHT	LARRY LAUDAN	BRIAN SKYRMS
LINDLEY DARDEN	JAMES LENNOX	ELLIOTT SOBER
WILLIAM DEMOPOULOS	HELEN LONGINO	MIRIAM SOLOMON
JOHN EARMAN	PETER MACHAMER	STEPHEN STICH
ARTHUR FINE	PATRICK MAHER	FREDERICK SUPPE
JERRY FODOR	DAVID MALAMENT	PATRICK SUPPES
MICHAEL FRIEDMAN	TIM MAUDLIN	BAS VAN FRAASSEN
RONALD GIERE	DEBORAH MAYO	C. KENNETH WATERS
CLARK GLYMOUR	SANDRA MITCHELL	LINDA WESSELS
RICHARD GRANDY	MARGARET MORRISON	JAMES WOODWARD

## ASSISTANT EDITOR:

Stanley Walens

## EDITORIAL ASSISTANT:

Laura Perini

## GOVERNING BOARD OF THE ASSOCIATION

Abner Shimony, President (1996)

Michael Friedman, President-Elect (1996)

Ronald N. Giere, Past-President (1996)

John Beatty (1996)

Richard Grandy (1997)

Daniel Hausman (1997)

Henry Kyburg (1997)

Helen Longino (1996)

Jane Maienschein (1996)

Nancy Nersessian (1996)

Barbara Von Eckardt (1997)

## EXECUTIVE SECRETARY:

GEORGE GALE

## CONTENTS\*

<b>THE SCIENTIST AS CHILD, ALISON GOPNIK</b> .....	485
<b>SCIENCE AND CORE KNOWLEDGE, SUSAN CAREY AND ELIZABETH SPELKE</b> .....	515
<b>SCIENCE AS CHILD'S PLAY: TALES FROM THE CRIB, ARTHUR FINE</b> .....	534
<b>THE SCIENTIST AS ADULT, RONALD N. GIERE</b> .....	538
<b>CHILD'S PLAY, NANCY NERSESSIAN</b> .....	542
<b>COMMENTARY ON ALISON GOPNIK'S "THE SCIENTIST AS CHILD," MIRIAM SOLOMON</b> .....	547
<b>A REPLY TO COMMENTATORS, ALISON GOPNIK</b> .....	552
<b>THE RETURN OF THE GROUP, KIM STERELNY</b> .....	562
<b>ON BECOMING, RELATIVITY, AND NONSEPARABILITY, MAURO DORATO</b> .....	585
<b>FREUD'S 'TALLY' ARGUMENT, PLACEBO CONTROL TREATMENTS, AND THE EVALUATION OF PSYCHOTHERAPY, JOHN GREENWOOD</b> .....	605
<b>EMPIRICAL EVALUATIONS OF <i>THEORETICAL EXPLANATIONS</i> OF PSYCHOTHERAPEUTIC EFFICACY: A REPLY TO GREENWOOD, ADOLF GRÜNBAUM</b> .....	622
<b>THE EVALUATION OF PSYCHOTHERAPY: A REPLY TO GREENWOOD, EDWARD ERWIN</b> .....	642
<b>WAYNE, HORWICH, AND EVIDENTIAL DIVERSITY, BRANDEN FITELSON</b> .....	652
<b>BAYESIANISM AND DIVERSE EVIDENCE: A REPLY TO ANDREW WAYNE, WAYNE C. MYRVOLD</b> .....	661
<b>BAYESIANISM AND THE VALUE OF DIVERSE EVIDENCE, DANIEL STEEL</b> .....	666
<b>REFEREES FOR <i>PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE</i></b> .....	675
<b>INDEX TO VOLUME 63</b> .....	677

**Philosophy of Science** (ISSN 0031-8248) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by The University of Chicago Press, 5720 S. Woodlawn Avenue, Chicago, IL 60637.

Periodicals postage paid at Chicago, IL and at additional mailing points.

**Postmaster:** Send address changes to: *Philosophy of Science*, The University of Chicago Press, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637.

#### **Membership and Subscription Rates**

Annual membership in the Philosophy of Science Association, which includes the journal and supplement, is graduated based on income: income below \$40,000 is \$55; \$40,000–\$49,999 is \$65; \$50,000–\$59,999 is \$75; and \$60,000 or above is \$85. Student rate is \$25 (photocopy of valid ID must accompany subscription order). Subscriptions for institutions in North America are \$84.00 and \$89 elsewhere. Payment in U.S. currency only. Single copy rates are \$15 for individuals and \$21 for institutions. Canadian residents, please add 7% GST to all North American rates listed above. Subscription inquiries should be addressed to: *Philosophy of Science*, The University of Chicago Press, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637, FAX (312) 753-0811, E-mail: [subscriptions@journals.uchicago.edu](mailto:subscriptions@journals.uchicago.edu)

Volumes 1–55 available from Periodical Services Co., 11 Main Street, Germantown, NY 12526, Phone (518) 537-4700 or FAX (518) 537-5899. Volumes in microfilm available from UMI, 300 N. Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106.

#### **Editorial Correspondence**

Send all editorial correspondence to *Philosophy of Science*, Department of Philosophy–0302, University of California, San Diego, 9500 Gilman Drive, La Jolla, CA 92093. Information regarding submission of manuscript can be found on the inside back cover of every issue.

#### **Copying Beyond Fair Use**

The code on the first page of an article in this journal indicates the copyright owner's consent that copies of the article may be made beyond those permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law provided that copies are made only for personal or internal use, or for the personal or internal use of specific clients, and provided that the copier pay the stated per-copy fee through the Copyright Clearance Center, 27 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970. To request permission for other kinds of copying, such as copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale, kindly write to Permissions Department, The University of Chicago Press, 5801 S. Ellis Ave., Chicago, IL 60637.

Articles appearing in *Philosophy of Science* are abstracted or indexed in *Arts and Humanities Citation Index*; *Biological Abstracts*; *Bulletin Signalétique 519*; *Current Contents/Arts and Humanities*; *Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences*; *Current Index to Statistics*; *Humanities Index*; *Index to Book Reviews in the Humanities*; *Isis Critical Bibliography*; *Language & Language Behavior Abstracts*; *Mathematical Reviews*; *Philosopher's Index*; *Philosophie*; *Psychological Abstracts*; *Repertoire Bibliographique de la Philosophie*; *Social Sciences Citation Index*; *Sociological Abstracts*.

© 1996 by the Philosophy of Science Association. All rights reserved.



## **PSA PRIZES FOR YOUNG SCHOLARS**

The Philosophy of Science Association is happy to announce that the prizes for young scholars will again be offered in 1997. The first of these is for an essay written by a graduate student; the second is for an essay by someone who has received the Ph.D. within the last five years. Essays may be on any topic in the philosophy of science, and should be submitted to the Editor-in-Chief of *Philosophy of Science* before September 1 1997. The essays entered will be judged by a committee of three senior members of the PSA.

Winners in each category will receive \$250, and the winning essays will be published in *Philosophy of Science*. A person who is eligible to enter may submit for consideration an essay already accepted for publication in *Philosophy of Science* within the period September 1 1996 to September 1 1997. When the winning essays are published, they will be accompanied by an announcement to the effect that they were judged the best in this year's competition.

The financial support for the prizes has been made possible by the generosity of past presidents of the PSA.

### **PRIZE WINNERS 1996**

The prize for an essay submitted by a graduate student was awarded to Cameron Shelly for "Visual Abductive Reasoning in Archeology", which appeared in *Philosophy of Science* in June 1996.

The prize for an essay submitted by a recent Ph.D. was awarded to Larry Shapiro for "A Clearer Vision", scheduled to appear in *Philosophy of Science* in March 1997.