

WINTER 1988

Slavic Review

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF SOVIET AND
EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

DISCUSSION

Sheila Fitzpatrick: *The Bolsheviks' Dilemma: Class, Culture, and Politics in Early Soviet Years*

Ronald Grigor Suny: *Class and State in the Early Soviet Period: A Reply to Sheila Fitzpatrick*

Daniel Orlovsky: *Social History and Its Categories*

Sheila Fitzpatrick: *Reply to Suny and Orlovsky*

ARTICLES

Ewa Morawska: *On Barriers to Pluralism in Pluralist Poland*

Olga Matich: *Vasilii Aksenov and the Literature of Convergence: Ostrov Krym as Self-Criticism*

Rodney D. Bohac: *The Mir and the Military Draft*

Robert Blobaum: *The Revolution of 1905–1907 and the Crisis of Polish Catholicism*

Jelena Milojković-Djurić: *The Roles of Jovan Skerlić, Stevan Mokranjac, and Paja Jovanović in Serbian Cultural History, 1900–1914*

NOTES AND COMMENTS

Vasa D. Mihailovich: *Aphorism in Contemporary Serbian Literature*

Anatoly Vishevsky: *Unconventional Literature in a Society of Conventions*

REVIEW ARTICLES

Alexander Yanov: *Perestroika and Its American Critics*

Alexander Zholkovsky: *Intertextuality, Its Content and Discontents*

EDITOR

SIDNEY MONAS

BOOK REVIEW EDITOR	DANIEL T. ORLOVSKY
ASSOCIATE EDITOR	MARY JO POWELL
ASSISTANT EDITORS	SHOSHANAH DIETZ JOSEPH LIRO
EDITORIAL ASSISTANT	BEJOU MERRY

HONORARY EDITORS: Frederick Barghoorn • Vera S. Dunham • John N. Hazard • Demitri B. Shimkin • René Wellek

EDITORIAL BOARD: Kendall E. Bailes, *University of California, Irvine* • George W. Breslauer, *University of California, Berkeley* • Malcolm Hamrick Brown, *Indiana University* • Istvan Deak, *Columbia University* • Caryl Emerson, *Princeton University* • Maurice Friedberg, *University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign* • Keith Hitchins, *University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign* • James Michael Holquist, *Yale University* • D. Barton Johnson, *University of California, Santa Barbara* • Robert A. Maguire, *Columbia University* • Hans Rogger, *University of California, Los Angeles* • William G. Rosenberg, *University of Michigan* • H. Gordon Skilling, *University of Toronto* • Richard Stites, *Georgetown University* • Victor Terras, *Brown University* • Alexander Vucinich, *University of Pennsylvania* • Piotr S. Wandycz, *Yale University*

CONSULTANTS ON SOVIET AND EAST EUROPEAN BOOKS: George Barany, *University of Denver* • Alexandra L. Batalden, *Arizona State University* • John D. Bell, *University of Maryland, Baltimore County* • Imre Boba, *University of Washington* • Marianna Tax Choldin, *University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign* • F.W. Galan, *Georgia Institute of Technology* • Adam A. Hetnal, *Vanderbilt University* • Keith Hitchins, *University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign* • Charles Jelavich, *Indiana University* • Owen V. Johnson, *Indiana University* • Andrejs Plakans, *Iowa State University* • Gale Stokes, *Rice University* • Orest Subtelny, *York University, Ontario* • Ronald Grigor Suny, *University of Michigan*

The editors assume no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion made by contributors.

The *Slavic Review* (ISSN 0037-6779) (formerly *The American Slavic and East European Review*) is published quarterly by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc., and is sent to all Association members. Members also receive the *AAASS Newsletter*. Membership is open to individuals interested in the advancement of Slavic studies (including study of the non-Slavic peoples of Eastern Europe and the USSR), and applications for membership are accepted by the national headquarters of the AAASS, 128 Encina Commons, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305; (415) 723-9668.

Membership dues: salary \$10,000 to \$19,999—\$30.00; \$20,000 to \$29,999—\$35.00; \$30,000 to \$39,999—\$40.00; \$40,000 to \$49,999—\$45.00; over \$50,000—\$50.00. Joint members with one subscription to the *Slavic Review*, add \$10.00 to dues of higher paid member. Dues for students, emeriti, or those with salaries under \$10,000 are \$20.00. New Affiliate (*Newsletter* only): \$15.00. Subscriptions without membership are \$45.00. Single current issues and back issues to subscribers are \$15.00; back issues for members are \$10.00 each. Correspondence regarding membership, subscriptions, changes of address, or items for the *Newsletter* should be sent to the AAASS headquarters in Stanford. Advertising inquiries should also be directed to the AAASS office.

Articles, books for review, and correspondence concerning editorial matters should be sent to the *Slavic Review*, P.O. Box 8180, University of Texas, Austin, Texas 78713; (512) 471-5898. Building address is Geography 106B. Technical requirements for manuscript submissions are given on the inside back cover.

Published by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Composition by G&S Typesetters, Austin, Texas. Printed by Heffernan Press, Inc., Worcester, Massachusetts. Second-class postage paid at Palo Alto, CA and additional mailing office. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Slavic Review*, c/o AAASS, 128 Encina Commons, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305.

Copyright © 1988 by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc.

Slavic Review

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF SOVIET AND
EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

VOLUME 47 NUMBER 4 • WINTER 1988

DISCUSSION

- The Bolsheviks' Dilemma: Class, Culture, and Politics
in Early Soviet Years 599
SHEILA FITZPATRICK
- Class and State in the Early Soviet Period: A Reply to Sheila Fitzpatrick 614
RONALD GRIGOR SUNY
- Social History and Its Categories 620
DANIEL ORLOVSKY
- Reply to Suny and Orlovsky 624
SHEILA FITZPATRICK

ARTICLES

- On Barriers to Pluralism in Pluralist Poland 627
EWA MORAWSKA
- Vasilii Aksenov and the Literature of Convergence: *Ostrov Krym* as Self-
Criticism 642
OLGA MATICH
- The Mir and the Military Draft 652
RODNEY D. BOHAC
- The Revolution of 1905–1907 and the Crisis of Polish Catholicism 667
ROBERT BLOBAUM

- The Roles of Jovan Skerlić, Stevan Mokranjac, and Paja Jovanović
in Serbian Cultural History, 1900–1914 687
JELENA MILOJKOVIĆ-DJURIĆ

NOTES AND COMMENTS

- Aphorism in Contemporary Serbian Literature 702
VASA D. MIHAILOVICH
- Unconventional Literature in a Society of Conventions 709
ANATOLY VISHEVSKY

REVIEW ARTICLES

- Perestroika* and Its American Critics 716
ALEXANDER YANOV
- Intertextuality, Its Content and Discontents 726
ALEXANDER ZHOLKOVSKY

BOOK REVIEWS

- Robert C. Tucker, *Political Culture and Leadership in Soviet Russia: From Lenin to Gorbachev* (Robert McNeal) 730
- S. G. Wheatcroft and R. W. Davies, eds., *Materials for a Balance of the Soviet National Economy, 1928–1930* (Richard E. Ericson) 731
- David R. Egan and Melinda A. Egan, *Russian Autocrats from Ivan the Great to the Fall of the Romanov Dynasty: An Annotated Bibliography of the English Language Sources to 1985* (Richard Wortman) 732
- Robert H. McNeal, *Tsar and Cossack, 1855–1914* (Bruce Menning) 733
- Andrzej Walicki, *The Legal Philosophies of Russian Liberalism* (Marc Raeff) 734
- Henry Reichman, *Railwaymen and Revolution: Russia, 1905* (William Boncher) 735
- A. V. Ignat'ev, *Vneshniaia politika Rossii v 1905–1907 gg.* (Abraham Ascher) 737
- Daniel H. Kaiser, ed., *The Workers' Revolution in Russia, 1917: The View from Below* (Peter Kenez) 738
- Richard Abraham, *Alexander Kerensky: The First Love of the Revolution* (Donald J. Raleigh) 739
- Leonard Schapiro and Peter Reddaway, eds., *Lenin: The Man, the Theorist, the Leader—a Reappraisal* (Robert C. Williams) 740
- Boris Sapir, ed., *From the Archives of L. O. Dan: Selected, Annotated, and with an Outline of L. O. Dan's Biography* (Vladimir Brovkin) 740

E. A. Rees, <i>State Control in Soviet Russia: The Rise and Fall of the Workers' and Peasants' Inspectorate, 1920–34</i> (Lewis H. Siegelbaum)	741
Martin Kitchen, <i>British Policy towards the Soviet Union during the Second World War</i> (Albert Resis)	742
Fraser J. Harbutt, <i>The Iron Curtain: Churchill, America, and the Origins of the Cold War</i> (Cyril E. Black)	744
Stephen Shenfield, <i>The Nuclear Predicament: Explorations in Soviet Ideology</i> (Gerard Holden)	745
Augusto Varas, ed., <i>Soviet-Latin American Relations in the 1980s</i> (Cole Blasier)	745
Mohrez Mahmoud El Hussini, <i>Soviet-Egyptian Relations, 1945–1985</i> (Stephen Page)	746
Douglas Pike, <i>Vietnam and the Soviet Union: Anatomy of an Alliance</i> (Robert C. Horn)	747
Heinz Timmerman, <i>The Decline of the World Communist Movement: Moscow, Beijing, and Communist Parties in the West</i> (Max Mote)	748
James R. Millar, ed., <i>Politics, Work, and Daily Life in the USSR: A Survey of Former Soviet Citizens</i> (Gertrude E. Schroeder)	749
F. J. M. Feldbrugge, ed., <i>The Distinctiveness of Soviet Law</i> (Eugene Huskey)	751
A. R. Luria, <i>The Man with a Shattered World: The History of a Brain Wound</i> ; A. R. Luria, <i>The Mind of a Mnemonist: A Little Book about a Vast Memory</i> (James V. Wertsch)	752
Dimitry V. Pospelovsky, <i>A History of Marxist-Leninist Atheism and Soviet Antireligious Policies: Volume 1 of a History of Soviet Atheism in Theory and Practice, and the Believer</i> (Dennis J. Dunn)	753
Lincoln Gordon et al., <i>Eroding Empire: Western Relations with Eastern Europe</i> (Thomas A. Baylis)	754
Fred Singleton, ed., <i>Environmental Problems in the Soviet Union and Eastern Europe</i> (James Critchlow)	755
Vojtech Mastny, ed., <i>Soviet/East European Survey, 1985–1986: Selected Research and Analysis from Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty</i> (Daniel N. Nelson)	756
Jan Kozik, <i>The Ukrainian National Movement in Galicia: 1815–1849</i> (Frank E. Sysyn)	757
Angela T. Pienkos, <i>The Imperfect Autocrat: Grand Duke Constantine Pavlovich and the Polish Congress Kingdom</i> (W. Bruce Lincoln)	759
Henry Rollet, <i>La Pologne au XXe siècle</i> (M. K. Dziewanowski)	760
Andrzej Chojnowski, <i>Piłsudzczy u władzy: Dzieje bezpartyjnego bloku współpracy z rządem</i> (Maria Pasterska)	761

Stanislav J. Kirschbaum and Anne C. R. Roman, eds., <i>Reflections on Slovak History</i> (Victor S. Mamatey)	762
Tatiana Ivantyšinová, <i>Česi a Slováci v ideológii ruských slavianofilov (40.–60. roky XIX. storočia)</i> (Theodore Weeks)	763
Karel Kaplan, <i>The Short March: The Communist Takeover in Czechoslovakia, 1945–1948</i> (Eva Schmidt-Hartmann)	764
Derek Beales, <i>Joseph II. 1. In the Shadow of Maria Theresa, 1714–1780</i> (Charles Ingrao)	765
Stella Alexander, <i>The Triple Myth: A Life of Archbishop Alojzije Stepinac</i> (Gale Stokes)	766
Toivo U. Raun, <i>Estonia and the Estonians</i> (Margareta O. Thompson)	767
Bernice Glatzer Rosenthal, ed., <i>Nietzsche in Russia</i> (Irene Masing-Delic)	768
Victor V. Vinogradov, <i>Gogol and the Natural School</i> (Hugh McLean)	769
Louise Smoluchowski, <i>Lev and Sonya: The Story of the Tolstoy Marriage</i> (Margareta O. Thompson)	770
Barbara Heldt, <i>Terrible Perfection: Women and Russian Literature</i> (Barbara Alpern Engel)	771
J. A. E. Curtis, <i>Bulgakov's Last Decade: The Writer as Hero</i> (Laura D. Weeks)	772
Wendy Rosslyn, <i>The Prince, the Fool and the Nunnery: The Religious Theme in the Early Poetry of Anna Akhmatova</i> (Uliana Gabara)	773
Nikolai Lvov and Ivan Prach, <i>A Collection of Russian Folk Songs</i> (Robert Oldani)	775
Alexander Kemensky, <i>Martiros Saryan: Paintings, Watercolors, Drawings, Book Illustrations, Theatrical Design</i> (John E. Bowl)	776
BOOKS RECEIVED	778
REFERENCE BOOKS OF 1986–1987: A SELECTION	784
LETTERS	793
NEWS OF THE PROFESSION	794
INDEX	797