



american antiquity

JOURNAL OF THE SOCIETY FOR AMERICAN ARCHAEOLOGY

VOLUME 54 NUMBER 3

JULY 1989

OFFICERS OF THE SOCIETY FOR AMERICAN ARCHAEOLOGY

President: JEREMY A. SABLOFF, Department of Anthropology, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, PA 15260.

President-elect: PRUDENCE M. RICE, Florida Museum of Natural History, Department of Anthropology, University of Florida, Gainesville, FL 32611.

Secretary: LYNNE GOLDSTEIN, Department of Anthropology, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, WI 53201.

Treasurer: MARK P. LEONE, Department of Anthropology, University of Maryland, College Park, MD 20742.

Editor-elect: J. JEFFERSON REID, Department of Anthropology, University of Arizona, Tucson, AZ 85721.

Editor: W. RAYMOND WOOD, Department of Anthropology, University of Missouri, Columbia, MO 65211.

Executive Board Members: ROBERT L. BETTINGER, Department of Anthropology, University of California-Davis, Davis, CA 95616; MARGARET W. CONKEY, Department of Anthropology, University of California, Berkeley, CA 94720; BRIAN M. FAGAN, Department of Anthropology, University of California, Santa Barbara, CA 93106; MARK J. LYNOTT, Midwest Archeological Center, National Park Service, Federal Building, Room 474, 100 Centennial Mall North, Lincoln, NE 68508.

Executive Director: JEROME A. MILLER, Society for American Archaeology, 808 17th St., N.W., Suite 200, Washington, DC 20006.

EDITORIAL STAFF OF AMERICAN ANTIQUITY

Editor: W. RAYMOND WOOD, Department of Anthropology, University of Missouri, Columbia, MO 65211.

Associate Editor: MICHAEL J. O'BRIEN, Department of Anthropology, University of Missouri, Columbia, MO 65211.

Associate Editor for Reviews and Book Notes: SUSAN C. VEHIK, Department of Anthropology, University of Oklahoma, Norman, OK 73019.

Associate Editor for Current Research: THOMAS F. LYNCH, Department of Anthropology, Cornell University, Ithaca, NY 14853.

Associate Editor for Obituaries: LARRY J. ZIMMERMAN, Department of Social Behavior, University of South Dakota, Vermillion, SD 57069.

Consulting Editor for Mathematics and Statistics: STEPHEN E. PLOG, Department of Anthropology, University of Virginia, Charlottesville, VA 22903.

Assistant Editor: TERESITA MAJEWSKI.

Editorial Assistant: CHRISTOPHER B. PULLIAM.

AMERICAN ANTIQUITY (ISSN 0002-7316) is published quarterly in January, April, July, and October. Subscription is by membership in the Society for American Archaeology, 808 17th St., N.W., Suite 200, Washington, DC 20006. Annual dues for individual U.S. and Canadian members are \$50.00, institutional subscribers \$75.00, students and retired (over 65), \$25.00, foreign members \$40.00. Annual membership dues include \$25.00 for the subscription to *American Antiquity*. Spouses of members are eligible for joint memberships at \$10.00 per year (subscription not included). *American Antiquity* is not available for exchange. Address requests for individual or institutional memberships, instructions for changes of address, and orders for back issues to: Society for American Archaeology, 808 17th St., N.W., Suite 200, Washington, DC 20006. Claims for non-receipt and for damaged copies must be made within 90 days (U.S.) or 180 days (non-U.S.) of the publication date for free replacement. Non-U.S. deliveries cannot be guaranteed; non-U.S. members and subscribers may purchase replacement copies at a 20% discount. *American Antiquity* is printed at The Allen Press, Lawrence, Kansas 66044.

Second class postage paid at Washington, DC and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *American Antiquity*, % Society for American Archaeology, 808 17th St., N.W., Suite 200, Washington, DC 20006.

NOTICE TO AUTHORS

American Antiquity publishes papers on the archaeology of the Western hemisphere and closely related subjects. Material for the Articles, Reports, Forum, and Comments sections should be submitted to the Editor, publications for review to the Associate Editor for Reviews and Book Notes, and information for Current Research to the Associate Editor for Current Research. Authors should submit an original and two copies of their manuscripts. A detailed guide to stylistic and technical matters of manuscript preparation appeared in April, 1983 (vol. 48, no. 2).

AMERICAN ANTIQUITY

VOLUME 54 NUMBER 3

JULY 1989

W. Raymond Wood, *Editor*

Associate Editors: Susan C. Vehik (*Reviews and Book Notes*),
Thomas F. Lynch (*Current Research*), Larry J. Zimmerman (*Obituaries*),
and Michael J. O'Brien

Assistant Editor: Teresita Majewski
Editorial Assistant: Christopher B. Pulliam

CONTENTS

Editor's Corner	<i>W. Raymond Wood</i>	457
1989 SAA Distinguished Service Award		458
1989 Fryxell Award for Interdisciplinary Research		461
OBITUARIES		
Claude Earle Smith, Jr., 1922–1987	<i>Richard A. Krause</i>	463
Garland F. Grabert, 1923–1987	<i>Linda Amy Kimball</i>	468
ARTICLES		
Why Don't We Know When the First People Came to North America?	<i>David J. Meltzer</i>	471
Resource Specialization, Population Growth, and Agricultural Production in the American Southwest	<i>Robert D. Leonard</i>	491
Chemistry and Paleodietary Research: No More Easy Answers	<i>Andrew Sillen, Judith C. Sealy, and Nikolaas J. van der Merwe</i>	504
REPORTS		
Obsidian Hydration Dating of Tecep Phase Occupation at Nohmul, Belize	<i>Norman Hammond</i>	513
Prehispanic Saltmaking in Belize: New Evidence	<i>J. Jefferson MacKinnon and Susan M. Kepecs</i>	522
The Antiquity of Tlingit Settlement on Admiralty Island, Southeast Alaska	<i>Madonna L. Moss, Jon M. Erlandson, and Robert Stuckenrath</i>	534
Prehistoric Diet in the Northern Southwest: Macroplant Remains from Four Corners Feces	<i>Paul E. Minnis</i>	543
Ancient Town and City Sites: A View from the Microscope	<i>Arlene Miller Rosen</i>	564
COMMENTS		
Effects of Temper on Strength of Ceramics: Response to Bronitsky and Hamer	<i>James K. Feathers</i>	579
Ceramics and Temper: A Response to Feathers	<i>Gordon Bronitsky</i>	589

American Antiquity is indexed in the *Humanities Index* and in *Anthropological Literature*. Articles appearing in this journal are annotated and indexed in *Historical Abstracts* and in *America: History and Life*.

Copyright © 1989 by the Society for American Archaeology. All rights reserved.

ISSN 0002-7316

A Reconsideration of Aboriginal Fishing Strategies in the Northern Great Lakes Region	<i>Susan Rapalje Martin</i>	594
Comments on "A Reconsideration of Aboriginal Fishing Strategies in the Northern Great Lakes Region" by Susan R. Martin	<i>Charles E. Cleland</i>	605
Inferring Fertility from Relative Mortality in Historically Controlled Cemetery Remains from Barbados	<i>Robert S. Corruccini, Elizabeth M. Brandon, and Jerome S. Handler</i>	609
Fertility in the Prehistoric Midwest: A Critique of Unifactorial Models	<i>Thomas D. Holland</i>	614
Paleodemographic Correlates of Fertility: A Reply to Corruccini, Brandon, and Handler and to Holland	<i>Lyle W. Konigsberg, Jane E. Buikstra, and Jill Bullington</i>	626
CURRENT RESEARCH, edited by Thomas F. Lynch Plains, Great Lakes, Southeast		637
REVIEWS AND BOOK NOTES, edited by Susan C. Vehik		
Reviews		
Hodder (editor): The Archaeology of Contextual Meanings	<i>Robert W. Preucel</i>	655
Schiffer: Formation Processes of the Archaeological Record	<i>John Rick</i>	656
Nash and Petraglia (editors): Natural Formation Processes and the Archaeological Record	<i>Bruce G. Gladfelter</i>	657
Ramenofsky: Vectors of Death: The Archaeology of European Contact	<i>J. Daniel Rogers</i>	658
Thornton: American Indian Holocaust and Survival: A Population History Since 1492	<i>Michael K. Trimble</i>	660
Graham, Semken, and Graham (editors): Late Quaternary Mammalian Biogeography and Environments of the Great Plains and Prairies	<i>Gary Haynes</i>	661
Pilgram: Predicting Archaeological Sites from Environmental Variables, A Mathematical Model for the Sierra Nevada Foothills, California	<i>Frank E. Bayham</i>	661
Griset (editor): Pottery of the Great Basin and Adjacent Areas	<i>Claude N. Warren</i>	662
Kane and Robinson (compilers): Dolores Archaeological Program: Anasazi Communities at Dolores: Middle Canyon Area	<i>F. E. Smiley</i>	663
Parry: Chipped Stone Tools in Formative Oaxaca, Mexico: Their Procurement, Production and Use	<i>Thomas R. Hester</i>	664
Fox: Maya Postclassic State Formation: Segmentary Lineage Migration in Advancing Frontiers	<i>Norman Hammond</i>	665
Robinson (editor): Interaction on the Southeast Mesoamerican Frontier: Prehistoric and Historic Honduras and El Salvador	<i>David M. Pendergast</i>	666
Núñez and Meggers (editors): Investigaciones Paleoindias al Sur de la Línea Ecuatorial	<i>Luis Borrero</i>	667
Denevan, Mathewson, and Knapp (editors): Pre-Hispanic Agricultural Fields in the Andean Region	<i>Jonathan D. Kent</i>	668
Rowe (editor): The Junius B. Bird Conference on Andean Textiles	<i>Jenna Tedrick Kuttruff</i>	669

Book Notes

Basketry and Miscellaneous Perishable Artifacts from Walpi Pueblo, Arizona; An Archeological Survey in the James Fork Watershed, LeFlore County, Oklahoma; Prehistoric Rock Art of the Cross Timbers Management Unit, East Central Oklahoma: An Introductory Study; Seminole Canyon: The Art and the Archeology; The Foreign Impact on Lowland Mayan Language and Script; Archaeological Investigations in the Northern Maya Highlands, Guatemala: Interaction and the Development of Maya Civilization; Cylindrical English Wine and Beer Bottles 1735–1850; The Soldier Off Duty: Domestic Aspects of Military Life at Fort Chambly Under the French Regime as Revealed by Archaeological Objects; Excavations at Fort Mackinac, 1980–1982: The Provision Storehouse; The Scientific Study of Flint and Chert, Proceedings of the Fourth International Flint Symposium Held at Brighton Polytechnic 10–15 April 1983; Excavations at Sitagroi, a Prehistoric Village in Northeast Greece, Volume 1

669

The cover illustration is taken from Figure 2 in the Report by Norman Hammond.



THE LATEST!

A DREAM OF MAYA AUGUSTUS AND ALICE LE PLONGEON IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY YUCATAN

LAWRENCE GUSTAVE DESMOND &
PHYLLIS MAUCH MESSENGER

The archaeologist Augustus Le Plongeon is remembered as an eccentric diffusionist who believed the Maya founded world civilization. This sensitive, thorough biography tells the story of the Le Plongeon family as part of the early history of archaeology, when many researchers exhibited the qualities of the adventurer as well as the scientist. P: \$19.95

PORTRAITS IN AMERICAN ARCHAEOLOGY REMEMBRANCE OF SOME DISTINGUISHED AMERICANISTS

GORDON RANDOLPH WILLEY

A collection of sixteen biographical sketches whose anecdotal quality reveals as much about the author as they do about his subjects. These men were Willey's mentors, his professors, his colleagues, but above all they were his friends, and it is obvious from his writings that all of them earned his respect and regard. C: \$35.00 P: \$19.95

HOUSEHOLD AND COMMUNITY IN THE MESOAMERICAN PAST

EDITED BY RICHARD R. WILK & WENDY ASHMORE

Because households organize a society at its most basic level, they can serve as indicators of evolutionary change in a social organization. The contributors, working in the subfield of household archaeology, examine Mesoamerican societies from 1500 BC to the present day. C: \$29.95



From A DREAM OF MAYA. A Composite photo by Augustus Le Plongeon. The eight reed bas-relief, Alice preparing to mount her horse, and Augustus in his field clothing were photographed at Chichen Itza.



UNIVERSITY OF
NEW MEXICO PRESS



ALBUQUERQUE,
NEW MEXICO 87131