## Philosophy

The Journal of the Royal Institute of Philosophy

edited by ANTHONY O'HEAR

Volume 72 1997



#### Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, United Kingdom 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© The Royal Institute of Philosophy 1997

Typeset by Michael Heath Limited, Reigate, Surrey Printed in the United Kingdom by the University Press, Cambridge

### CONTENTS

#### ARTICLES

]	Page
ALMOND, BRENDA Seeking Wisdom	417
CARGILE, JAMES On the Burden of Proof	59
CIOFFI, FRANK Critical Notice: Freud, Philosophical and Empirical	
Issues	435
COOPER DAVID E. Wittgenstein, Heidegger and Humility	105
CORDNER, CHRISTOPHER Honour, Community, and Ethical	
Inwardness	401
ELLENBOGEN, SARA On the Link Between Frege's Platonic-Realist	
Semantics and His Doctrine of Private Senses	375
GLOCK, HANS-JOHANN Truth Without People?	85
HANFLING, OSWALD 'Is', 'Ought' and the Voluntaristic Fallacy	537
KEKES, JOHN What is Conservatism?	351
KIERAN, MATTHEW Aesthetic Value: Beauty, Ugliness and	
Incoherence	383
LE POIDEVIN, ROBIN Time and the Static Image	175
LEVIN, MICHAEL Natural Subordination, Aristotle On	241
MASON, RICHARD Getting Around Language	259
MULHALL, STEPHEN Constructing a Hall of Reflection	219
POJMAN, LOUIS Equality and Desert	549
PROUDFOOT, D. On Wittgenstein on Cognitive Science	189
QUINTON, ANTHONY The Trouble with Kant	5
READER, SORAN Principle Ethics, Particularism and Another	
Possibility	269
REDPATH, THEO Cambridge Philosophers VIII: C. D. Broad	571
SIMPSON, EVAN Rights Thinking	29
STOUT, ROWLAND Processes	19
VAN DEN BELD, TON Moral Incapacities	525
WIGGINS, DAVID Languages as Social Objects	499

#### DISCUSSION

BOULTER, STEPHEN J. Putnam's 'Home Coming'	595
CLUNE, ALAN C. Justification of Empirical Belief: Problems with	
Haack's Foundherentism	460
FRANKLIN, JAMES Stove's Anti-Darwinism	133
GOLDSTICK, D. Property Identity and 'Intrinsic' Designation	449
HATZIMOYSIS, ANTHONY Ontology and Axiology	293
NATHAN, N. M. L. True and Ultimate Responsibility	297
NATHAN, N. M. L. Admiration: A New Obstacle	453
NORMAN, RICHARD Cooperation and Equality: a Reply to Pojman	137
PUTMAN, DANIEL The Intellectual Bias of Virtue Ethics	303
SMITH, QUENTIN Simplicity and Why the Universe Exists	125
STEVENSON, LESLIE The Chance of a Singular Event?	312

#### REVIEWS

BAKER, LYNNE RUDDER Explaining Attitudes: A Practical	
Approach to the Mind (Penelope Mackie)	143
BAIER, KURT The Rational and the Moral Order: The Social Roots	
of Reason and Morality (David McNaughton)	154
COHEN, G. A. Self-Ownership, Freedom and Equality (D. A. Lloyd	
Thomas)	478
DEVITT, MICHAEL Coming to Our Senses (John Preston)	464
DILWORTH, CRAIG The Metaphysics of Science (F. Weinert)	330
DRETSKE, FRED Naturalizing the Mind (Cynthia Macdonald)	150
GENOVA, JUDITH Wittgenstein: A Way of Seeing (Marie McGinn)	327
GEWIRTH, ALAN The Community of Rights (Susan Mendus)	609
HALL, DAVID L. AND AMES, ROGER T. Anticipating China	
(Jiyuan Yu)	320
KAHANE, HOWARD Contract Ethics: Evolutionary Biology and	
the Natural Sentiments (Mary Midgley)	468
KIM, JAEGWON Philosophy of Mind (Richard J. Hall)	317
LESLIE, JOHN The End of the World: The Science and Ethics of	
Human Extinction (Antony Flew)	158
LOWE, E.J. Subjects of Experience (Geoffrey Madell)	147
LYCAN, WILLIAM G. Consciousness and Experience	
(Gregory McCulloch)	602
MCCULLOCH, GREGORY The Mind And Its World (Alan Millar)	323
OPPY, GRAHAM Ontological Arguments and Belief in God	
(Paul Helm)	476
SKINNER, QUENTIN Reason and Rhetoric in the Philosophy of	
Hobbes (M. W. Rowe)	471
STEIN, EDWARD Without Good Reason: The Rationality Debate in	
Philosophy and Cognitive Science (Darren Brierton)	482
SKYRMS, BRIAN Evolution of the Social Contract (Antony Flew)	604
TYE, MICHAEL Ten Problems of Consciousness: A Representational	
Theory of the Phenomenal Mind (James Garvey)	606

#### NOTES AND NOTICES

Editorial: Without Foundation	1
Magic Realism	171
Universities?	347
Earnings	495
Booknotes	161, 335, 487, 613
Books Received	163, 337, 489, 615
Notebook	170, 344, 492, 621

"Everything that is thinkable is also possible."



Nowadays, scholars generally have good access to current and recent periodicals but there is a mine of information available from journals going back as far as the end of the eighteenth century, covering a wide range of subject areas within the humanities and social sciences.

If you are studying Wittgenstein, for example, you might miss an article on developments in his view of ethics from the *Philosophical Review* in 1965. You might fail to see a piece by Gilbert Ryle from the Italian journal *Rivista di filosofia* from 1952. You could even overlook Wittgenstein's own letter to the editor of *Mind* in 1933.

Periodicals Contents Index takes in 2,076 titles covering 8,384,618 records, and grows by one million articles each year. PCI gives you the ability to search two centuries of journal writing in less time than it takes to explain the Theory of Forms.

If you would like to find out more, please visit the PCI web sites.

In the UK - http://edina.ed.ac.uk/pci Outside UK - http://pci.chadwyck.com

Chadwyck-Healey Ltd, The Quorum, Barnwell Road, Cambridge CB5 8SW Tel: +44 1223 215512 Fax: +44 1223 215514 Email: marketing@chadwyck.co.uk http://www.chadwyck.co.uk

Photograph courtesy of AKG photo.



#### Nietzsche: *Human, All Too Human*

A Book for Free Spirits Edited and translated by R. J. Hollingdale Introduction by Richard Schact

Nietzsche's remarkable collection of almost 1,400 aphorisms, is presented here in R. J. Hollingdale's distinguished translation, together with a new introduction by Richard Schacht.

**£37.50** HB 0 521 56200 7 430 pp. **£13.95** PB 0 521 56704 1 Cambridge Texts in the History of Philosophy

#### Leibniz: New Essays on Human Understanding

#### Edited by Peter Remnant and Jonathan Bennett

This work is a series of sharp, deep discussions by one great philosopher of the work of another, as Leibniz argues chapter by chapter with John Locke's *Essay Concerning Human Understanding*.

 £45.00
 HB
 0 521 57211 8
 523 pp.

 £15.95
 PB
 0 521 57660 1

 Cambridge Texts in the History of Philosophy

#### Ralph Cudworth: A Treatise Concerning Eternal and Immutable Morality With A Treatise of Freewill

#### Edited by Sarah Hutton

Ralph Cudworth deserves recognition as one of the most important English seventeenth-century philosophers after Hobbes and Locke. This volume makes his most important work available in its first modern edition.

 £37.50
 HB
 0 521 47362 4
 255 pp.

 £13.95
 PB
 0 521 47918 5
 Cambridge Texts in the History of Philosophy

#### Robert Boyle: A Free Enquiry into the Vulgarly Received Notion of Nature Edited by Edward B. Davis and Michael Hunter

Boyle's *Free Enquiry* represents one of the subtlest statements concerning the philosophical issues raised by the mechanical philosophy to emerge from the period of the scientific revolution.

**£37.50** HB 0 521 56100 0 208 pp. **£13.95** PB 0 521 56796 3 Cambridge Texts in the History of Philosophy

#### **Practical Philosophy**

#### Immanuel Kant Edited and Translated by Mary J. Gregor Introduction by Allen Wood

The first English translation of all of Kant's writings on moral and political philosophy collected in a single volume. **£50.00** HB 0 521 37103 1 704 pp. The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant in Translation

#### The Cambridge Companion to Wittgenstein Edited by Hans Sluga and David G. Stern

Each volume of this series of companions to major philosophers contains specially commissioned essays by an international team of scholars, together with a substantial bibliography, and will serve as a reference work for students and non-specialists. The essays in this volume address central themes in Wittgenstein's writings on the philosophy of mind, language, logic, and mathematics. **£40.00** HB 0 521 46025 5 518 pp.

£40.00 HB 0 521 46025 5 518 pp £14.95 PB 0 521 46591 5 Cambridge Companions to Philosophy



#### Aristotle: The Politics and The Constitution of Athens 2nd Edition

#### **Edited by Stephen Everson**

This new collection of Aristotle's political writings provides the student with the necessary materials for a full understanding of his work as a political theorist. In addition to an extended introduction to *The Politics*, this revised *Cambridge Texts* edition provides detailed biographical notes and an extensive guide to further reading.

 £17.95
 HB
 0 521 48243 7
 312 pp.

 £6.95
 PB
 0 521 48400 6
 312 cp.

 Cambridge Texts in the History of Political Thought
 The History of Political
 312 cp.

#### Essays on Hellenistic Epistemology and Ethics

#### **Gisela Striker**

This important collection of essays by one of the foremost interpreters of Hellenistic philosophy focuses on key questions in epistemology and ethics debated by Greek and Roman philosophers of the Hellenistic period. **£37.50** HB 0 521 47051 X 351 pp.

£13.95 PB

0 521 47641 0

#### Augustine

#### Ancient Thought Baptized John M. Rist



'Rist's study of Augustine is a stunning achievement... [His] exposition is simple, lucid, based on vast learning and has the sympathetic understanding required for true insight. What distinguishes his study from many others is his acute awaremeess of the problems, obscurities, unresolved tensions and incoherences in Augustine's thought'. R. A. Markus, *Theology* £14.95 PB 0 521 58952 5 354 pp.

#### Evil and Suffering in Jewish Philosophy Oliver Leaman

In this study Oliver Learnan poses two questions: how can a powerful and caring deity allow terrible things to happen to obviously innocent people, and why have the Jewish people been so harshly treated throughout history, given their status as the chosen people?

**£14.95** PB 0 521 42722 3 271 pp. Cambridge Studies in Religious Traditions 6

Now in

Paperback

#### Feuerbach and the Interpretation of Religion

Van A. Harvey

Most scholars regard Feuerbach's criticism of Christianity as important because of its anticipation of the views of Nietzsche, Marx and Freud. Van Harvey's long-awaited book argues, controversially, that Feuerbach developed a much more interesting and nuanced theory of religion than has been acknowledged hitherto.

**£13.95** PB 0 521 58630 5 329 pp. Cambridge Studies in Religion and Critical Thought 1

In Defense of Humanism Value in the Arts and Letters Richard A. Etlin

In simple, clear language, Richard Erlin articulates the nature of aesthetic experience through analysis of works in a wide variety of media. Through establishing categories for determining value in the arts, Etlin reaffirms the transcendent moral and enduring qualities in great works of art. **£30.00** HB 0 521 47077 3 329 pp.



#### The Sources of Moral Agency

#### **Essays in Moral Psychology and Freudian** Theory

#### John Deigh

The essays in this collection focus on moral feelings and moral motivation, and seek to understand the operations and origins of these phenomena as rooted in the natural desires and emotions of human beings.

£40.00 HB 0 521 55418 7 267 pp. 0 521 55622 8 £14.95 PB

#### Nietzsche contra Rousseau



A Study of Nietzsche's Moral and Political Thought

#### **Keith Ansell Pearson**

Nietzsche is widely regarded as a significant moral philosopher, but his political thinking has often been dismissed as either impossibly individualistic or dangerously totalitarian. Nietzsche contra Rousseau takes a serious look at Nietzsche as political thinker. £13.95

PR 0 521 57569 9 298 pp.

#### Mourning Becomes the Law **Philosophy and Representation Gillian Rose**

In this sequel to her highly acclaimed memoir Love's Work, Gillian Rose takes us beyond the impasse of postmodernism and restores philosophical thinking to the centre of our intellectual culture. With sensitivity and insight, she uses architecture, cinema, painting and poetry to examine ideas about the individual and about justice.

#### Social Practices

A Wittgensteinian Approach to Human Activity and the Social Theodore R. Schatzki

This book addresses key topics in social theory such as the basic structures of social life, the character of human activity, and the nature of individuality. The book will be of interest to philosophers of the social sciences, social theorists in political science and sociology, and literary theorists. £35.00 HB 0 521 56022 5 256 pp.

#### **Evolution of the Social** Contract

#### **Brian Skyrms**

In this pithy and highly readable book, Brian Skyrms, a recognised authority on game and decision theory, investigates traditional problems of the social contract in terms of evolutionary dynamics. The book is not technical and requires no special background knowledge.

£30.00	HB	0 521 55471 3	155 pp.
£10.95	PB	0 521 55583 3	

#### The Psychology of Freedom **Thomas Pink**

This book considers our freedom of action, and what sort of mind, or psychology, that freedom requires. It argues that our freedom of action depends on our being able to decide freely which actions we shall perform. The book seeks to resolve a range of problems about the nature of both action and rationality. 294 pp.

£35.00 HB 0 521 55504 3



the Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2-2Rt

#### Taking Animals Seriously Mental Life and Moral Status David Degrazia

Transcending jejune debates focused on utilitarianism versus rights, this book offers a fresh methodological approach with specific and constructive conclusions about our treatment of animals. It will be of interest to professionals as well as general readers concerned about animal welfare.

**£40.00** HB 0 521 56140 X 314 pp. **£14.95** PB 0 521 56760 2

#### Consciousness and the Origins of Thought

#### Norton Nelkin

A comprehensive and broadly rationalist theory of the mind which continually tests itself against experimental results and clinical data. Taking issue with both Empiricists and Externalists, Norton Nelkin argues that perception is cognitive, constructive and propositionlike.

**£40.00 HB 0 521 56409 3 357 pp.** Cambridge Studies in Philosophy

#### Rationality and Coordination

**Cristina Bicchieri** 



This book explores how individual actions coordinate to produce unintended social consequences. In the past this phenomenon has been explained as the outcome of rational, self-interested individual behaviour. Professor Bicchieri shows that this is in

no way a satisfying explanation.

**£14.95 PB 0 521 57444 7 286 pp.** Cambridge Studies in Probability, Induction and Decision Theory

#### Subjectivity, Realism and Postmodernism



The Recovery of the World in Recent Philosophy

#### Frank B. Farrell

This unusually accessible account of recent Anglo-American philosophy focuses on how philosophy has challenged deeply held notions of subjectivity, mind, and language. **£12.95** PB 0 521 56832 3 302 pp.

. -

#### A World of States of Affairs D. M. Armstrong

#### In this important study D. M. Armstrong offers a comprehensive system of analytical metaphysics that synthesises but also develops his thinking over the last twenty years.

**£40.00** HB 0 521 58064 1 299 pp. **£14.95** PB 0 521 58948 7 Cambridge Studies in Philosophy

#### **Necessity or Contingency?**

The Master Argument and its Philosophical Solutions

#### Jules Vuillemin

*The Master Argument*, recorded by Epictetus, indicates that Diodorus had deduced a contradiction from the conjoint assertion of three propositions. There have been many attempts at reconstructing it in logical terms, without excessive worry about historical plausibility. This text takes exception to recent tradition, translating the propositions into logical terms.

£37.50	HB	1 881526 86 0	250 pp.
£14.95	PB	1 881526 85 2	
CSLI Lectu	ire Note	s 56	



# The Philosophical Quarterly

Edited by Roger Squires (Editorial Chairman). Christopher Bryant (Executive Editor), Berys Gaut (Reviews Editor) and John Heil (North American Representative)

The Philosophical Quarterly is an international core journal which publishes high quality articles and discussions, lively and comprehensive reviews, prize essays and special issues. By representing exciting developments in the subject - for example, by reflecting on cognitive psychology, the visual arts and quantum physics - the journal appeals to a wide readership, including students.

Subscription Rates, Volume 47/1997 Published in: January, April, July, October	ISSN 0031-8094
Published in: January, April, July, October	
Institutional Rates, £66.00 (UK-Europe), \$141.00 (N. America), £89.00	(Rest of World)
Personal Rates, £22.00 (UK-Europe), \$45.00 (N. America), £29.00 (Re	st of World)
Reduced Rates for APA Members, £19.00 (UK-Europe), \$38.00 (N. Ame	erica), £24.50 (Rest of World)
Students Rates, £15.00 (UK-Europe), \$23.00 (N. America), £15.00 (Res	t of World)
Please enter my subscription/send me a sample copy	
I enclose a cheque/money order payable to Blackwell Publ	
Please charge my American Express/Diners Club/Masterca	
Card Number	Expiry Date
Signature	Date
Name	
Address	
	Postcode
Payment must accompany orders	
Please return this form to:	
Journals Marketing, Blackwell Publishers, 108 Cowley Road, Oxfor Os to Journals Marketing, BHIO, Blackwell Publisherg, 250 Mais S	
Or to: Journals Marketing, PHIQ, Blackwell Publishers, 350 Main S	

## PHILOSOPHY & SOCIAL CRITICISM

#### Edited by David Rasmussen Boston College, USA

'**Philosophy & Social Criticism** is a unique and invaluable voice in philosophy and social criticism. It represents a nonideological intervention into academic debates, offering a diverse range of philosophical perspectives.' **Drucilla Cornell** 

In contemporary society reason cannot be separated from practical life and at their interface a critical attitude is forged. *Philosophy & Social Criticism* was established over twenty years ago to bring together articles which foster this attitude. It is now a leading international journal in social and political philosophy.

Since it was established in 1973, the journal has published the work of some of the world's leading theorists, including:

- Seyla Benhabib Cornelius Castoriadis
- Umberto Eco Michel Foucault Jürgen Habermas ■ Agnes Heller ■ Axel Honneth ■ Paul Ricoeur

*Philosophy & Social Criticism* has been at the forefront of contemporary academic scholarship and over the years has provided a focal point for major international debates and theoretical developments.

Published bimonthly • ISSN: 0191-4537

#### Order Form for New Subscribers - Subscribe at the Introductory Rate

SAGE Publications Ltd, 6 Bonhill Street, London EC2A 4PU, UK Call our Subscription Hotline on +44 (0)171 330 1266

USA orders to be sent to: PO Box 5096, Thousand Oaks, CA 91359	Methods of Payment	
Name	□ I enclose a cheque (made payable to SAGE Publications Ltd) for:	
Address 7J16	Please invoice my credit card   Mastercard D Visa Amount:	
Yes! I want to subscribe to Philosophy & Social Criticism from Volume 23 (1997)	Card No:	
<ul> <li>Introductory Rate for Individuals £30 /US\$48 (Usual Rate £38/US\$61)</li> </ul>	Expiry Date: /	
Institutional Rate £165 /US\$264		
D Please send me a brochure on the journal	Signature: Date: / /	



#### Information for Authors

Prospective authors should send their contributions, typed and doublespaced on quarto or A4 paper, to the Editor, Professor Anthony O'Hear, Royal Institute of Philosophy, 14 Gordon Square, London WC1H 0AG. They should retain a second copy for the purpose of checking proofs. When an article has been accepted for publication, the author is strongly encouraged to send a copy of the final version on computer disk (Apple Macintosh or IBM compatible PC) together with the hard copy typescript, giving details of the wordprocessing software used (Microsoft Word, Word or Word Perfect). However, the publisher reserves the right to typeset material by conventional means if an author's disk proves unsatisfactory. Authors should observe the conventions of the journal. The Editor may alter manuscripts wherever necessary to make them conform to the stylistic and bibliographical conventions of the journal. Single quotation marks should be used except where there is a quotation within another. The titles of books and journals should be underlined (i.e. to be printed in italics), as should foreign words. Titles of articles should be in single quotation marks.

Notes and references will be printed as footnotes and should be typed (double-spacing) on a separate sheet, numbered consecutively. They should be referred to in the text by superscripts. Citations should be as follows:

<sup>1</sup> H. B. Acton, *The Philosophy* of *Punishment* (London: Macmillan, 1969), 192–198.

<sup>2</sup>R. S. Downie and Elizabeth Telfer, 'Autonomy', *Philosophy* **46**, No. 178 (October 1971), 295.

<sup>3</sup>Op. cit. note 1, 101–112.

<sup>4</sup>W. C. Wimsatt, 'Some Problems with the Concept of Feedback', Boston Studies in the Philosophy of Science, VIII, R. C. Buck and R. S. Cohen (eds.) (Dordrecht: D. Reidel, 1971), 242.

The return of contributions cannot be guaranteed unless they are accompanied by stamps, or in the case of contributions from abroad, by international coupons, to cover postage. A self-addressed envelope should also be enclosed.

Only corrections of printer's errors can be allowed in proofs. Authors are therefore asked to send any alterations or additions to Professor O'Hear as soon as possible after receiving his letter of acceptance.

Authors of articles, discussion papers and review articles will receive twenty-five offprints free of charge. Additional offprints can be ordered when proofs are returned by arrangement with the Institute.

Books for review should be sent to the Editor at the Institute and not to Cambridge University Press. Publishers are asked to note that nonphilosophical works are not reviewed in *Philosophy*.

Authors' corrected proofs should be sent to Professor O'Hear at Royal Institute of Philosophy, 14 Gordon Square, London, WC1H 0AG. All other correspondence should also be addressed to the Institute.

#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, United Kingdom 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

# Philosophy

#### VOLUME 72 NO 282 OCTOBER 1997

Editorial: Earnings	495
Languages as Social Objects – DAVID WIGGINS	499
Moral Incapacities – TON VAN DEN BELD	525
'Is', 'Ought' and the Voluntaristic Fallacy – OSWALD HANFLING	537
Equality and Desert – LOUIS POJMAN	549
Cambridge Philosophers VIII: C. D. Broad – THEO REDPATH	571
Discussion Putnam's 'Home Coming' – STEPHEN J. BOULTER	595
New Books	
Reviews	602
Booknotes	613
Books Received	615
Notebook	621

© The Royal Institute of Philosophy 1997

Typeset by Michael Heath Limited, Reigate, Surrey Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge



