

Law and History Review

Law and History Review

Editor

Christopher Tomlins
American Bar Foundation

Associate Editor

Laura Edwards
UCLA

Managing Editor

Diane Clay
American Bar Foundation

Law and History Review (ISSN 0738-2480) is published three times a year, in spring, summer, and fall, by the University of Illinois Press for the American Society for Legal History. The purpose of the *Review* is to further research and writing in the fields of the social history of law and the history of legal ideas and institutions. The *Review* is sent to all members of the American Society for Legal History. Information about membership in the Society appears on the inside back cover of this issue.

Address all business inquiries (subscriptions, membership applications, back-issue orders, advertisements, and change-of-address notices) to the Journals Department, University of Illinois Press, 1325 South Oak Street, Champaign, Illinois 61820-6903. Requests for replacement of damaged or undelivered issues will be honored for up to six months after publication of the issue.

For authorization to photocopy from *Law and History Review* for uses exceeding those permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law, contact the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. The CCC will send an invoice for permissions fees. Permissions given above do not extend to copying for advertising or promotional purposes or to creating new collective works.

© 1999 by the Board of Trustees of the University of Illinois. Manufactured in the United States of America.

This journal is printed on acid-free paper.

Law and History Review

Volume 17, Number 1

Spring 1999

*Published three times a year by the University of Illinois Press
for the American Society for Legal History*

Editorial Board

- David Abraham
University of Miami
- William P. Alford
Harvard University
- Mary Frances Berry
University of Pennsylvania
- Thomas Brennan
U.S. Naval Academy
- Martin Chanock
*La Trobe University,
Melbourne*
- Elaine Clark
*University of Michigan,
Dearborn*
- Martha F. Davis
*NOW Legal Defense,
New York*
- Thomas J. Davis
Arizona State University
- Cornelia Dayton
University of Connecticut
- Laura Engelstein
Princeton University
- Jean-Marie Fecteau
*Université du Québec
à Montréal*
- Christian G. Fritz
University of New Mexico
- Judy Fudge
York University, Toronto
- Paul Hyams
Cornell University
- Nancy Isenberg
University of Northern Iowa
- Bruce Kercher
Macquarie University, NSW
- Diane Kirkby
*La Trobe University,
Melbourne*
- Michael Klarman
University of Virginia
- David Konig
*Washington University,
St. Louis*
- Mindie Lazarus-Black
*University of Illinois at
Chicago*
- Kenneth F. Ledford
*Case Western Reserve
University*
- Brian P. Levack
University of Texas at Austin
- Janette Neeson
York University, Toronto
- Kent Newmyer
University of Connecticut
- James P. Oakes
Northwestern University
- John V. Orth
University of North Carolina
- Steven Pincus
University of Chicago
- W. Wesley Pue
*University of British
Columbia*
- Nicole Hahn Rafter
Northeastern University
- Gerry R. Rubin
*University of Kent,
Canterbury*
- Lucy E. Salyer
*University of
New Hampshire*
- John Henry Schlegel
SUNY, Buffalo
- Stephen A. Siegel
De Paul University
- Rayman L. Solomon
Northwestern University
- Robin Chapman Stacey
University of Washington
- Robert J. Steinfeld
SUNY, Buffalo
- Emily Z. Tabuteau
Michigan State University
- Victor M. Uribe
*Florida International
University*
- Barbara Y. Welke
University of Oregon
- James Q. Whitman
Yale University
- Stephen C. Yeazell
*University of California,
Los Angeles*

Note to Contributors

The editors welcome unsolicited manuscripts and books for review. Address manuscripts and all general editorial correspondence to Christopher Tomlins, The American Bar Foundation, 750 North Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60611 (tel 312 988 6553; fax 312 988 6579; e-m <clt@abfn.org>). Address books for review and correspondence regarding book reviews and reviewing to Laura Edwards, Department of History, UCLA, 6265 Bunche Hall, Los Angeles, California 90095-1473 (tel 310 825 3737; fax 310 206 9043; e-m <edwards@history.ucla.edu>). Manuscripts must be double-spaced typescript throughout, with citations prepared according to the *Chicago Manual of Style*, 14th ed. The *Review's* style guides for articles and book reviews are available on the *LHR* web page <www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html>. Please use word processing wherever possible. Submitted manuscripts are subject to double-blind peer review; authors should therefore identify themselves on the title page only. Accepted manuscripts are copyedited for style but not substance; authors remain responsible for citation accuracy and for all statements of fact or opinion. The *Law and History Review* will not consider any manuscript concurrently submitted for publication elsewhere. Submission of a manuscript is understood to commit its author to publish the manuscript in the *Law and History Review* if accepted by the editor.

Contents

Law and History Review Vol. 17, No. 1, Spring 1999
www.press.uillinois.edu/journals/lhr.html

In This Issue vii

Articles

Judicial Reform and the Role of Medical Expertise in Late Imperial
Russian Courts

Elisa M. Becker 1

The People versus Zephyr Davis: Law and Popular Justice in Late
Nineteenth-Century Chicago

Elizabeth Dale 27

Forum. That Impecunious Introvert from New Hampshire: Re-Imagining Langdell

“Warn Students That I Entertain Heretical Opinions, Which They Are
Not to Take as Law”: The Inception of Case Method Teaching in the
Classrooms of the Early C. C. Langdell, 1870–1883

Bruce A. Kimball 57

Comments

Langdell Laughs

William P. LaPiana 141

“Langdell, We Hardly Knew Ye”

Howard Schweber 145

Langdell’s *Auto-da-fé*

John Henry Schlegel 149

Response

The Life of Langdell Has Not Been Logic; It Has Been Experience

Bruce A. Kimball 155

Notes and Commentary

The Scottish Case That Led to Hardwicke’s Marriage Act

Leah Leneman 161

Book Reviews

- Inquests and Indictments from Late Fourteenth Century Buckinghamshire*—
Lesley Boatwright, editor
reviewed by Roger D. Groot 171
- Courts, Counties, and the Capital in the Later Middle Ages*—Diana E. S.
Dunn, editor
reviewed by Daniel Klerman 173
- The Law of Evidence in Victorian England*—Christopher J. W. Allen
reviewed by Jennifer L. Mnookin 174
- Russian Corporate Capitalism from Peter the Great to Perestroika*—
Thomas C. Owen
reviewed by Jonathan Grant 177
- The Birth of the Penitentiary in Latin America: Essays on Criminology,
Prison Reform, and Social Control, 1830–1940*—Ricardo D. Salvatore and
Carlos Aguirre, editors
reviewed by Alexandra Stern 179
- The Legal Culture of Northern New Spain, 1700–1810*—Charles R. Cutter
reviewed by Susan Scafidi 182
- The Political and Legal Philosophy of James Wilson, 1742–1798*—Mark
David Hall
reviewed by Eduardo A. Velásquez 184
- The People's Welfare: Law and Regulation in Nineteenth-Century
America*—William J. Novak
reviewed by Alfred S. Konefsky 187
- Gendered Strife and Confusion: The Political Culture of Reconstruction*—
Laura F. Edwards
reviewed by Jane Dailey 191
- The Great South Carolina Ku Klux Klan Trials, 1871–1872*—Lou Faulkner
Williams
reviewed by Michael W. Fitzgerald 193
- Laws Harsh as Tigers: Chinese Immigrants and the Shaping of Modern
Immigration Law*—Lucy E. Salyer
reviewed by Roger Daniels 195
- Fighting Organized Crime: Politics, Justice, and the Legacy of Thomas E.
Dewey*—Mary M. Stolberg
reviewed by Michael Willrich 197

<i>Creating a National Home: Building the Veterans' Welfare State, 1860–1900</i> —Patrick J. Kelly reviewed by Kathleen Frydl	200
<i>Origins of Law and Economics: The Economists' New Science of Law, 1830–1930</i> —Heath Pearson reviewed by Herbert Hovenkamp	201
<i>My Life and an Era: The Autobiography of Buck Colbert Franklin</i> —John Hope Franklin and John Whittington Franklin, editors reviewed by J. Clay Smith, Jr.	203
<i>Division and Discord: The Supreme Court under Stone and Vinson, 1941–1953</i> —Melvin I. Urofsky reviewed by Dennis Hutchinson	205
The H-Law Resource Page	207