

VOLUME 18
NUMBER 1
MARCH 1995

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

Gene replacement therapy in the central nervous system: Viral vector-mediated therapy of global neurodegenerative disease

Edward A. Neuwelt, Michael A. Pagel, Alfred Geller & Leslie L. Muldoon

Neural transplantation and recovery of cognitive function

John D. Sinden, Helen Hodges & Jeffrey A. Gray

Some practical and theoretical issues concerning fetal brain tissue grafts as therapy for brain dysfunctions

Donald G. Stein
& Marylou M. Glasier

Self-control: Beyond commitment

Howard Rachlin

Brain evolution and neurolinguistic preconditions

Wendy K. Wilkins
& Jennie Wakefield

CAMBRIDGE

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad

E-mail: bbs@ecs.soton.ac.uk

Behavioral and Brain Sciences
Department of Psychology
University of Southampton
Highfield, Southampton SO17 1BJ
United Kingdom

Managing Editor

Henriette Korthals Altes

Production Coordinator

Edward D. Miller

Chief Copy Editor

Erika Kors

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London

Computational Neuroscience

Stephen Grossberg/Boston U.

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Philip Johnson-Laird/Princeton

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

Neurobehavioral Genetics

Wim E. Crusio/Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London
John C. Marshall/Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. California
Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh
Massimo Piatelli-Palmarini/MIT

Primatology

Horst D. Steklis/Rutgers

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write the editor.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers, MA 01923). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. ISI Genuine Article Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December. The subscription price for institutions of Volume 18 (1995) is US \$222.00 net in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £150.00 in the rest of the world; for individuals US \$90.00 net (£59.00); for BBS Associates and for students (in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico only) with proof of eligibility with order US \$50.00 net (£37.00). Subscription price includes surface postage.

Single parts cost US \$57.00 net (£36.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20 Street, New York, NY 10011-4211; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y., and at additional mailing offices. **Postmaster:** Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 110 Midland Ave., Port Chester, NY 10573.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 18:1 March 1995

Cordo, P. Controversies in Neuroscience II: Neural Transplantation: Introduction	iii
Neuwelt, E. A., Pagel, M. A., Geller, A. & Muldoon, L. L. Gene replacement therapy in the central nervous system: Viral vector-mediated therapy of global neurodegenerative disease	1
Sinden, J. D., Hodges, H. & Gray, J. A. Neural transplantation and recovery of cognitive function	10
Stein, D. G. & Glasier, M. M. Some practical and theoretical issues concerning fetal brain tissue grafts as therapy for brain dysfunctions	36
Open Peer Commentary	
Anderson, B., Chatterjee, A. & Graham, G. Neural transplants are grey matters	46
Baisden, R. H. Therapeutic uses for neural grafts: Progress slowed but not abandoned	47
Blount, J. B., Kondoh, T., Pundt, L. L., Conrad, J., Jansen, E. M. & Low, W. C. Immunobiology of neural transplants and functional incorporation of grafted dopamine neurons	48
Bond, N. W. Repairing the brain: Trophic factor or transplant?	49
Cassel, J.-C. & Will, B. The structure, operation, and functionality of intracerebral grafts	51
Chiang, L., Flores, E. P., Wen, D. Y., Hall, W. A. & Low, W. C. Gene therapy for neurodegenerative disorders and malignant brain tumors	52
Crutcher, K. A. The ethics of fetal tissue grafting should be considered along with the science	53
Davidson, B. L. The limitations of central nervous system directed gene transfer	54
Davis, H. P. & Volpe, B. T. Building a rational foundation for neural transplantation	55
Dunnett, S. B. Multiple potential mechanisms of graft action is not a new idea	56
Dunnett, S. B. & Torres, E. M. Elegant studies of transplant-derived repair of cognitive performance	57
Felten, D. L. Transplantation, plasticity, and the aging host	58
Freed, W. J. & Smith, T. D. Principles of brain tissue engineering	58
Haring, J. H. Therapeutic neural transplantation: Boon or boondoggle?	60
Li, Y. J. & Low, W. C. Intraretrosplenial grafts of cholinergic neurons and spatial memory function	61
Lynch, M. P. Neural transplantation, cognitive aging, and speech	62
Moffett, S. B. Lessons on transplant survival from a successful model system	63
Mufson, E. J. & Sobreviela, T. The NGF superfamily of neurotrophins: Potential treatment for Alzheimer's and Parkinson's disease	63
Nieto-Sampedro, M. CNS transplant utility may survive even their hasty clinical application	65
Privat, A. & Giménez y Ribotta, M. The spinal cord as an alternative model for nerve tissue graft	65
Ridley, R. M. Thinking about repairing thinking	67
Sanders, D. A. Multiple obstacles to gene therapy in the brain	67
Schallert, T. Models of neurological defects and defects in neurological models	68
Seigel, G. M. Gene replacement therapy in the CNS: A view from the retina	69
Silver, R. & LeSauter, J. Studying restoration of brain function with fetal tissue grafts: Optimal models	70
Stanfield, B. B. Difficulties inherent in the restoration of dynamically reactive brain systems	71
Steece-Collier, K. Neural grafting in human disease versus animal models: Cautionary notes	71
Strata, P. & Rossi, F. Pathway rewiring with neural transplantation	73
Svendsen, C. N. & Dunnett, S. B. Gene therapy and neural grafting: Keeping the message switched on	73
Werth, R. Will brain tissue grafts become an important therapy to restore visual function in cerebrally blind patients?	74
Woodruff, M. L. Behavioral effects of neural grafts: Action still in search of a mechanism	75
Authors' Responses	
Muldoon, L. L. & Neuwelt, E. A. Local and global gene therapy in the central nervous system	76
Sinden, J. D., Hodges, H. & Gray, J. A. Grafts and the art of mind's reconstruction	79
Stein, D. G. & Glasier, M. M. Are fetal brain tissue grafts necessary for the treatment of brain damage?	86

Rachlin, H. Self-control: Beyond commitment

109

Open Peer Commentary

Baum, W. M. Patterns yes, agency no	122	Logue, A. W. Form, function, and self-control	136
Baumeister, R. F. Transcendence, guilt, and self-control	122	Mele, A. Conceptualizing self-control	136
Branch, M. N. When is a pattern a pattern?	123	Mosterin, J. Overcoming addiction through abstract patterns	137
Eisenberger, R. Does behaviorism explain self-control?	125	Overskeid, G. Thinking is a difficult habit to break	138
Fantino, E. The future is uncertain: Eat dessert first	125	Plaud, J. J. The behavior of self-control	139
Frank, R. H. Internal commitment and efficient habit formation	127	Premack, D. & Premack, A. J. Why self-control is both difficult and difficult to explicate	140
Green, L. & Myerson, J. Choice between long- and short-term interests: Beyond self-control	127	Schirillo, J. A. Self-control: Acts of free will	141
Hineline, P. N. The extended psychological present	128	Shimoff, E. Distinguishing between acts and patterns	142
Hocutt, M. Self-control as habit	129	Silverstein, A. Teleological behaviorism and internal control of behavior	142
Hughes, J. & Churchland, P. S. My behavior made me do it: The uncaused cause of teleological behaviorism	130	Smith, T. L. Alternatives to radical behaviorism	143
Kane, R. Patterns, acts, and self-control: Rachlin's theory	131	Summers, C. The role of discounting in global social issues	144
Kanekar, S. Conceptual problems in the act-versus-pattern analysis of self-control	132	Tonneau, F. Further choices for molar theory	145
Killeen, P. R. The future of an illusion: Self and its control	133	Waller, B. N. Pattern proliferation in teleological behaviorism	145
Lacey, H. Teleological behaviorism and the intentional scheme	134	Wetherick, N. E. Commitment: Beyond Rachlin's control?	146
Lemm, K., Shoda, Y. & Mischel, W. Can teleological behaviorism account for the effects of instructions on self-control without invoking cognition?	135	Zentall, T. R. The cost of an interrupted response pattern	147
		Author's Response	
		Rachlin, H. Self-control observed	148

Wilkins, W. K. & Wakefield, J. Brain evolution and neurolinguistic preconditions

161

Open Peer Commentary

Bickerton, D. Finding the true place of <i>Homo habilis</i> in language evolution	182	Jerison, H. J. Issues in neo- and paleoneurology of language	195
Bryant, D. J. Is preadaptation for language a necessary assumption?	183	Leiber, J. Coming of age in Olduvai and the Zaire rain forest	196
Catania, A. C. Single words, multiple words, and the functions of language	184	Lieberman, P. Manual versus speech motor control and the evolution of language	197
Corballis, M. C. Lending a hand	185	Liska, J. Semiogenesis as a continuous, not a discrete, phenomenon	198
Dingwall, W. O. Complex behaviors: Evolution and the brain	186	Maryanski, A. The hominid tool-language connection: Some missing evolutionary links?	199
Donald, M. Neurolinguistic models and fossil reconstructions	188	Mitchell, R. W. Apes and language: Human uniqueness again?	200
Fitch, R. H. & Tallal, P. A case for auditory temporal processing as an evolutionary precursor to speech processing and language function	189	Newmeyer, F. J. Conceptual structure and syntax	202
Gibson, K. R. Solving the language origins puzzle: Collecting and assembling <i>all</i> pertinent pieces	189	Steele, J. Stone tools and conceptual structure	202
Hauser, M. D. & Wolfe, N. D. Human language: Are nonhuman precursors lacking?	190	Walker, S. F. Bartering old stone tools: When did communicative ability and conceptual structure begin to interact?	203
Holloway, R. L. Evidence for POT expansion in early <i>Homo</i> : A pretty theory with ugly (or no) paleoneurological facts	191	Whitcombe, E. Palaeoneurology of language: Grounds for scepticism	204
Hurford, J. R. & Kirby, S. Neural preconditions for proto-language	193		
Jacobs, B. & Horner, J. M. Language as a multimodal sensory enhancement system	194	Authors' Response	
		Wilkins, W. K. & Wakefield, J. Issues and nonissues in the origins of language	205