

**BBS**

Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory  
with open peer commentary

Volume 37 | Issue 5 | October 2014 | ISSN: 0140-525X

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

## Editors

Paul Bloom  
Barbara L. Finlay

**URL:** <http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs>

## E-mail: [bbsjournal@cambridge.org](mailto:bbsjournal@cambridge.org)

Behavioral and Brain Sciences  
Journals Department  
Cambridge University Press  
32 Avenue of The Americas  
New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

## Managing Editor

Gennifer Levey

## Chief Copy Editor

Sumitra Mukerji

## Proofreader

Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

## Editorial Board

### *Affective Neuroscience*

Stephanie D. Preston/U. of Michigan

### *Atypical Neurodevelopment*

Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

### *Behavioral Neurogenetics*

Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

### *Cognition and Artificial Intelligence*

Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

### *Cognitive and Decision Sciences*

Nick Chater/University College London

### *Cognitive Development*

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

### *Cognitive Neuroscience*

Moshe Bar/Gonda Multidisciplinary

Brain Research Center

### *Computational Neuroscience*

Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

### *Evolution of Brain and Cognition*

Dean Falk/Florida State U.

### *Evolution of Cognition*

Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

### *Experimental Analysis of Behavior*

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

### *Language and Language Disorders*

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

### *Linguistics*

Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

### *Perception*

Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

### *Philosophy of Science*

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

### *Primate Cognition*

Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

### *Social Cognition*

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

### *Social Cognitive Neuroscience*

Rebecca Saxe/MIT

### *Vision, Language and Computation*

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

## FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001)

Stevan Harnad

**Editorial Policy** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary\* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst>) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/BBSAssoc>).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc> and then email [bbsjournal@cambridge.org](mailto:bbsjournal@cambridge.org).

© Cambridge University Press 2014. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).

**Subscriptions** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 37 (2014) for *institutions* is US \$1391.00 for print and online and US \$1118.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £820.00 for print and online and UK £661.00 for online only elsewhere. The subscription price for *individuals* is US \$392.00 for print and online and US \$353.00 for online only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £229.00 for print and online and UK £208.00 for online only elsewhere. For *BBS Associates*, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$139.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £87.00 elsewhere. For *students*, with proof of eligibility with order, \$116.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £68.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$263.00 (UK £131.00) plus postage. *Institutional* orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: [journals\\_subscriptions@cambridge.org](mailto:journals_subscriptions@cambridge.org); in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK, e-mail: [journals\\_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk](mailto:journals_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk). *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs>.

**Postmaster:** Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, England, UK.

**Online availability** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

**Institutional subscribers:** Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see <http://cambridge.journals.org>.

**Advertising** Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

\*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

# Contents Volume 37:5 October 2014

<b>Cimpian, A. &amp; Salomon, E.</b> The inherence heuristic: An intuitive means of making sense of the world, and a potential precursor to psychological essentialism		461
<b>Open Peer Commentary:</b>		
<b>Baron, A. S.</b> Is the inherence heuristic simply WEIRD?	481	
<b>Bartsch, K. &amp; Estes, D.</b> Why we assume it's all good: The role of theory of mind in early inherent feature inferences	482	
<b>Bastian, B.</b> Can the inherence heuristic explain vitalistic reasoning?	482	
<b>Bigler, R. S. &amp; Clark, C.</b> The inherence heuristic: A key theoretical addition to understanding social stereotyping and prejudice	483	
<b>Bookstein, F. L.</b> The psychology of inherence is self-referential (and that is a good thing)	484	
<b>Braisby, N.</b> Not so fast, and not so easy: Essentialism doesn't emerge from a simple heuristic	485	
<b>Dennehy, T. C.</b> Inherence is an aspect of psychological essentialism	486	
<b>Dubljević, V. &amp; Racine, E.</b> A single cognitive heuristic process meets the complexity of domain-specific moral heuristics	487	
<b>Dunham, Y.</b> Do we need the inherence heuristic to explain the bias towards inherent explanations?	488	
<b>Gaucher, D. &amp; Jost, J. T.</b> Why does the "mental shotgun" fire system-justifying bullets?	489	
<b>Gelman, S. A. &amp; Meyer, M.</b> The inherence heuristic: A basis for psychological essentialism?	490	
<b>Hampton, J. A.</b> The inherence heuristic is inherent in humans	490	
<b>Haslam, N.</b> The essence of essentialism?	491	
<b>Hood, B.</b> Quiddity and haecceity as distinct forms of essentialism	492	
<b>Khalidi, M. A. &amp; Mugg, J.</b> The inherent bias in positing an inherence heuristic	493	
<b>Kinzler, K. D. &amp; Sullivan, K. R.</b> Is it about "pink" or about "girls"? The inherence heuristic across social and nonsocial domains	494	
<b>Marmorodoro, A., Murphy, R. A. &amp; Baker, A. G.</b> Does the inherence heuristic take us to psychological essentialism?	494	
<b>Meleady, R. &amp; Crisp, R. J.</b> Systematic revisions to inherent notions may shape improvements in cognitive infrastructure		495
<b>Newheiser, A.-K. &amp; Olson, K. R.</b> Is the inherence heuristic needed to understand system-justifying tendencies among children?		496
<b>Noles, N. S. &amp; Danovitch, J. H.</b> Owning up to the role of historical information		497
<b>O'Connor, C. &amp; Joffe, H.</b> The social aetiology of essentialist beliefs		498
<b>Olivola, C. Y. &amp; Machery, E.</b> Is psychological essentialism an inherent feature of human cognition?		499
<b>Prasada, S.</b> The representation of inherent properties		500
<b>Rakoczy, H. &amp; Cacchione, T.</b> The developmental and evolutionary origins of psychological essentialism lie in sortal object individuation		500
<b>Rhodes, M.</b> Inherence-based views of social categories		501
<b>Strevens, M.</b> The causes of characteristic properties: Insides versus categories		502
<b>Uhlmann, E. L., Zhu, L., Brescoll, V. L. &amp; Newman, G. E.</b> System-justifying motives can lead to both the acceptance and the rejection of innate explanations for group differences		503
<b>Wood, G.</b> Generalizing a model beyond the inherence heuristic and applying it to beliefs about objective value		504
<b>Yzerbyt, V. Y. &amp; Demoulin, S.</b> Inherence heuristic versus essentialism: Issues of antecedence and cognitive mechanism		505
<b>Authors' Response:</b>		
<b>Cimpian, A. &amp; Salomon, E.</b> Refining and expanding the proposal of an inherence heuristic in human understanding		506