

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

*Official Journal of the Philosophy of
Science Association*



VOLUME 58, NUMBER 4

December, 1991

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

(ISSN 0031-8248)

JOURNAL OF THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE ASSOCIATION

EDITORIAL BOARD:

MERRILEE H. SALMON, *Editor-in-Chief*

PETER MACHAMER AND JOHN D. NORTON, *Associate Editors*

PETER ACHINSTEIN	RONALD GIERE	THOMAS NICKLES
FRANK ARNTZENIUS	CLARK GLYMOUR	ILKKA NIINILUOTO
PETER ASQUITH	GARY GUTTING	ALEXANDER ROSENBERG
JOHN BEATTY	IAN HACKING	MICHAEL RUSE
JEFFREY BUB	WILLIAM HARPER	KENNETH SCHAFFNER
RICHARD BURIAN	GEOFFREY HELLMAN	DUDLEY SHAPERE
ROBERT BUTTS	DAVID HULL	LAWRENCE SKLAR
NANCY CARTWRIGHT	PAUL HUMPHREYS	BRIAN SKYRMS
LINDLEY DARDEN	PHILIP KITCHER	FREDERICK SUPPE
JOHN EARMAN	HENRY KYBURG, JR.	PATRICK SUPPES
ARTHUR FINE	JAMES LENNOX	BAS VAN FRAASSEN
JERRY FODOR	DAVID MALAMENT	LINDA WESSELS
STEVE FULLER	DEBORAH G. MAYO	JAMES WOODWARD
MICHAEL FRIEDMAN	TIM MAUDLIN	

ASSISTANT EDITOR:

Judith Meiksin

EDITORIAL ASSISTANT:

Madeline M. Larson

GOVERNING BOARD OF THE ASSOCIATION:

Bas C. van Fraassen, President (1992)

Ronal N. Giere, President-elect (1992)

Thomas S. Kuhn, Past President (1992)

William Bechtel (1992)

John Earman (1991)

Michael Friedman (1992)

Daniel Garber (1991)

William Harper (1991)

Paul Horwich (1992)

Paul Teller (1992)

William Wimsatt (1991)

EXECUTIVE SECRETARY:

Peter D. Asquith

MADE AND PRINTED IN THE USA BY
EDWARDS BROTHERS, INC., ANN ARBOR, MI

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE is published quarterly by the Philosophy of Science Association, 503 South Kedzie Hall, Department of Philosophy, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan 48824-1032. 1991 Subscription price \$50.00 U.S.A. (\$55.00 non-U.S.A.) per Volume. Single numbers \$15.00. 1991 Membership dues, which include subscription, are graduated based on income: income below \$40,000—\$40.00; \$40,000—\$49,999—\$50.00; \$50,000 or above—\$60.00. Subscription inquiries should be directed to the Executive Secretary. Second-class postage paid at East Lansing, Michigan and at additional mailing offices. © 1991 by the Philosophy of Science Association.

CONTENTS*

NOVEL EVIDENCE AND SEVERE TESTS, DEBORAH G. MAYO	523
TEMPERED REALISM ABOUT THE FORCE OF SELECTION, C. KENNETH WATERS	553
MAHER, MENDELEEV AND BAYESIANISM, COLIN HOWSON AND ALLAN FRANKLIN	574
ON THE TESTABILITY OF PSYCHOLOGICAL GENERAL- IZATIONS (PSYCHOLOGICAL TESTABILITY), DAVID K. HENDERSON	586
THE POLITICS OF POSTMODERN PHILOSOPHY OF SCI- ENCE, JOSEPH ROUSE	607
BELL'S INEQUALITIES, RELATIVISTIC QUANTUM FIELD THEORY AND THE PROBLEM OF HIDDEN VARIABLES, MIKLÓS RÉDEI	628
SOME CRITICAL REMARKS CONCERNING PRIGOGINE'S CONCEPTION OF TEMPORAL IRREVERSIBILITY, GUIDO VERSTRAETEN	639
DISCUSSION: LEPLIN ON ESSENTIALISM, DUDLEY SHAPERÉ	655
DISCUSSION: THE METHOD TO "MEANING": A REPLY TO LEPLIN, NANCY J. NERSESSIAN	678
DISCUSSION: CONTRASTIVE EXPLANATION AND CAUSAL TRIANGULATION, PETER LIPTON	687
BOOK REVIEW	698
<i>The Limitations of Deductivism, Adolf Grünbaum and Wesley Salmon—Brent Mundy.</i>	
REFEREES FOR PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE	701
INDEX TO VOLUME 58	705

*The contents of PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE are utilized in compiling the following bibliographic sources: *Arts and Humanities Citation Index*; *Biological Abstracts*; *Bulletin Signalétique 519*; *Current Contents/Arts and Humanities*; *Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences*; *Current Index to Statistics*; *Humanities Index*; *Index to Book Reviews in the Humanities*; *Isis Critical Bibliography*; *Language & Language Behavior Abstracts*; *Mathematical Reviews*; *Philosopher's Index*; *Philosophie*; *Psychological Abstracts*; *Repertoire Bibliographique de la Philosophie*; *Social Sciences Citation Index*; *Sociological Abstracts*.

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

(ISSN 0031-8248)

JOURNAL OF THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE ASSOCIATION

EDITORIAL BOARD:

MERRILEE H. SALMON, *Editor-in-Chief*

PETER MACHAMER AND JOHN D. NORTON, *Associate Editors*

PETER ACHINSTEIN	RONALD GIERE	THOMAS NICKLES
FRANK ARNTZENIUS	CLARK GLYMOUR	ILKKA NIINILUOTO
PETER ASQUITH	GARY GUTTING	ALEXANDER ROSENBERG
JOHN BEATTY	IAN HACKING	MICHAEL RUSE
JEFFREY BUB	WILLIAM HARPER	KENNETH SCHAFFNER
RICHARD BURIAN	GEOFFREY HELLMAN	DUDLEY SHAPERE
ROBERT BUTTS	DAVID HULL	LAWRENCE SKLAR
NANCY CARTWRIGHT	PAUL HUMPHREYS	BRIAN SKYRMS
LINDLEY DARDEN	PHILIP KITCHER	FREDERICK SUPPE
JOHN EARMAN	HENRY KYBURG, JR.	PATRICK SUPPES
ARTHUR FINE	JAMES LENNOX	BAS VAN FRAASSEN
JERRY FODOR	DAVID MALAMENT	LINDA WESSELS
STEVE FULLER	DEBORAH G. MAYO	JAMES WOODWARD
MICHAEL FRIEDMAN	TIM MAUDLIN	

ASSISTANT EDITOR:

Judith Meiksin

EDITORIAL ASSISTANT:

Madeline M. Larson

GOVERNING BOARD OF THE ASSOCIATION:

Bas C. van Fraassen, President (1992)

Ronal N. Giere, President-elect (1992)

Thomas S. Kuhn, Past President (1992)

William Bechtel (1992)

William Harper (1991)

John Earman (1991)

Paul Horwich (1992)

Michael Friedman (1992)

Paul Teller (1992)

Daniel Garber (1991)

William Wimsatt (1991)

EXECUTIVE SECRETARY:

Peter D. Asquith

MADE AND PRINTED IN THE USA BY
EDWARDS BROTHERS, INC., ANN ARBOR, MI

PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE is published quarterly by the Philosophy of Science Association, 503 South Kedzie Hall, Department of Philosophy, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan 48824-1032. 1991 Subscription price \$50.00 U.S.A. (\$55.00 non-U.S.A.) per Volume. Single numbers \$15.00. 1991 Membership dues, which include subscription, are graduated based on income: income below \$40,000—\$40.00; \$40,000—\$49,999—\$50.00; \$50,000 or above—\$60.00. Subscription inquiries should be directed to the Executive Secretary. Second-class postage paid at East Lansing, Michigan and at additional mailing offices. © 1991 by the Philosophy of Science Association.

CONTENTS*

NOVEL EVIDENCE AND SEVERE TESTS, DEBORAH G. MAYO	523
TEMPERED REALISM ABOUT THE FORCE OF SELECTION, C. KENNETH WATERS	553
MAHER, MENDELEEV AND BAYESIANISM, COLIN HOWSON AND ALLAN FRANKLIN	574
ON THE TESTABILITY OF PSYCHOLOGICAL GENERAL- IZATIONS (PSYCHOLOGICAL TESTABILITY), DAVID K. HENDERSON	586
THE POLITICS OF POSTMODERN PHILOSOPHY OF SCI- ENCE, JOSEPH ROUSE	607
BELL'S INEQUALITIES, RELATIVISTIC QUANTUM FIELD THEORY AND THE PROBLEM OF HIDDEN VARIABLES, MIKLÓS RÉDEI	628
SOME CRITICAL REMARKS CONCERNING PRIGOGINE'S CONCEPTION OF TEMPORAL IRREVERSIBILITY, GUIDO VERSTRAETEN	639
DISCUSSION: LEPLIN ON ESSENTIALISM, DUDLEY SHAPER	655
DISCUSSION: THE METHOD TO "MEANING": A REPLY TO LEPLIN, NANCY J. NERSESIAN	678
DISCUSSION: CONTRASTIVE EXPLANATION AND CAUSAL TRIANGULATION, PETER LIPTON	687
BOOK REVIEW	698
<i>The Limitations of Deductivism, Adolf Grünbaum and Wesley Salmon—Brent Mundy.</i>	
REFEREES FOR <i>PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE</i>	701
INDEX TO VOLUME 58	705

*The contents of *PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE* are utilized in compiling the following bibliographic sources: *Arts and Humanities Citation Index*; *Biological Abstracts*; *Bulletin Signalétique 519*; *Current Contents/Arts and Humanities*; *Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences*; *Current Index to Statistics*; *Humanities Index*; *Index to Book Reviews in the Humanities*; *Isis Critical Bibliography*; *Language & Language Behavior Abstracts*; *Mathematical Reviews*; *Philosopher's Index*; *Philosophie*; *Psychological Abstracts*; *Repertoire Bibliographique de la Philosophie*; *Social Sciences Citation Index*; *Sociological Abstracts*.