

# ON COUNTABLY PARACOMPACT SPACES

C. H. DOWKER

LET  $X$  be a topological space, that is, a space with open sets such that the union of any collection of open sets is open and the intersection of any finite number of open sets is open. A covering of  $X$  is a collection of open sets whose union is  $X$ . The covering is called countable if it consists of a countable collection of open sets or finite if it consists of a finite collection of open sets; it is called locally finite if every point of  $X$  is contained in some open set which meets only a finite number of sets of the covering. A covering  $\mathfrak{B}$  is called a refinement of a covering  $\mathfrak{U}$  if every open set of  $\mathfrak{B}$  is contained in some open set of  $\mathfrak{U}$ . The space  $X$  is called countably paracompact if every countable covering has a locally finite refinement.

The purpose of this paper is to study the properties of countably paracompact spaces. The justification of the new concept is contained in Theorem 4 below, where it is shown that, for normal spaces, countable paracompactness is equivalent to two other properties of known topological importance.

1. A space  $X$  is called compact if every covering has a finite refinement, paracompact if every covering has a locally finite refinement, and countably compact if every countable covering has a finite refinement. It is clear that every compact, paracompact or countably compact space is countably paracompact. Just as one shows<sup>1</sup> that every closed subset of a compact [paracompact, countably compact] space is compact [paracompact, countably compact], so one can show that every closed subset of a countably paracompact space is countably paracompact. It is known that the topological product of two compact spaces is compact and the topological product of a compact space and a paracompact space is paracompact [2, Theorem 5]. The following is an analogous theorem.

**THEOREM 1.** *The topological product  $X \times Y$  of a countably paracompact space  $X$  and a compact space  $Y$  is countably paracompact.*

*Proof.* Let  $\{U_i\}$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots$ ) be a countable covering of  $X \times Y$ . Let  $V_i$  be the set of all points  $x$  of  $X$  such that  $x \times Y \subset \bigcup_{j \leq i} U_j$ . If  $x \in V_i$  every point  $(x, y)$  of  $x \times Y$  has a neighbourhood  $N \times M$ , ( $N$  open in  $X$ ,  $M$  open in  $Y$ ), which is contained in the open set  $\bigcup_{j \leq i} U_j$ . A finite number of these open sets  $M$  cover  $Y$ ; let  $N_x$  be the intersection of the corresponding finite number of sets  $N$ . Then  $x \in N_x$ ,  $N_x$  is open and  $N_x \times Y \subset \bigcup_{j \leq i} U_j$ ; and hence  $N_x \subset V_i$ . Therefore  $V_i$  is open. Also, for any  $x \in X$ , since  $x \times Y$  is compact,  $x \times Y$  is

Received December 19, 1949.

<sup>1</sup>See [1] page 86, Satz IV and [2] Theorem 2.

contained in some finite number of sets of the covering  $\{U_i\}$ ; hence  $x$  is in some  $V_i$ . Therefore  $\{V_i\}$  is a covering of  $X$ .

Since  $\{V_i\}$  is countable and  $X$  is countably paracompact,  $\{V_i\}$  has a locally finite refinement  $\mathfrak{B}$ . For each open set  $W$  of  $\mathfrak{B}$  let  $g(W)$  be the first  $V_i$  containing  $W$  and let  $G_i$  be the union of all  $W$  for which  $g(W) = V_i$ . Then  $G_i$  is open,  $G_i \subset V_i$  and  $\{G_i\}$  is a locally finite covering of  $X$ .

If  $j \leq i$ , let  $G_{ij} = (G_i \times Y) \cap U_j$ ; then  $G_{ij}$  is an open set in  $X \times Y$ . If  $(x, y)$  is any point of  $(X, Y)$  then, for some  $i$ ,  $x \in G_i$  and hence  $(x, y) \in G_i \times Y$ . Also, since  $x \in G_i \subset V_i$ ,  $(x, y) \in x \times Y \subset \bigcup_{j \leq i} U_j$ , and hence, for some  $j \leq i$ ,  $(x, y) \in U_j$ . Hence  $(x, y) \in G_{ij}$ . Therefore  $\{G_{ij}\}$  is a covering of  $X \times Y$ . Since  $G_{ij} \subset U_j$ ,  $\{G_{ij}\}$  is a refinement of  $\{U_i\}$ . Also, if  $(x, y) \in X \times Y$ ,  $x$  is in an open set  $H(x)$  which meets only a finite number of the sets of  $\{G_i\}$ . Then  $H(x) \times Y$  is an open set containing  $(x, y)$  which can meet  $G_{ij}$  only if  $H(x)$  meets  $G_i$ . But for each  $i$  there is only a finite number of sets  $G_{ij}$ . Hence  $H(x) \times Y$  meets only a finite number of sets of  $\{G_{ij}\}$ ; hence  $\{G_{ij}\}$  is locally finite. Therefore  $X \times Y$  is countably paracompact. This completes the proof.

It can similarly be shown that the topological product of a compact space and a countably compact space is countably compact.

**2.** A topological space  $X$  is called normal if for every pair of disjoint closed sets  $A$  and  $B$  of  $X$  there is a pair of disjoint open sets  $U$  and  $V$  with  $A \subset U$  and  $B \subset V$  (or, equivalently, there is an open set  $U$  with  $A \subset U$ ,  $\bar{U} \subset X - B$ ).

**THEOREM 2.** *The following properties of a normal space  $X$  are equivalent:*

- (a) *The space  $X$  is countably paracompact.*
- (b) *Every countable covering of  $X$  has a point-finite<sup>2</sup> refinement.*
- (c) *Every countable covering  $\{U_i\}$  has a refinement  $\{V_i\}$  with  $\bar{V}_i \subset U_i$ .*
- (d) *Given a decreasing sequence  $\{F_i\}$  of closed sets with vacuous intersection, there is a sequence  $\{G_i\}$  of open sets with vacuous intersection such that  $F_i \subset G_i$ .*
- (e) *Given a decreasing sequence  $\{F_i\}$  of closed sets with vacuous intersection, there is a sequence  $\{A_i\}$  of closed  $G_\delta$ -sets<sup>3</sup> with vacuous intersection such that  $F_i \subset A_i$ .*

*Proof.* (a)  $\rightarrow$  (b). A locally finite covering is *a fortiori* point-finite.

(b)  $\rightarrow$  (c). Let  $\{U_i\}$  be any countable covering of  $X$ . Then, by (b),  $\{U_i\}$  has a point-finite refinement  $\mathfrak{B}$ . For each open set  $W$  of  $\mathfrak{B}$  let  $g(W)$  be the first  $U_i$  containing  $W$ , and let  $G_i$  be the union of all  $W$  such that  $g(W) = U_i$ . Then  $\{G_i\}$  is a point-finite covering of  $X$  and  $G_i \subset U_i$ . It is known [3, p. 26, (33-4); 2, Theorem 6] that every point-finite covering  $\{G_i\}$  (whether countable or not) of a normal space  $X$  has a refinement  $\{V_i\}$  with the closure of each  $V_i$  contained in the corresponding  $G_i$ . Then  $\bar{V}_i \subset G_i \subset U_i$ , hence  $\bar{V}_i \subset U_i$ .

<sup>2</sup>A covering of  $X$  is called point-finite if each point of  $X$  is in only a finite number of sets of the covering.

<sup>3</sup>A set  $A$  is called a  $G_\delta$ -set if it is the intersection of some countable collection of open sets.

(c)  $\rightarrow$  (d). Let  $\{F_i\}$  be a sequence of closed sets with  $F_{i+1} \subset F_i$  and  $\bigcap_i F_i = 0$ . Then, if  $U_i = X - F_i$ ,  $\{U_i\}$  is a covering of  $X$ . Then, by *c*, there is a covering  $\{V_i\}$  with  $\bar{V}_i \subset U_i$ . Let  $G_i$  be the open set  $X - \bar{V}_i$ . Then, since  $\bar{V}_i \subset U_i$ ,  $F_i \subset G_i$  and, since  $\bigcup \bar{V}_i = X$ ,  $\bigcap G_i = 0$ .

(d)  $\rightarrow$  (e). Let  $\{F_i\}$  be a sequence of closed sets with  $F_{i+1} \subset F_i$  and  $\bigcap F_i = 0$ . Then, by *d*, there is a sequence  $\{G_i\}$  of open sets with  $F_i \subset G_i$  and  $\bigcap G_i = 0$ . Then, by Urysohn's lemma, there is a continuous function  $\phi_i$ ,  $0 \leq \phi_i(x) \leq 1$ , such that, if  $x \in F_i$ ,  $\phi_i(x) = 0$  and, if  $x \text{ non } \in G_i$ ,  $\phi_i(x) = 1$ . Let  $G_{ij} = \{x \mid \phi_i(x) < 1/j\}$ , and let  $A_i = \bigcap_j G_{ij} = \{x \mid \phi_i(x) = 0\}$ . Then  $G_{ij}$  is open,  $A_i$  is a closed  $G_\delta$ -set,  $F_i \subset A_i \subset G_i$  and  $\bigcap A_i \subset \bigcap G_i = 0$ .

(e)  $\rightarrow$  (a). Let  $\{U_i\}$  be a countable covering of  $X$  and let  $F_i = X - \bigcup_{k < i} U_k$ . Then  $F_i$  is closed,  $F_{i+1} \subset F_i$  and, since  $\bigcup U_i = X$ ,  $\bigcap F_i = 0$ . Then, by (e), there is a sequence  $\{A_i\}$  of closed  $G_\delta$ -sets with  $F_i \subset A_i$  and  $\bigcap A_i = 0$ . Then  $X - A_j$  is an  $F_\sigma$ -set; let  $X - A_j = \bigcup_i B_{ji}$  where each  $B_{ji}$  is closed. Since  $X$  is normal we may assume that  $B_{ji}$  is contained in the interior of  $B_j$ ,  $i+1$ . Let  $H_{ji}$  be the interior of  $B_{ji}$ ; then  $H_{ji} \subset B_{ji} \subset H_j$ ,  $i+1$  and  $X - A_j = \bigcup_i H_{ji}$ . And  $B_{ji} \subset X - A_j \subset X - F_j = \bigcup_{k < j} U_k$ .

Let  $V_i = U_i - \bigcup_{k < i} B_{ji}$ ; then  $V_i$  is open. If  $j < i$ ,  $B_{ji} \subset \bigcup_{k < j} U_k \subset \bigcup_{k < i} U_k$ ; hence  $\bigcup_{k < i} B_{ji} \subset \bigcup_{k < i} U_k$ . Hence  $V_i \supset U_i - \bigcup_{k < i} U_k$ . Thus, since each point  $x$  of  $X$  is in a first  $U_i$ , it is in the corresponding  $V_i$ . Therefore  $\{V_i\}$  is a covering of  $X$ . Clearly  $\{V_i\}$  is a refinement of  $\{U_i\}$ .

For each  $x$  of  $X$  there is some  $A_j$  such that  $x \text{ non } \in A_j$ ; hence, for some  $k$ ,  $x \in H_{jk}$ . Then, if  $i > j$  and  $i > k$ ,  $H_{jk} \subset B_{ji}$  and hence  $H_{jk} \cap V_i = 0$ . Thus the open set  $H_{jk}$  contains  $x$  and meets only a finite number of the sets  $V_i$ . Hence  $\{V_i\}$  is locally finite. Therefore  $X$  is countably paracompact.

**COROLLARY.** *Every perfectly normal space is countably paracompact.*

*Proof.* A perfectly normal space is a normal space in which every closed set is a  $G_\delta$ -set. Hence condition (e) is trivially satisfied with  $A_i = F_i$ .

Not every normal space is countably paracompact as the following example shows. Let  $X$  be a space whose points  $x$  are the real numbers. Let the open sets of  $X$  be the null set, the whole space  $X$  and the subsets  $G_a = \{x \mid x < a\}$  for all real  $a$ . Then  $X$  is trivially normal since there are no non-empty disjoint closed sets. But the countable covering  $\{G_i\}$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots$ ) where  $G_i = \{x \mid x < i\}$ , has no locally finite refinement. Hence  $X$  is not countably paracompact.<sup>4</sup>

3. We give here a sufficient condition for the normality of a product space.

**LEMMA 3.** *The topological product  $X \times Y$  of a countably paracompact normal space  $X$  and a compact metric space  $Y$  is normal.*

*Proof.* Let  $A$  and  $B$  be two disjoint closed sets of  $X \times Y$ . Let  $\{G_i\}$  be a

<sup>4</sup>This space is not a Hausdorff space. It would be interesting to have an example of a normal Hausdorff space which is not countably paracompact.

countable base for the open sets of  $Y$  and, if  $\gamma$  is any finite set of positive integers, let  $H_\gamma = \bigcup_{i \in \gamma} G_i$ . For each  $x \in X$  let  $A_x$  be the closed set of  $Y$  defined by  $x \times A_x = (x \times Y) \cap A$ ; similarly let  $x \times B_x = (x \times Y) \cap B$ . Let

$$U_\gamma = \{x \mid A_x \subset H_\gamma \subset \overline{H}_\gamma \subset Y - B_x\}.$$

Let  $x_0$  be a point of  $X$  for which  $A_{x_0} \subset H_\gamma$ . Then, for each  $y \in Y - H_\gamma$ ,  $(x_0, y) \notin A$  and, since  $A$  is closed, there is a neighbourhood  $N \times M$  of  $(x_0, y)$  which does not meet  $A$ . A finite number of the open sets  $M$  cover the compact set  $Y - H_\gamma$ . If  $N_{x_0}$  is the intersection of the corresponding finite number of open sets  $N$ ,  $N_{x_0} \times (Y - H_\gamma)$  does not meet  $A$ . Hence, if  $x \in N_{x_0}$ ,  $A_x \subset H_\gamma$ . Thus  $\{x \mid A_x \subset H_\gamma\}$  is an open set. Similarly  $\{x \mid \overline{H}_\gamma \subset Y - B_x\}$  is open and  $U_\gamma$ , which is the intersection of these two open sets, is also open.

Let  $x \in X$ ; then for each point  $y$  of  $A_x$  there is an open set  $G_i$  of the base such that  $y \in G_i$  and  $\overline{G}_i \cap B_x = \emptyset$ . A finite number of these sets  $G_i$  cover  $A_x$ , i.e., for some finite set  $\gamma$  of positive integers,  $A_x \subset \bigcup_{i \in \gamma} G_i = H_\gamma$  and  $\overline{H}_\gamma = \bigcup_{i \in \gamma} \overline{G}_i \subset Y - B_x$ . Hence  $x \in U_\gamma$ . Thus the open sets  $U_\gamma$  cover  $X$ . Since there are only a countable number of finite subsets  $\gamma$  of positive integers, the covering  $\{U_\gamma\}$  of  $X$  is countable.

Since  $X$  is countably paracompact there is a locally finite covering  $\{W_\gamma\}$  of  $X$  with  $W_\gamma \subset U_\gamma$  and, by condition c of Theorem 2,  $\{W_\gamma\}$  has a refinement  $\{V_\gamma\}$  (still locally finite) such that  $\overline{V}_\gamma \subset W_\gamma$ . Let  $U$  be the open set  $\bigcup_\gamma (V_\gamma \times H_\gamma)$ . For any point  $(x, y)$  of  $A$  and for some  $V_\gamma$ ,  $x \in V_\gamma \subset U_\gamma$ . Then  $y \in A_x \subset H_\gamma$  and hence  $(x, y) \in V_\gamma \times H_\gamma$ ; therefore  $A \subset U$ . Since  $\{V_\gamma\}$  is locally finite, each point  $x$  of  $X$  is contained in an open set  $G(x)$  which meets only a finite number of sets  $V_\gamma$ ; and hence the neighbourhood  $G(x) \times Y$  of  $(x, y)$  meets only a finite number of the sets  $V_\gamma \times H_\gamma$ . It follows that  $(x, y)$  is in the closure of  $U$  if and only if it is in the closure of some  $V_\gamma \times H_\gamma$ , i.e.,  $\overline{U} = \bigcup (\overline{V}_\gamma \times \overline{H}_\gamma)$ . But  $\overline{V}_\gamma \times \overline{H}_\gamma = \overline{V}_\gamma \times \overline{H}_\gamma$ . Hence  $\overline{U} = \bigcup (\overline{V}_\gamma \times \overline{H}_\gamma) \subset \bigcup (U_\gamma \times \overline{H}_\gamma)$ . But  $(U_\gamma \times \overline{H}_\gamma) \cap B = \emptyset$ ; hence  $\overline{U} \cap B = \emptyset$ . Thus the open set  $U$  contains  $A$  and its closure does not meet  $B$ . Hence  $X \times Y$  is normal.

4. In Theorem 4 below we extend some results of J. Dieudonné [2]. He showed<sup>5</sup> that paracompactness of a Hausdorff space  $X$  implies condition  $\beta$  (see below) on semicontinuous functions on  $X$  and our proof that  $\alpha \rightarrow \beta$  is a trivial modification of his proof. It also follows immediately from Dieudonné's results that if  $X$  is a paracompact Hausdorff space,  $X \times I$  is a paracompact Hausdorff space and hence is normal. However, in terms of countable paracompactness we are able to give a necessary and sufficient condition for  $\beta$  and  $\gamma$  to hold. The equivalence of conditions  $\beta$  and  $\gamma$  was conjectured by S. Eilenberg.

**THEOREM 4.** *The following three properties of a topological space  $X$  are equivalent.*

- (a). *The space  $X$  is countably paracompact and normal.*

<sup>5</sup>See [2], Theorem 9.

(β). If  $g$  is a lower semicontinuous real function on  $X$  and  $h$  is an upper semicontinuous real function on  $X$  and if  $h(x) < g(x)$  for all  $x \in X$ , then there exists a continuous real function  $f$  such that  $h(x) < f(x) < g(x)$  for all  $x \in X$ .

(γ). The topological product  $X \times I$  of  $X$  with the closed line interval  $I = [0, 1]$  is normal.

*Proof.* (a)  $\rightarrow$  (β). Let  $X$  be a countably paracompact normal space and let  $g$  and  $h$  be lower and upper semicontinuous functions respectively with  $h(x) < g(x)$ . If  $r$  is a rational number let  $G_r = \{x \mid h(x) < r < g(x)\}$ . Since  $g$  is lower semicontinuous,  $\{x \mid g(x) > r\}$  is open, and, since  $h$  is upper semicontinuous,  $\{x \mid h(x) < r\}$  is open. Hence  $G_r$  is open. Since, for every  $x$ ,  $h(x) < g(x)$  there is some rational number  $r(x)$  with  $h(x) < r(x) < g(x)$ ; hence  $x \in G_{r(x)}$ . Thus  $\{G_r\}$  is a covering of  $X$ . And, since the rational numbers are countable,  $\{G_r\}$  is a countable covering. Hence, since  $X$  is countably paracompact and normal, there is a locally finite covering  $\{U_r\}$  of  $X$  with  $U_r \subset G_r$  and there is a (locally finite) covering  $\{V_r\}$  with  $\bar{V}_r \subset U_r$ .

There is a continuous function  $f_r$  with  $-\infty \leq f_r(x) \leq r$  such that  $f_r(x) = -\infty$  if  $x \notin U_r$  and  $f_r(x) = r$  if  $x \in \bar{V}_r$ . Let  $f(x)$  be the least upper bound of  $f_r(x)$  for all  $r$ . Each point  $x_0$  of  $X$  is contained in an open set  $N(x_0)$  which meets only a finite number of the sets  $U_r$ . Hence, in  $N(x_0)$ , for all but a finite number of values of  $r$ ,  $f_r(x) = -\infty$ . Thus, in each neighbourhood  $N(x_0)$ ,  $f(x)$  is the least upper bound of a finite number of continuous functions, hence  $f$  is continuous. In  $U_r$ ,  $f_r(x) \leq r < g(x)$  and, in  $X - U_r$ ,  $f_r(x) = -\infty < g(x)$ . Thus  $f_r(x) < g(x)$  and, for each  $x$ ,  $f(x)$  is the least upper bound of a finite number of  $f_r(x)$  each less than  $g(x)$ . Therefore  $f(x) < g(x)$ . Each  $x$  is in some  $V_r$  and, for this  $r$ ,  $f_r(x) = r$ ; hence  $f(x) \geq f_r(x) = r > h(x)$ . Hence  $f(x) > h(x)$ . Therefore  $h(x) < f(x) < g(x)$ .

(β)  $\rightarrow$  (a). Let  $X$  be a space satisfying condition (β) and let  $A$  and  $B$  be two disjoint closed sets in  $X$ . Let  $h$  be the characteristic function of  $A$ , i.e.,  $h(x) = 1$  if  $x \in A$  and  $h(x) = 0$  if  $x \notin A$ . Let  $g$  be defined by  $g(x) = 1$  if  $x \in B$  and  $g(x) = 2$  if  $x \notin B$ . Then  $g$  is lower semicontinuous,  $h$  is upper semicontinuous and  $h(x) < g(x)$  for all  $x \in X$ . Hence there is a continuous function  $f$  with  $h(x) < f(x) < g(x)$ . Let  $U = \{x \mid f(x) > 1\}$  and  $V = \{x \mid f(x) < 1\}$ . Then  $U$  and  $V$  are disjoint open sets and  $A \subset U$  and  $B \subset V$ . Hence  $X$  is normal.

Let  $\{F_i\}$  ( $i = 1, 2, \dots$ ) be a decreasing sequence of closed sets with  $\bigcap F_i = \emptyset$ . Let  $g$  be defined by  $g(x) = 1/(i + 1)$  for  $x \in F_i - F_{i+1}$  ( $i = 0, 1, \dots$ ), where  $F_0$  means the whole space  $X$ . Let  $h(x) = 0$  for all  $x \in X$ . Then  $g$  is lower semicontinuous,  $h$  is upper semicontinuous and  $h(x) < g(x)$  for all  $x$ . Hence there is a continuous function  $f$  with  $0 < f(x) < g(x)$ . Let  $G_i = \{x \mid f(x) < 1/(i + 1)\}$ . Then  $G_i$  is open,  $F_i \subset G_i$  and, since  $f(x) > 0$  for all  $x$ ,  $\bigcap G_i = \emptyset$ . Thus condition  $d$  of Theorem 2 is satisfied and therefore  $X$  is countably paracompact.

(a)  $\rightarrow$  (γ). This follows immediately from Lemma 3 and the fact that the interval  $I$  is a compact metric space.

( $\gamma$ )  $\rightarrow$  (a). Let  $X$  be a space for which  $X \times I$  is normal. Then  $X$  is homeomorphic to the closed subset  $X \times 0$  of the normal space  $X \times I$ ; therefore  $X$  is normal.

Let  $\{F_i\} (i = 1, 2, \dots)$ , be a decreasing sequence of closed sets with  $\bigcap F_i = 0$ . Then, since the half open interval  $[0, 1/i[$  is open in  $I = [0, 1]$ ,  $W_i = (X - F_i) \times [0, 1/i[$  is open in  $X \times I$ . Let  $A$  be the closed set  $X \times I - \bigcup_i W_i$ . If  $x \in X$ , then, for some  $i$ ,  $x \in X - F_i$  and  $(x, 0) \in W_i$  and hence  $(x, 0) \notin A$ . Hence, if  $B = X \times 0$ ,  $A$  and  $B$  are disjoint closed sets of the normal space  $X \times I$ . Therefore there are disjoint open sets  $U$  and  $V$  with  $A \subset U$  and  $B \subset V$ . Let  $G_i = \{x \mid (x, 1/i) \in U\}$ ; then  $G_i$  is open. For each  $x \in X$ ,  $(x, 0) \in B$  and hence, for sufficiently large  $i$ ,  $(x, 1/i) \in V$  and hence  $x \notin G_i$ . Therefore  $\bigcap G_i = 0$ . Let  $x \in F_i$ . Then, if  $j \leq i$ ,  $F_i \subset F_j$  and  $x \notin X - F_j$ , and, if  $j \geq i$ ,  $1/i \notin [0, 1/j[$ . Hence  $(x, 1/i) \notin \bigcup_j W_j$ ; hence  $(x, 1/i) \in A \subset U$  and hence  $x \in G_i$ . Therefore  $F_i \subset G_i$ . Thus condition (d) of Theorem 2 is satisfied and therefore  $X$  is countably paracompact. This completes the proof of the theorem.

## REFERENCES

- [1] P. Alexandroff and H. Hopf, *Topologie I* (Berlin, 1935).
- [2] J. Dieudonné, *Une généralisation des espaces compacts*, Journal de Mathématiques Pures et Appliquées, vol. 23 (1944), 65-76.
- [3] S. Lefschetz, *Algebraic Topology* (New York, 1942).
- [4] R. H. Sorgenfrey, *On the topological product of paracompact spaces*. Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., vol. 53 (1947), 631-632.
- [5] A. H. Stone, *Paracompactness and product spaces*, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., vol. 54 (1948), 977-982.

*Harvard University*