

**BEHAVIORAL
AND
BRAIN SCIENCES**

**Volume 1
1978**

Reprinted with the permission of the original publisher
by
Periodicals Service Company
Germantown, NY
2006

Printed on acid-free paper.

**This reprint was reproduced from the
best original edition copy available.**

**NOTE TO THE REPRINT EDITION:
In some cases full page advertisements which do not add to
the scholarly value of this volume have been omitted.
As a result, some reprinted volumes may have irregular pagination.**

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

*An International Journal of Current Research and
Theory with Open Peer Commentary*

ISSN 0140-525X

Editor

Stevan Harnad

Editorial Assistant

Helaine Randerson

Associate Editors

Animal Intelligence

David Premack

Department of Psychology, University of Pennsylvania

Behavioral Biology

Hans Kummer

Zoologisches Institut und Museum der Universität Zürich

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn

Department of Psychology, University of Western Ontario

Ethology and Neuroethology

John C. Fentress

Department of Psychology, Dalhousie University, Halifax, N.S.

Higher CNS Function

Robert W. Doty

Center for Brain Research, University of Rochester

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes

Department of Psychology, Princeton University

Language and Cognition

Peter Wason

Psycholinguistics Research Unit, University College London

Neurobiology

Barry H. Smith

Surgical Neurology Branch

National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, Md.

Neuropsychology

Karl Pribram

Department of Psychology, Stanford University

Volume 1 1978

Cambridge University Press

Cambridge London New York

1978

Published by the Syndics of The Cambridge University Press
The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP
Bentley House, 200 Euston Road, London NW1 2DB
32 East 57th Street, New York, NY 10022

© Cambridge University Press 1978

Printed in the United States of America by Science Press, Ephrata, Pennsylvania

Target Article

Kupfermann, I. & Weiss, K. The command neuron concept 3

Open Peer Commentary

Hoyle, G. *Where did the notion of "command neurons" come from?* 10
 Andrae, J. H. *Descriptive and prescriptive names* 11
 Balaban, P. *"General" or "general assembly"?* *On command neuron systems* 12
 Bennett, M. V. L. *Command neurons: know and say what you mean* 13
 Bullock, T. H. *"Command" is heuristic until we know better* 15
 Burke, R. E. *"Command" as functional concept rather than cellular label* 15
 Chapple, W. D. *Do we need "command" neurons?* 16
 Davis, W. J. *On the trail of the command neuron* 17
 Evoy, W. H. *Functional descriptions of neurons that influence behavior* 19
 Fentress, J. C. *On the sufficiency of command neurons* 20
 Fowler, C. A. & Turvey, M. T. *The concept of "command neurons" in explanations of behavior* 20
 Fraser, P. *Vector coding and command fibres* 22
 Grillner, S. *Command neurons or central program controlling system?* 23
 Hermann, A. *Command fibers: only strategic points in neuronal communication systems* 24
 Horridge, G. A. *Nouns, neurons, and parallel pathways* 25
 Iles, J. F. *The command neurone concept in mammalian neurophysiology* 25
 Kater, S. B. & Granzow, B. *Is "command" at the top of the hierarchy?* 26
 Krasne, F. *The crayfish giant fibers as decision and command neurons* 28
 Kristan, Jr., W. B. & Weeks, J. *Difficulties in applying a functional definition of command neurons* 28
 Larimer, J. L. *Command neuron, an evolving concept* 29
 Lewis, E. R. *Causally oriented devices* 30
 Lleinas, R. & Bunge, M. *Restricted applicability of the concept of command in neuroscience: dangers of metaphor* 30
 Lynch, J. C. *The command function concept in studies of the primate nervous system* 31
 McCarthy, J. *Command neurons and unitary behavior* 32
 Rosenbaum, D. A. *Command neurons and effects of movement contexts* 32
 Stein, P. S. G. *Defense of the Wiersma-Kennedy concept of the command neuron* 33
 Tsukada, Y. *Ambiguity of the proposed definition* 34
 Wiersma, C. A. G. *The original definition of command neuron* 34
 Wine, J. J. *Triggering and organizing functions of command neurons in crayfish escape behavior* 35
 Zucker, R. S. *Command neurons: a more precise definition reveals gaps in our evidence and limits to our models* 35
 Hoyle, G. *Who believes in "command neurons"?* 36

Authors' Response

Kupfermann, I. & Weiss, K. *Quis imperat?* a panorama of perspectives 37

Target Article

Bindra, D. *How adaptive behavior is produced: a perceptual-motivational alternative to response reinforcement* 41

Open Peer Commentary

Bitterman, M. E. *Bindra's S-S contiguity theory of instrumental learning* 52
 Black, A. H. *Is Bindra's theory of adaptive behavior radical enough?* 53
 Bolles, R. C. *The more things change . . .* 53
 Booth, D. A. *A long stride towards sense in psychology* 54
 Catania, A. C. *What constitutes explanation in psychology* 55
 Dennett, D. C. *Requisition for a pexgo* 56
 Epstein, R. *Reinforcement, explanation, and B. F. Skinner* 57
 Fentress, J. C. *Defining behavioral representations* 58
 Flynn, J. P. *Sensory vs. motor effects of brain stimulation* 58
 Gallistel, C. R. *The irrelevance of past pleasure* 59
 Gilbert, R. M. *Misconceptions about the origins of behavior* 60
 Hilgard, E. R. *With reinforcement in trouble, what about motivation?*—Bindra's alternative 61
 Hulse, S. H. *The problem of serial order in adaptive behavior: why not some formal cognitive structure* 62
 Irwin, F. W. *Some comparisons of Bindra's theory with a situation-act-outcome system* 63
 Jenkins, H. M. *Signal learning and response learning* 64
 Kendler, H. H. *Decision rules, decision rules* 64
 Killeen, P. R. *Pexgo: a plausible construct in need of data* 65

Klingsporn, M. J. <i>On explanation, familiarity, and response sequencing</i>	66
Logan, F. A. <i>Intelligent vs. stupid behavior, or learning concepts vs. responses</i>	67
Mackintosh, N. J. <i>Limits on reinterpreting instrumental conditioning in terms of classical conditioning</i>	67
Mazur, J. E. <i>Reinforcement is dead: long live reinforcement theories</i>	68
Menzel, Jr., E. W. <i>Reinforcement theory: an experimenter-oriented rather than a subject-oriented philosophy</i>	68
Mowrer, O. H. <i>Learning theory, a will-o-the-wisp?</i>	69
Murray, E. J. <i>Implications for clinical behavior modification</i>	70
Navarick, D. J. <i>A framework with no foundation: comments on Bindra's perceptual-motivation theory of response production</i>	71
Notterman, J. M. <i>Feedback systems invite tautological constructs</i>	71
Pribram, K. H. <i>Stimulus theory and response theory: their complementarity and neurobehavioral basis</i>	72
Rosenblatt, J. S. <i>Behavioral evolution and individual development</i>	73
Ryan, T. A. <i>Bindra's theory from the perspective of human motivation: unit size, stimulus centering, and the value of neural theory</i>	74
Salzinger, K. <i>A death too soon reported</i>	75
Soltysik, S. S. <i>Omnipotent pexgos and the goddess parsimony</i>	76
Staats, A. W. <i>Bindra's perceptual-motivational theory and social behaviorism's emotional-motivational theory: separatism exemplified</i>	77
Stein, D. G. <i>Perception as response</i>	77
Teevan, R. C. <i>Skinner, Maslow, and common sense</i>	79
von Glasersfeld, E. <i>Another minor revision, or the disregard for control theory and the analysis of inductive feedback systems</i>	79
Warren, J. M. <i>Neural mechanisms and Occam's razor</i>	80
Wasserman, E. A. <i>Bindra's theory: some successes and precursors</i>	80
Wong, R. <i>Behavioral flexibility in learning situations: adaptive or adaptable behavior?</i>	81
Wood, W. S. <i>In defense of descriptive behaviorism, or theories of learning still aren't necessary</i>	82

Author's Response

Bindra, D. A behavioristic, cognitive-motivational, neuropsychological approach to explaining behavior	83
--	----

Target Article

Pylyshyn, Z. Computational models and empirical constraints	93
---	----

Open Peer Commentary

Andreae, J. H. <i>AI: another defense of the field</i>	100
Arbib, M. A. <i>The halting problem for computational cognitive psychology</i>	100
Atherton, M. <i>The artificiality of computer models</i>	100
Cohen, L. J. <i>Rational reconstruction of inferential processes—a task straddling the AI-CS boundaries</i>	101
Cushing, S. & Hornstein, N. <i>Software systems, language, and empirical constraints</i>	102
Dennett, D. C. <i>Why not the whole iguana?</i>	103
Domotor, Z. <i>AI: model-theoretic aspects</i>	104
Dreyfus, H. L. <i>Empirical evidence for a pessimistic prognosis for cognitive science</i>	105
Goodluck, H. <i>Levels of evolution and psycholinguistic evidence</i>	105
Harmon, L. D. <i>Introspection, black boxes, and machine equivalence</i>	106
Haugeland, J. <i>The problem of generality</i>	107
Hayes, P. J. <i>Doing AI but saying CS</i>	108
Johnson-Laird, P. N. <i>The correspondence and coherence theories of cognitive truth</i>	108
Leibovic, K. N. <i>The problem of validation</i>	109
Lenat, D. B. <i>On astrophysics and superhuman performance</i>	109
Longuet-Higgins, C. <i>On describing cognitive processes</i>	110
McDermott, J. <i>On A.I. as psychology: now and then</i>	110
Newell, A. <i>State-of-the-art constraints</i>	111
Ortony, A. <i>Cognitive psychology, artificial intelligence, and cognitive simulation</i>	112
Pascual-Leone, J. <i>Computational models for metasubjective processes</i>	112
Pribram, K. H. <i>On behalf of the neurosciences</i>	113
Rodger, R. S. <i>Computer-specific methods</i>	113
Schank, R. C. <i>AI vs. CS: a methodological distinction</i>	114
Simon, T. W. <i>The AI/CS distinction and theory evaluation</i>	114
Slooman, A. <i>Artificial intelligence and empirical psychology</i>	115
Sutherland, N. S. <i>Task constraints and process models</i>	116
Treisman, M. <i>On the relation between AI and CS: the heart of the problem</i>	117
Ullman, S. <i>A.I. systems and human cognition: the missing link</i>	117
Weimer, W. B. <i>A.I. and the methodology of scientific research: some cautions and limitations</i>	119
Wilks, Y. <i>Artificial intelligence and real constraints</i>	120

Author's Response

Pylyshyn, Z. The A.I. debate: generality, goals, and methodological parochialism 121

Target Article

Roland, P. E. Sensory feedback to the cerebral cortex during voluntary movement in man 129

Open Peer Commentary

Chapple, W. D. *Consciousness and the limitations of psychophysical approaches* 148

Dickinson, J. *The function of sensory feedback* 148

Duysens, J. & Loeb, G. *Precortical processing of somatosensory information* 149

Dyhre-Poulsen, P. *Possible sources of discriminative kinaesthetic information* 150

Freund, H.-J. *The role of extrapyramidal structures* 150

Goodwin, G. M. *The neural mechanisms subserving kinesthesia* 151

Granit, R. *Breaking down open doors* 152

Grigg, P. *On the attribution of a functional role to joint afferent neurons* 152

Iannone, A. M. *What constitutes "proof" in the study of neural control of movement?* 153

Kelso, J. A. S. *Changing views of feedforward and feedback in voluntary movement* 153

Levitt, M. *On the role of mental set in voluntary movement* 154

Libet, B. *What is conscious sensory experience, operationally?* 156

McCloskey, D. I. *Sense of effort and sense of muscular tension* 156

Millar, J. *Lab strategy vs. life strategy* 157

Mpitsos, G. J. *Musculotendinous receptors in conscious human behavior: experimental factors* 157

Pribram, K. H. *Movements and acts: distinguishing their neurophysiology* 158

Pubols, L. M. *On intellectual compensation and deafferentation* 159

Roberts, T. D. M. *The transmission of parameters by neural messages* 159

Shebilske, W. L. *Sensory feedback during eye movements reconsidered* 160

Somjen, G. G. *What muscle spindles and Golgi tendon organs could and could not signal to the brain* 161

Sontag, K.-H. *Conscious and unconscious motor decisions* 162

Stein, J. *The interaction of motor and sensory signals in proprioception* 162

Stevens, J. K. *The corollary discharge: is it a sense of position or a sense of space?* 163

Trevarthen, C. *Cortical collaboration and consciousness* 165

Walsh, E. G. *Sensing springiness* 166

Wells, M. J. *Invertebrate stretch receptors and consciousness* 166

Wiesendanger, M. *Toward contextual instead of either/or thinking* 167

Author's Response

Roland, P. E. The cerebral cortex and conscious kinaesthetic and tensional information 167

Number 2, June 1978

Target Article

Brainerd, C. J. The stage question in cognitive-developmental theory 173

Open Peer Commentary

Baldwin, J. D. & J. I. *Stages resulting from continuous underlying variables* 182

Berndt, T. J. *Stages as descriptions, explanations, and testable constraints* 183

Ennis, R. H. *Description, explanation, and circularity* 184

Epstein, H. T. *Some additional data relevant to considerations about the existence of cognitive-developmental stages* 185

Fischer, K. W. *Structural explanation of developmental change* 186

Flavell, J. H. *Developmental stage: explanans or explanandum?* 187

Gibson, K. R. *Cortical maturation: an antecedent of Piaget's behavioral stages* 188

Karmiloff-Smith, A. *On stage: the importance of being a nonconserver* 188

Kendler, T. S. *On falsifying descriptions* 190

Kinsbourne, M. *Maturational succession vs. cumulative learning* 191

Klahr, D. *Rages over stages* 191

Kurtines, W. M. *Measurability, description, and explanation: the explanatory adequacy of stage models* 192

Lipsitt, L. P. *"Stages" in developmental psychology* 194

Markman, E. M. *Problems of logic and evidence* 194

Neimark, E. D. *Improper questions cannot be properly answered* 195

Nelson, K. *Structural and developmental explanations: stages in theoretical development* 196

Olson, D. R. *A structuralist view of explanation: a critique of Brainerd* 197

Parker, S. T. *Species-specific acquisition vs. universal sequence of acquisition* 199

Pascual-Leone, J. *Piaget's two main stage criteria: a selective reply to Brainerd* 200

Rosenthal, T. L. *Agnostic gauges and Geneva stages* 201

The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

*An International Journal of Current Research and
Theory with Open Peer Commentary*

Volume 1 no. 1

1978

Cambridge University Press

March 1978
Volume 1
Number 1

ISSN 0140-525X



The Behavioral and Brain Sciences

*An International Journal of Current Research and
Theory with Open Peer Commentary*

In this issue

The Command Neuron Concept

3

by Irving Kupfermann and Klaudiusz R. Weiss

With Commentary by G. Hoyle, J. H. Andreae, P. Balaban, M. V. L. Bennett, T. H. Bullock, R. E. Burke, W. D. Chapple, W. J. Davis, W. H. Evoy, J. C. Fentress, C. A. Fowler and M. T. Turvey, P. Fraser, S. Grillner, A. Herman, G. A. Horridge, J. F. Iles, S. B. Kater and B. Granzow, F. Krasne, W. B. Kristan, Jr. and J. Weeks, J. L. Larimer, E. R. Lewis, R. Llinás and M. Bunge, J. C. Lynch, J. McCarthy, D. A. Rosenbaum, P. S. G. Stein, Y. Tsukada, C. A. G. Wiersma, J. J. Wine, R. S. Zucker

How Adaptive Behavior is Produced: A Perceptual-Motivational Alternative to Response-Reinforcement

41

by Dalbir Bindra

With Commentary by M. E. Bitterman, A. H. Black, R. C. Bolles, D. A. Booth, A. C. Catania, D. C. Dennett, R. Epstein, J. C. Fentress, J. P. Flynn, C. R. Gallistel, R. M. Gilbert, E. R. Hilgard, S. H. Hulse, F. W. Irwin, H. M. Jenkins, H. H. Kendler, P. R. Killeen, M. J. Klingsporn, F. A. Logan, N. J. Mackintosh, J. E. Mazur, E. W. Menzel, Jr., O. H. Mowrer, E. J. Murray, D. J. Navarick, J. M. Notterman, K. H. Pribram, J. S. Rosenblatt, T. A. Ryan, K. Salzinger, S. S. Soltysik, A. W. Staats, D. G. Stein, R. C. Teevan, E. von Glasersfeld, J. M. Warren, E. A. Wasserman, R. Wong, W. S. Wood

Computational Models and Empirical Constraints

93

by Zenon Pylyshyn

With Commentary by J. H. Andreae, M. A. Arbib, M. L. Atherton, L. J. Cohen, S. Cushing and N. Hornstein, D. C. Dennett, Z. Domotor, H. L. Dreyfus, H. Goodluck, L. D. Harmon, J. Haugeland, P. J. Hayes, P. N. Johnson-Laird, K. N. Leibovic, D. B. Lenat, C. Longuet-Higgins, J. McDermott, A. Newell, A. Ortony, J. Pascual-Leone, K. H. Pribram, R. S. Rodger, R. C. Schank, T. W. Simon, A. Sloman, N. S. Sutherland, M. Treisman, S. Ullman, W. B. Weimer, Y. Wilks,

Sensory Feedback to the Cerebral Cortex During Voluntary Movement in Man

129

by P. E. Roland

With Commentary by W. D. Chapple, J. Dickinson, J. Duysens and G. Loeb, P. Dyhre-Poulsen, H.-J. Freund, G. M. Goodwin, R. Granit, P. Grigg, A. M. Iannone, J. A. S. Kelso, M. Levitt, B. Libet, D. I. McCloskey, J. Millar, G. J. Mptsos, K. H. Pribram, L. M. Pubols, T. D. M. Roberts, W. L. Shebilske, G. G. Somjen, K.-H. Sontag, J. Stein, J. K. Stevens, C. Trevarthen, E. G. Walsh, M. J. Wells, M. Wiesendanger

Cambridge
University
Press