

VOLUME 11
NUMBER 1
MARCH 1988

An International Journal of Current Research
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

On the proper treatment of connectionism Paul Smolensky

Implications of the "initial brain" concept for brain evolution in Cetacea Ilya I. Glezer, Myron S. Jacobs & Peter J. Morgane

A framework for the functional analysis of behaviour Alasdair I. Houston
& John M. McNamara

Also, Continuing Commentary on

"Précis of Behaviorism: A conceptual reconstruction" (Zuriff)

"An immunoreactive theory of selective male affliction" (Gualtieri & Hicks)

C A M B R I D G E U N I V E R S I T Y P R E S S

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editor

Stevan Harnad
20 Nassau St., Suite 240
Princeton, NJ 08542

Managing Editor

Chooi-Yeok Kuan

Copy Editor (Chief)

Avis Kniffen

Associate Editors

Behavioral Biology

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

Biosocial Behavior

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

Evolutionary Biology

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

History and Systems

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

Language and Cognition

Philip Johnson-Laird/MRC, Cambridge
Peter Wason/University College, London

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Birbeck College, London

Linguistics

Robert Freidin/Princeton

Neurobiology

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

Neuropharmacology

Susan D. Iversen/Merck Sharp and Dohme, Ltd.

Neuropsychology

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London

Neurophysiology

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

Paleoneurology

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

Perception

Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

Philosophy

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

Philosophy of Science

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh

Psychobiology

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut
David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

Quantitative Methods

Donald B. Rubin/Harvard

Vision and Artificial Intelligence

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write to the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

Copying This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (27 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 11 (1988) is US \$147.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£89.00 in the U.K.; £96.00 in the rest of the world) for institutions; US \$63.00 net (£41.00) for individuals; US \$36.00 net (£25.00) for BBS Associates; and US \$36.00 net (£25.00) for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$41.00 net (£25.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y. and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 11:1 March 1988

Smolensky, P. On the proper treatment of connectionism		1
Open Peer Commentary		
Antony, L. & Levine, J. On the proper treatment of the connection between connectionism and symbolism	23	
Bechtel, W. Connectionism and interlevel relations	24	
Belew, R. K. Two constructive themes	25	
Chandrasekaran, B., Goel, A. & Allemang, D. Information processing abstractions: The message still counts more than the medium	26	
Cleland, C. E. Is Smolensky's treatment of connectionism on the level?	27	
Dellarosa, D. The psychological appeal of connectionism	28	
Dietrich, E. & Fields, C. Some assumptions underlying Smolensky's treatment of connectionism	29	
Dreyfus, H. L. & Dreyfus, S. E. On the proper treatment of Smolensky	31	
Dyer, M. G. The promise and problems of connectionism	32	
Freeman, W. J. Dynamic systems and the "subsymbolic level"	33	
Freidin, R. Connectionism and the study of language	34	
Golden, R. M. Statistical rationality	35	
Hofstadter, D. R. Common sense and conceptual halos	35	
Hunter, L. E. Some memory, but no mind	37	
Hanson, S. J. On the obvious treatment of connectionism	38	
Lakoff, G. Smolensky, semantics, and the sensorimotor system	39	
Lehnert, W. G. Physics, cognition, and connectionism: An interdisciplinary alchemy	40	
Lindsay, R. K. Can this treatment raise the dead?	41	
Lloyd, D. Connectionism in the golden age of cognitive science	42	
Lycan, W. G. Symbols, subsymbols, neurons	43	
McCarthy, J. Epistemological challenges for connectionism	44	
Mortensen, C. In defence of neurons	44	
Nelson, R. J. Connections among connections	45	
Prince, A. & Pinker, S. Subsymbols aren't much good outside of a symbol-processing architecture	46	
Quarton, G. C. A two-dimensional array of models of cognitive function	48	
Rey, G. Sanity surrounded by madness	48	
Rueckl, J. G. Making the connections	50	
Schneider, W. Structure and controlling subsymbolic processing	51	
Shepard, R. N. How fully should connectionism be activated? Two sources of excitation and one of inhibition	52	
Stich, S. P. From connectionism to eliminativism	53	
Stone, G. O. From data to dynamics: The use of multiple levels of analysis	54	
Touretzky, D. S. On the proper treatment of thermostats	55	
den Uyl, M. J. The essential opacity of modular systems: Why even connectionism cannot give complete formal accounts of cognition	56	
Van Gulick, R. Has the case been made against the ecumenical view of connectionism?	57	
Woodfield, A. & Morton, A. The reality of the symbolic and subsymbolic systems	58	
Editorial Commentary		58
Author's Response		
Smolensky, P. Putting together connectionism – again		59

Glezer, I. I., Jacobs, M. S. & Morgane, P. J. Implications of the "initial brain" concept for brain evolution in Cetacea 75

Open Peer Commentary		
Aronson, L. R. & Tobach, E. Conservative aspects of the dolphin cortex match its behavioral level	89	
Campbell, C. B. G. Primitive survivors and neocortical evolution	90	
Carlson, M. Evolution of the brain in Cetacea – is bigger better?	91	
Eisenberg, J. F. Cetacean brains have a structure similar to the brains of primitive mammals; does this imply limits in function?	92	
Falk, D. Allometry cannot be ignored in brain evolution studies	92	
Gibson, K. R. Fish, sea snakes, dolphins, teeth and brains—some evolutionary paradoxes	93	
Innocenti, G. M. Developmental axes and evolutionary trees	94	
Irsigler, F. J. Morphogenetic versus morphofunctional theory	95	
Johnson, J. I. Whose brain is initial-like?	96	
Kaas, J. H. Determining species differences in numbers of cortical areas and modules: The architectonic method needs supplementation	96	
Neafsey, E. J. The concept of association cortex should be abandoned	97	
Parker, S. T. Putting all cetacean brains in one category is a big order	97	
Reep, R. L. The "initial brain": Initial considerations	98	
Rensch, B. What about <i>Sirenia</i> ?	99	
Ridgway, S. H. & Wood, F. G. Cetacean brain evolution	99	
Shoshani, J. Elephants have a large neocortex too	100	
Stein, B. E. Concepts of brain evolution	100	
Steklis, H. D. Climbing the evolutionary ladder of success: The scala naturae in models of brain evolution	101	
Szentágothai, J. Elegant hypotheses are intellectually rewarding; even more so if more hard data were available	102	
Valverde, F. Competition for the sake of diversity	102	
Wilczynski, W. Evolutionary events and the "modification/multiplication" relationship	103	
Wind, J. Brain evolution: Some problems of interpretation	104	
Zilles, K. & Rehkämper, G. The initial brain concept: A work in progress	105	
Authors' Response		
Glezer, I. I., Jacobs, M. S. & Morgane, P. J. The "initial" brain concept: Its uses and misuses		106

Houston, A. I. & McNamara, J. M. A framework for the functional analysis of behaviour **117**

Open Peer Commentary			
Alexander, R. McN. The risks of the chase	130	Rachlin, H. Biological relevance	144
Barnard, C. J. Policy-making for survival: Reading the rules and small print	130	Reid, A. K. Realistic versus minimal models	144
Calder, W. A., III State, function, and optimization	131	Scudo, F. M. Behavior, adaptedness, and Darwinian theories	145
Caraco, T. Fitness, currencies, and models	133	Shaw, R. E. & Carolan, T. F. Adjoint optimal control	146
Clark, C. W. Applications and limitations of dynamic programming in behavioral theory	134	Sherry, D. F. Dynamic programming: From eternity to here	147
Dawkins, M. S. Motivation, decision-making, and choice	134	Sih, A. On analyzing complex relationships between behavior, state and fitness	148
Fantino, E. Conditioned reinforcement and reproductive success	135	Smith, E. A. Realism, generality, or testability: The ecological modeler's dilemma	149
Heiner, R. A. Adapting canonical costs and robust rules for imperfect decisions	135	Stenseth, N. C. Houston & McNamara are right, but are they helpful to empiricists?	150
Heyman, G. M. Optimization theory: A too narrow path	136	Timberlake, W. Constructing optimal sequences of behavior: Backwards is beautiful, but . . .	151
Huntingford, F. A. & Metcalfe, N. B. The functional analysis of behaviour: Making room for Prufrock	137	Westerterp, K. Optimization of energy gain: Theory and practice	152
King, G. R. & Logue, A. W. Norms of behavior: Balancing generality with testability	138	Yoerg, S. I. Skepticism about dynamic modeling: General problems and the special problems of learning	153
Mangel, M. Dynamic theories of behavior	139		
Morse, D. H. Behavior and fitness	141	Authors' Response	
Navarick, D. J. Is there a preference for variability?	141	Houston, A. I. & McNamara, J. M. There's no such thing as a free lunch	154
Partridge, L. D. Evolution of a controller of state!	142		
Powers, W. T. A nonfunctional analysis of behavior	143		

Continuing Commentary **165**

<i>On</i> Zuriff, G. E. (1986) <i>Précis of Behaviorism: A conceptual reconstruction</i> . BBS 9:687–724.			165
Lachman, R. Behaviorism: Counterarguments are pointless	165	Author's Response	
		Zuriff, G. E. A counterargument, nevertheless	166
<i>On</i> Gualtieri, T. & Hicks, R. E. (1985) An immunoreactive theory of selective male affliction. BBS 8:427-441.			167
Berglin, C.-G. Statements on male antigenicity based on faulty statistical analysis	167	James, W. H. A further note on the alleged antecedent brother effect in sex ratio	168