

# THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

## **Edited by**

Hannes Leitgeb, *Coordinating Editor*

Rosalie Iemhoff

Carsten Lutz

Paolo Mancosu

Graham Priest

Ian Proops

Alasdair Urquhart

Richard Zach

**VOLUME 6 • NUMBER 1 • MARCH 2013 • ISSN 1755-0203**

Copyright © 2013 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.  
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.



PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.  
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL MEMBERS.

# THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

## Coordinating Editor

Hannes Leitgeb

*Department of Philosophy, Philosophy of Science, and Study of Religion  
Ludwig-Maximilians-University, Munich*

## Editors

Rosalie Iemhoff

*Department of Philosophy  
Utrecht University*

Carsten Lutz

*Department of Computer Science  
University of Bremen*

Paolo Mancosu

*Department of Philosophy  
University of California, Berkeley*

Catarina Noaves

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Amsterdam*

Graham Priest

*The Graduate Center  
City University of New York*

Ian Proops

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Texas at Austin*

Robert van Rooij

*Department of Philosophy and  
Institute for Logic  
University of Amsterdam*

Alasdair Urquhart

*Departments of Philosophy and  
Computer Science  
University of Toronto*

Richard Zach

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Calgary*

## Advisory Board

Maria Aloni

*Department of Philosophy and Institute  
for Logic, Language and Computation  
University of Amsterdam*

Steve Awodey

*Department of Philosophy  
Carnegie Mellon University*

Roy Cook

*Department of Philosophy and Minnesota  
Center for Philosophy of Science  
University of Minnesota*

Hartry Field

*Department of Philosophy  
New York University*

Kit Fine

*Departments of Philosophy  
and Mathematics  
New York University*

Michael Friedman

*Department of Philosophy  
Stanford University*

Marcus Kracht

*Department of Linguistic and  
Literary Studies  
University of Bielefeld*

John MacFarlane

*Department of Philosophy and Group in  
Logic and Methodology of Science  
University of California, Berkeley*

Edwin Mares

*School of History, Philosophy, Political  
Science & International Relations  
Victoria University of Wellington*

Lawrence Moss

*Department of Mathematics  
Indiana University*

Rohit Parikh

*Department of Computer and Information  
Science Brooklyn College, City University  
of New York*

Greg Restall

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Melbourne*

Colin Stirling

*School of Informatics  
University of Edinburgh*

James Tappenden

*Department of Philosophy  
University of Michigan*

Johan van Benthem

*Institute for Logic,  
Language  
and Computation  
University of Amsterdam and  
Department of Philosophy  
Stanford University*

Michiel van Lambalgen

*Institute for Logic,  
Language and  
Computation and  
Department of Philosophy  
University of Amsterdam*

Rineke Verbrugge

*Institute of Artificial Intelligence  
University of Groningen*

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	
FEFERMAN 1977 .....	1
Foundations of Unlimited Category Theory: What Remains to be Done	
SOLOMON FEFERMAN .....	6
Neither Categorical nor Set-Theoretic Foundations	
GEOFFREY HELLMAN .....	16
The Genetic versus the Axiomatic Method: Responding to Feferman 1977	
ELAINE LANDRY .....	24
Categorical Foundations of Mathematics or How to Provide Foundations for <i>Abstract</i> Mathematics	
JEAN-PIERRE MARQUIS .....	51
Foundations as Truths which Organize Mathematics	
COLIN MCLARTY .....	76
Formalization, Primitive Concepts, and Purity	
JOHN T. BALDWIN .....	87
Arithmetical Interpretations and Kripke Frames of Predicate Modal Logic of Provability	
TAISHI KURAHASHI .....	129
Antirealism and Constructivism: Brouwer's Weak Counterexamples	
CHARLES McCARTY .....	147
On Formalizing Causation Based on Constant Conjunction Theory	
HU LIU AND XUEFENG WEN .....	160

**Subscription Information:** *Review of Symbolic Logic* (ISSN 1755-0203) is published quarterly by Cambridge University Press for the Association for Symbolic Logic. Annual subscription rates for Volume 6 (2013): Institutional subscription rates, print and online: US \$790.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £495.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, online only: US \$690.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £435.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, print only: US \$760.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £475.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, online only: US \$168.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £105.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, print only: US \$188.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £115.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription correspondence should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994, USA, for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

**Association for Symbolic Logic.** Individual Members of the Association for Symbolic Logic receive a print subscription to *The Review of Symbolic Logic* as a benefit of membership. Requests for information, applications for membership, orders for back volumes, business correspondence, and notices and announcements for publication in the *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic* should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association: **Charles Steinhorn, ASL, Box 742, Vassar College, 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604, USA.** The email address of the Association's business office is [asl@vassar.edu](mailto:asl@vassar.edu). The ASL website is located at <http://www.aslonline.org>. Links from that site provide further information on the *Review* and on submitting papers for publication.

**Coordinating Editor:** Hannes Leitgeb, Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich, Faculty of Philosophy, Philosophy of Science and Study of Religion Geschwister-Scholl-Platz 1, D-80539 Munich, Germany. Email: [Hannes.Leitgeb@lmu.de](mailto:Hannes.Leitgeb@lmu.de). Email: [avigad@cmu.edu](mailto:avigad@cmu.edu).

**Copyright:** All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.: Copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm); enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>

Copyright © Association for Symbolic Logic, 2013