

Southgate considers how empirical science can affect the discussion of theodicy (chapter 60).

Part 5 explores interreligious and interdisciplinary approaches to the question of evil. Jewish, Buddhist, Hindu, Islamic, and Zoroastrian traditions are considered (chapters 67–73). The question of evil in feminist and Black theology is also explored (chapters 76–77). Finally, the theme of suffering in music and art is discussed (chapters 78–80).

As a handbook, this work fulfills its purpose admirably with concise, insightful chapters on a broad range of important topics presented by highly competent authors in a way that will benefit both beginners and advanced scholars.

MICHAEL J. DODDS, OP

Dominican School of Philosophy and Theology, USA
mdodds@dspt.edu

Church as Sanctuary: Reconstructing Refuge in an Age of Enforced Displacement. By Leo Guardado. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2023. xiii + 242 pages. \$40.00 (paper).
 doi:10.1017/hor.2024.44

Leo Guardado has written a fine, persuasive analysis of the significance of sanctuary as a way of understanding the nature and role of the church challenged by the fact of massive human displacement through political violence. The book opens with the description of his painful sundering from his family as he fled from El Salvador in 1991 on a terrifying journey to the United States. This and similar testimonies are the backdrop to the opening chapter, which narrates the history of the sanctuary movement from its emergence in the 1980s and 1990s in response to influx of refugees from horrific civil wars in El Salvador and Guatemala. Guardado sets out the religious and philosophical inspiration of this movement before exploring the biblical and ecclesial/historical significance of sanctuary up to Vatican II and after. There is a paradox here. The sacramental and humanising vision of the Second Vatican Council provides a foundation for a reconstructed notion of sanctuary, which Guardado thinks we need; at the same time, the revised code of Canon Law of 1983 removes the legal status of sanctuary in the apparent belief that the concept is not compatible with a modern understanding of church and state.

Whatever its official standing in the church, the practical and imaginative dimensions of the concept of sanctuary are, for Guardado, indispensable.

Many of the complexities are evident in the historical chapter, where tensions opened up between the humanitarian response of churches in Arizona, catalyzed by the extraordinary energy and vision of Jim Corbett, a goatherder, Friend (Quaker), and philosopher, and direct-action activists in Chicago, who saw the sanctuary movement as a vehicle for wider systemic change. The tension between humanitarian and political understandings raises the question of means and ends, as well as the possibility of conceiving of sanctuary as constitutive of the church. In this sense the book can be seen as a work of comparative ecclesiology; perhaps sanctuary is a possible model of the church, in addition to those classically described by Avery Dulles.

A deeper examination of the theoretical roots of sanctuary draws in Mahatma Gandhi and the Jewish ethical philosopher Emmanuel Levinas, but the testimony for a formal ecclesial restructuring is found in the humanizing *Gaudium et Spes* and its solidarity with the world of today from the documents of the Latin American bishops at Medellín and from Óscar Romero.

Widening the lens from the sanctuary movement of forty years ago means acknowledging key differences from today, however. The activists of this earlier period were motivated in part by the recognition that the United States was a direct cause of the violent instability in Central America, and therefore bore some responsibility for the suffering it generated. Comparisons with anti-Vietnam War protesters and, more distantly, the underground railroad networks of the slavery era, were plausible. By contrast, the tendency now to demonize would-be migrants as existential threat, as merely economic migrants, or even as delinquents is much more widespread; at the same time, the causal role of rich nations in their suffering is, for many, less evident.

The insistence by Emmanuel Levinas on the unconditional ethical responsibility for the vulnerable human other is an important reminder of their claim, regardless of “merit.” Guardado might usefully have referred to the work of Giorgio Agamben on the figure of the *homo sacer*, the victim whose peripheral presence as an “exception” to the legitimate order is essential to the survival of society. One biblical antecedent of this curious motif would be Cain, protected from vengeance by the mark placed on his forehead (Guardado’s scriptural survey focuses instead on alleged cities of sanctuary). The figure of the *homo sacer* offers a reproach and a critique of the nation-state, unable under modern conditions to provide protection for all.

Nevertheless, this is a persuasive and thought-provoking study, which as Guardado asserts, “sought to provide theological scaffolding around the central concept and practice of sanctuary that is still not a permanent pillar of the church”—even as the church needs this pillar if it is to be the legitimate bearer of good news (230–31). The power of the sanctuary as lived practice but also as metaphor might serve as a new or recovered model of church, with rich implications, for example, as a way of rearticulating the church as a place of safety in

the wake of clerical sex abuse. Whatever these possibilities, one merit of this fine study is Guardado's grounded fidelity to a specific crisis and testimony: the decades-long anguish of Central America's vulnerable poor.

MICHAEL KIRWAN SJ
 Trinity College Dublin, Ireland
kirwanm6@tcd.ie

A Theology of Liberation: History, Politics, and Salvation. By Gustavo Gutiérrez. Translated and edited by Sister Caridad Inda and John Eagleson. 50th Anniversary Edition, with a new Introduction by Michael E. Lee. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2023. lxiv + 301 pages. \$32.00 (paper).
 doi:10.1017/hor.2024.37

This new edition of the revised and expanded edition (1988) of *A Theology of Liberation* marks the fiftieth anniversary of the original (1973) English translation of Gustavo Gutiérrez's classic, a book that has changed the course of Christian theology. Along with the early work of James Cone on Black liberation theology and Mary Daly on feminist Christian theology, it laid the foundation for the praxis-based theologies that emerged in the last half-century, reshaping theology and the praxis of discipleship.

The text and translation of this edition remain identical to the 1988 edition with two notable exceptions. First, the publisher changed prior editions' endnotes to footnotes. This changes the pagination but allows readers to follow Gutiérrez's engagement with his interdisciplinary interlocutors more easily. Second, this edition includes a new introduction by Michael E. Lee.

Lee's introduction, which contextualizes Gutiérrez's work in four ways, is a *tour de force*. First, he situates Gutiérrez's use of the word "liberation" within its political, economic, and social meanings in Latin America and his theological development of liberation within Vatican II's call to attend to the signs of the times. Lee argues, Gutiérrez's "bold step was to hear the cries for liberation and to see theology as the critical reflection on the struggle for that liberation" (xiv). Second, Lee outlines the book's major theological contributions, noting that Gutiérrez's engagement in theology as "critical reflection on Christian praxis in light of the Word" (16) changed conversations in the areas of theologies of revelation, theological method, Christology, sin, soteriology, and ecclesiology. In the third and fourth sections, Lee traces the development and legacy of the book, respectively, including the emergence of the central insight of liberation theology, the preferential option for the poor.

Rereading *A Theology of Liberation* reminds one that Gutiérrez's work anticipates several emphases of Pope Francis by a half-century. Francis has