

THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

Edited by

SYMBOLIC
LOGIC

SYMBOLIC
LOGIC

Managing Editor

Noam Greenberg
Rahim Moosa

Matthias Wille

Edited by

John Baldwin

B986

VOLUME 18 • NUMBER 1 • MARCH 2012 • ISSN 1079

Copyright © 2012 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.
Reprints may be purchased from the publisher, or the printer, by permission only.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLES

The absolute arithmetic continuum and the unification of all numbers great and small, by PHILIP EHRLICH	1
In praise of replacement, by AKIHIRO KANAMORI	46
Second order logic or set theory? by JOUKO VÄÄNÄNEN	91

REVIEWS

A. S. Kechris, B. Löwe, and J. R. Steel (editors), <i>Games, scales, and Suslin cardinals. The Cabal Seminar, Volume I</i> . Reviewed by Alessandro Andretta	122
R. Downey and D. Hirschfeldt, <i>Algorithmic randomness and complexity</i> . Reviewed by Laurent Bienvenu	126
G. Sommaruga (editor), <i>Foundational theories of classical and constructive mathematics</i> . Reviewed by Roy T. Cook	128
Several papers concerning computable categoricity. Reviewed by Daniel Turetsky ...	131

2011 Spring Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Hilton San Diego Bayfront Hotel, San Diego, California, USA, April 21–22, 2011	135
2010–2011 Winter Meeting of The Association for Symbolic Logic, New Orleans Marriott and Sheraton New Orleans Hotels, New Orleans, LA, January 8–9, 2011	142

(Continued on inside back cover)

THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC (ISSN print: 1079-8986, ISSN online: 1943-5894) is published quarterly, in the months of March, June, September, and December, by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Inc., 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604-0001, USA. Periodicals postage is paid at Poughkeepsie, NY and at additional mailing offices. The BULLETIN is distributed with THE JOURNAL OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC. The 2012 annual subscription price for the two journals, in either print or electronic form, is US\$625; visit <http://www.aslonline.org/Journals-subscription.html> for more information. **Postmaster:** Send address changes to *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic*, c/o American Mathematical Society, 201 Charles Street, Providence, RI 02904-2294, USA. Business correspondence should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association, Charles Steinhorn (address on inside back cover).

The BULLETIN, the JOURNAL, and the REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC are the official organs of the Association for Symbolic Logic, an international organization for furthering research in all aspects of symbolic logic. The BULLETIN encourages submission of *Articles* and *Communications* in all areas of logic, including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic, and applications of logic to other fields. The BULLETIN also publishes reviews of publications in logic.

Articles should be of broad interest and accessible to a wide audience of logicians. They may be purely expository, survey, or historical articles, or they may contain, in addition, new ideas or results or new approaches to old ones.

Communications should be announcements of important new results and ideas in any aspect of logic: they may be short papers in their final form or preliminary announcements (extended abstracts, position papers) of longer, full papers that will be published elsewhere. In any case, they should include, in addition to a description of the new results or ideas, enough history, background, and explanation to make the significance of the work apparent to a wide audience. *Communications* will be quickly refereed and published within six months of the submission of final versions.

Continued on inside back cover

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1 17 16 15 14 13 12

XVI Brazilian Logic Conference (EBL 2011), Petrópolis, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, May 9–13, 2011	150
18th Workshop on Logic, Language, Information and Computation (WoLLIC 2011), Philadelphia, PA, USA, May 18–20, 2011	152
Notices	154

Articles and Communications being submitted for publication in the BULLETIN should be sent to one (and only one) of the following editors: **John Baldwin** (Managing Editor), *Dept. of Math., Stat., and Comp. Sci. (M/C 249), Univ. of Ill. at Chicago, 851 S. Morgan St., Chicago, IL 60607, USA* (jbaldwin@uic.edu); or **Volker Halbach**, *New College, Oxford, OX1 3BN, UK* (volker.halbach@philosophy.ox.ac.uk); or **Deirdre Haskell**, *Department of Mathematics and Statistics, McMaster University, 1280 Main St. W, Hamilton ON L8S 4K1, Canada* (haskell@math.mcmaster.ca); or **André Nies**, *Department of Computer Science, University of Auckland, Private Bag 92019, Auckland, New Zealand* (nies.editor@gmail.com); or **Martin Otto**, *Department of Mathematics, Technische Universität Darmstadt, Schlossgartenstr. 7, 64289 Darmstadt, Germany* (otto@mathematik.tu-darmstadt.de); or **Michael Rathjen**, *School of Mathematics, University of Leeds, Leeds LS2 9JT, UK* (rathjen@maths.leeds.ac.uk); or **Erich Reck**, *Department of Philosophy, University of California Riverside, HMNSS Building Room 1604, 900 University Avenue, Riverside, CA 92521, USA* (erich.reck@ucr.edu). Submissions that are not readily categorized as either *Articles* or *Communications* should be sent to the managing editor.

Books for review in the BULLETIN should be sent to **ASL, Box 742, Vassar College, 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604, USA**. The Managing Editor for Reviews is **Steve Awodey**, *Department of Philosophy, Carnegie Mellon University, 135 Baker Hall, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, USA* (awodey@cmu.edu). The other editors of reviews are **John Burgess** (jburgess@princeton.edu), **Mark Colyvan** (mcolyvan@usyd.edu.au), **Anuj Dawar** (Anuj.Dawar@cl.cam.ac.uk), **Noam Greenberg** (Noam.Greenberg@mcs.vuw.ac.nz), **Rahim Moosa** (rmoosa@math.uwaterloo.ca), **Ernest Schimmerling** (eschimme@andrew.cmu.edu), **Alex Simpson** (Alex.Simpson@ed.ac.uk), **Kai Wehmeier** (wehmeier@uci.edu), and **Matthias Wille** (matthias.wille@iel.uni-koeln.de).

The editors prefer electronic submissions. The preferred formats for electronic submissions are PDF or postscript, but other formats, such as Word documents, will be accommodated as best as possible. The author should keep a complete copy of the submitted manuscript and the electronic files from which it was created. After the paper is accepted in its final form, an electronic copy will be appreciated and will advance the final publication date of the paper. It is preferred that papers be prepared in \LaTeX or other variant of \TeX , especially for manuscripts that include extensive symbolic or mathematical notation. The ASL \LaTeX style files are available at <http://www.aslonline.org>, but their use is optional. Fifty offprints of each article are supplied at no charge; additional offprints may be purchased if desired.

Postscript files of articles published in the BULLETIN may be downloaded using a Web browser from <http://www.math.ucla.edu/~asl/bs1toc.htm>. All volumes of the BULLETIN also are available online in the JSTOR database.

Requests for information, applications for membership, orders for back volumes, business correspondence, and notices and announcements for publication in the BULLETIN should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association, **Charles Steinhorn**, *ASL, Box 742, Vassar College, 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604, USA*. The electronic mail address of the Association's business office is asl@vassar.edu. The ASL Website is located at <http://www.aslonline.org>. Links from that site provide further information on the BULLETIN and on submitting papers for publication.

Notices of change of address, dues payments, and subscription orders to the JOURNAL and BULLETIN should be sent to: *Association for Symbolic Logic, c/o American Mathematical Society, 201 Charles Street, Providence, RI 02904-2294, USA*. All orders must be accompanied by payment in US dollars; Visa, MasterCard, Discover and American Express charges are accepted. To receive a replacement copy of the BULLETIN, please report damaged, defective, or missing issues within nine months of the date of publication.

For subscriptions to the REVIEW, contact Cambridge Journals Customer Services at journals@cambridge.org.

All back volumes of the BULLETIN are available, from the Office of the Secretary-Treasurer who has information on prices and discounts to individual and institutional members.

The paper used in this BULLETIN is acid-free and falls within the guidelines established to ensure permanence and durability.