

Law & Social Inquiry

Journal of the American Bar Foundation
Volume 20, Number 2, Spring 1995

The University of Chicago Press

Law & Social Inquiry

Journal of the American Bar Foundation

Published by The University of Chicago Press

<i>Editors</i>	Elizabeth Mertz Peter Siegelman Christopher L. Tomlins
<i>Review Editor</i>	Howard S. Erlanger
<i>Associate Editors</i>	Carol A. Heimer Karyl A. Kinsey
<i>Managing Editor</i>	John Atkinson
<i>Editorial Coordinator</i>	Rozanne Caldwell

Editorial Board

Richard L. Abel, Professor of Law, University of California, Los Angeles
Ian Ayres, Professor of Law, Stanford University
Donald Black, Professor of Sociology, University of Virginia
Erhard Blankenburg, Professor of Sociology of Law, Free University of Amsterdam
John Braithwaite, Professor of Law and Sociology, The Australian National University
Jane F. Collier, Professor of Anthropology, Stanford University
Phoebe C. Ellsworth, Professor of Law and Psychology, University of Michigan
Eliot L. Freidson, Professor of Sociology, New York University
Lawrence M. Friedman, Professor of Law, Stanford University
Hazel Genn, Professor of Law, Queen Mary and Westfield College, University of London
Carol J. Greenhouse, Professor of Anthropology, Indiana University
Valerie P. Hans, Professor of Criminal Justice, University of Delaware
Earl Johnson, Jr., Associate Justice, California State Court of Appeal
Doreen McBarnet, Senior Research Fellow, Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, Wolfson College, Oxford
Carrie J. Menkel-Meadow, Professor of Law, University of California, Los Angeles
Laura Nader, Professor of Anthropology, University of California-Berkeley
Judith Resnik, Professor of Law, University of Southern California
Daniel Rubinfeld, Professor of Economics, University of California-Berkeley
Dietrich Rueschemeyer, Professor of Sociology, Brown University
Martin M. Shapiro, Professor of Law, University of California-Berkeley
Susan S. Silbey, Professor of Sociology, Wellesley College
David Sugarman, School of Law, Lancaster University
David M. Trubek, Professor of Law, University of Wisconsin
Barbara Yngvesson, Professor of Anthropology, Hampshire College
Michael Zander, Professor of Law, Department of Law, London School of Economics

Law & Social Inquiry

Volume 20, Number 2, Spring 1995

SYMPOSIUM: Lawyering in Repressive States

- Editor's Introduction*
- Struggle and Legitimation** 339
Stephen Ellmann
- Courting Justice? Legitimation in Lawyering under Israeli Occupation** 349
George E. Bisharat
- Law and Legitimacy in South Africa** 407
Stephen Ellmann
- Dialogue with Dictators: Judicial Resistance in Argentina and Brazil** 481
Mark J. Osiel
- Advocating Democracy: The Role of Lawyers in Taiwan's Political Transformation** 561
Jane Kaufman Winn and Tang-chi Yeh

ARTICLES

- The Double Standard in the English Divorce Laws, 1857-1923** 601
Ann Sumner Holmes
- The Triangle Shirtwaist Factory Fire of 1911: Social Change, Industrial Accidents, and the Evolution of Common-Sense Causality** 621
Arthur F. McEvoy

REVIEW ESSAY

- In an Indeterminate State: Calavita on the Bracero Program** 655
Susan Sterett

BOOK NOTES

675

Law & Social Inquiry

SYMPOSIUM

On Women in Legal Practice 14:2

Virginia G. Drachman, "My 'Partner' in Law and Life": Marriage in the Lives of Women Lawyers in Late 19th- and Early 20th-Century America

DEBATES

Martin Krygier, Marxism and the Rule of Law: Reflections After the Collapse of Communism, *plus commentaries by Leon Lipson, John Comaroff, Maureen Cain, Richard L. Abel, and Grazyna Skqpska* 15:4

Charles R. Epp, Do Lawyers Impair Economic Growth? *plus commentaries by Mancur Olson, Ronald J. Gilson, Philip Keefer, Frank B. Cross, Richard H. Sander, and Stephen P. Magee* 17:4

REGULAR ARTICLES

Richard H. Sander and E. Douglass Williams, Why Are There So Many Lawyers? Perspectives on a Turbulent Market 14:3

Ted Schneyer, Professionalism as Bar Politics: The Making of the Model Rules of Professional Conduct 14:4

Shari Seidman Diamond, Revising Images of Public Punitiveness: Sentencing by Lay and Professional English Magistrates 15:2

Sara Cobb and Janet Rifkin, Practice and Paradox: Deconstructing Neutrality in Mediation 16:1

Ian Ayres and John Braithwaite, Tripartism: Regulatory Capture and Empowerment 16:3

Alan Hunt, Foucault's Expulsion of Law: Toward a Retrieval, *plus commentaries by Susan S. Silbey and Jonathan Simon* 17:1

Stuart Low and Janet Kiholm Smith, The Relationship of Alternative Negligence Rules to Litigation Behavior and Tort Claim Disposition 17:1

Michael Ariens, Progress Is Our Only Product: Legal Reform and the Codification of Evidence 17:2

William J. Novak, Public Economy and the Well-ordered Market: Law and Economic Regulation in 19th-Century America 18:1

Robert L. Kidder and Setsuo Miyazawa, Long-Term Strategies in Japanese Environmental Litigation 18:4

REVIEW SYMPOSIA

Critical Empiricism and Sociological Studies 14:1

David M. Trubek and John Esser, "Critical Empiricism"

in American Legal Studies: Paradox, Program, or Pandora's Box?

Redressing Inequality and Exclusion 17:3

Katharine T. Bartlett, Minow's Social-Relations Approach to Difference: Unanswering the Unmasked June Carbone, Equality and Difference: Reclaiming Motherhood as a Central Focus of Family Law

The Supreme Court and Social Change 17:4

Michael W. McCann, Reform Litigation on Trial Malcolm M. Feeley, Hollow Hopes, Flypaper, and Metaphors Gerald N. Rosenberg, Hollow Hopes and Other Aspirations: A Reply to Feeley and McCann

REVIEW DEBATE

Christine B. Harrington and Barbara Yngvesson, Interpretive Sociolegal Research 15:1

REVIEW ESSAY

J. M. Balkin, The Domestication of Law and Literature 14:4

Back Issues

Set of remaining issues (vols. 14-18) at 50% off:

Individuals \$100.00 Institutions \$157.50

Individual volumes 14-19 at 35% off:

Individuals \$25.40 Institutions \$40.35
 Vol. 14 15 16 17 18 19

Single issues at 25% off:

Individuals \$7.25 Institutions \$11.55

List by vol./no.: _____

Be sure your mailing label (on reverse) is attached.

All journal rates include domestic postage. Outside USA add 75¢ per issue additional postage. Canadians, please add 7% GST. Availability of back issues is subject to current inventory at the time your order is processed.

Order Form

Charge my Visa MasterCard Exp. Date _____

Acct. No. _____

Signature _____

Phone (_____) _____

Check enclosed (payable to journal)

Purchase order enclosed

Please mail to The University of Chicago Press, Journals Division, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL, 60637

CF5CC

Law & Social Inquiry 1989-1994 (Volumes 14-19)

Publication Policy

The American Bar Foundation is an independent research institute committed to socio-legal research. Consistent with its mandate to create and disseminate knowledge about law, the legal profession, and legal institutions, *Law and Social Inquiry: Journal of the American Bar Foundation* invites the submission of articles that make original contributions to understanding of socio-legal processes. *Law and Social Inquiry* publishes both empirical and theoretical studies from a variety of disciplinary perspectives. The analyses, conclusions, and opinions are those of the authors alone.

Manuscript Evaluation: *Law and Social Inquiry* is a refereed journal. Manuscripts that the Editors deem appropriate for the journal are evaluated by two or more reviewers with expertise in the relevant subject matter and methodology. Manuscripts produced by ABF research fellows are evaluated by the same process as outside manuscripts and are not accorded priority in publication.

Submission of Manuscripts: Manuscripts submitted to *Law and Social Inquiry* should be typed double-spaced and be accompanied by an abstract of not more than 150 words. The review process is anonymous; all identifying information should appear only on a separate cover sheet and not in the body of the manuscript.

Law and Social Inquiry does not accept multiply submitted articles. The Editors endeavor to make decisions promptly, usually about two months after submission.

Editing of Manuscripts: All manuscripts accepted for publication are edited for style by professional copyeditors in consultation with the author. Copyeditors do not check citations. Authors see edited manuscripts and/or proofs.

Off-Prints to Authors: Without charge, we provide authors with 25 off-prints of their articles, essays, or exchanges (but not symposia) that appear in *Law and Social Inquiry*. Additional off-prints may be ordered at the author's expense. Authors receive 1 copy of the issue in which their contributions appear.

Republication Rights: The Foundation normally permits authors to republish their manuscripts in books or use their manuscripts after publication, but *Law and Social Inquiry* has the right to first publication of edited manuscripts. The journal retains the right to republish manuscripts as reprints or as part of any reproduction of the issue or volume in which they appear, by any means, including without limit electronic means or microfilm.

Copying Beyond Fair Use: The code on the first page of a contribution in this journal indicates the copyright owner's consent that copies of the contribution may be made beyond those permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law provided that copies are made only for personal or internal use, or for the personal or internal use of specific clients and provided that the copier pay the stated per-copy fee through the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. To request permission for other kinds of copying, such as copying for classroom use without charge, copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale, kindly write to the Permissions Department, University of Chicago Press, 5801 S. Ellis Avenue, Chicago, IL 60637.

Comments and Responses: Comments on or responses to articles or review essays in the form of brief, scholarly statements will be published at the discretion of the Editors or Review Section Editor.

Send article manuscripts to:
The Editors
Law and Social Inquiry
American Bar Foundation
750 N. Lake Shore Drive
Chicago, IL 60611
(312) 988-6500

Send inquiries regarding
review essays to:
Howard S. Erlanger
Review Editor
Law and Social Inquiry
Institute for Legal Studies
Law School
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53706
(608) 263-7405

Annual U.S. subscription rates:

	1 yr.	2 yr.	3 yr.
Individuals	\$36	\$66.25	\$91.80
Academic	\$29	\$53.35	\$73.95
Institutions	\$59	\$108.55	\$150.45

Outside U.S. please add a postage charge of \$6.00 per year to the U.S. rates. **Canadians please add** 7% GST tax to above rates as follows: One-year rates: Individuals \$2.52; Academic \$2.03; Institutions \$4.13. Two-year rates: Individuals \$4.63; Academic \$3.73; Institutions \$7.59. Three-year rates: Individuals \$6.42; Academic \$5.17; Institutions \$10.53.

Single copies: \$14.75 for institutions, \$9.00 for individuals. Checks should be made payable to *Law & Social Inquiry*, University of Chicago Press, Journals Division, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, Illinois 60637. (Fax: 312-753-0811.) Volumes 1-12 available from Fred B. Rothman & Company, 10368 West Centennial Road, Littleton, Colorado 80127. (303) 979-5657

Volumes available in microfilm from University Microfilms International, 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106.

© 1995 American Bar Foundation. All rights reserved.

Law and Social Inquiry: Journal of the American Bar Foundation (ISSN: 0897-6546) is published quarterly—winter, spring, summer, and fall—by The University of Chicago Press, 5720 South Woodlawn Ave., Chicago, Illinois 60637. Subscription agent for Japan: Kinokuniya Company, Ltd. Second-class postage paid at Chicago, Illinois and at additional mailing office.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to: *Law and Social Inquiry*, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637.