

# CHURCH HISTORY

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY, JUNE, 1994

# THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY

## *PRESIDENT*

STEPHEN J. STEIN, Indiana University

## *PRESIDENT-ELECT*

BERNARD MCGINN, University of Chicago

## *SECRETARY-TREASURER*

HENRY W. BOWDEN, Rutgers University

## *ASSISTANT SECRETARY*

MELISSA B. KIRKPATRICK, The American University

## *EDITORS*

JERALD C. BRAUER  
MARTIN E. MARTY

The Divinity School, University of Chicago

## *MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL*

### Class of 1994

J. WAYNE BAKER  
EDITH L. BLUMHOFER  
DANIEL W. HOWE  
WALTER L. MOORE  
RANDI WALKER

### Class of 1995

CHARLES HAMBRICK-STOWE  
DALE A. JOHNSON  
PAULA M. KANE  
BERNARD MCGINN  
ANNE C. ROSE

### Class of 1996

JEREMY ADAMS  
KAREN J. TORJESEN  
DAVID L. HOLMES  
RICHARD KIECKHEFER  
JON ROBERTS  
JAY DOLAN  
ELIZABETH CLARK

The Society was founded in 1888 by Philip Schaff, was reorganized in 1906, and was incorporated by act of the Legislature of the State of New York in 1916.

Vol. 63    June 1994    No. 2

# CHURCH HISTORY

Published quarterly by  
THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY

© 1994, The American Society of Church History

## CHURCH HISTORY EDITORS

JERALD C. BRAUER  
MARTIN E. MARTY

The Divinity School, University of Chicago

*with the cooperation of*

JANE D. DOUGLASS, Princeton Theological Seminary  
MARK U. EDWARDS, JR., The Divinity School, Harvard University  
ROBERT T. HANDY, Union Theological Seminary  
BERNARD MCGINN, The Divinity School, University of Chicago  
RICHARD A. NORRIS, Union Theological Seminary  
JOHN F. WILSON, Princeton University

*assistants to the editors*

K. SIGNE HANSEN  
MICHELE ROSENTHAL

*Church History* is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by the American Society of Church History. Subscription prices are \$30.00 a year (persons having been society members for five years and now retired from professional life—\$15.00; dues free for graduate students with the approval of a professor who is a member of the Society); \$8.00 for single issues; \$7.00 per year extra should be added for foreign countries. Please make all remittances payable to the American Society of Church History. Subscription applications, renewals, changes of address, claims for missing numbers, and orders for single copies of current or back issues should be sent to Henry W. Bowden, P.O. Box 8517, Red Bank, NJ 07701. Claims for missing numbers will be honored without charge if made within two months following the regular month of publication.

Microfilm reproductions of *The American Society of Church History Papers*, series I and II, and of *Church History*, vols. 1–17 (1932–48), are available from the ATLA Preservation Board. Orders for these reproductions as well as inquiries about microfilm portions and xerox copies should be sent to 1118 East 54th Place, Chicago, Illinois 60615.

Microfilm reproductions of *Church History* starting with vol. 18 (1949) are available to subscribers and members of the society from University Microfilms, 300 N. Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106. The full text of *Church History* is also available in the electronic versions of the *Humanities Index*. *Church History* is indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*, published by the American Theological Library Association, Chicago, available online in the ATLA Religion Database through BRS Information Technologies (Latham, New York) and DIALOG Information Services (Palo Alto, California).

The following indexes are available from the treasurer, Henry W. Bowden, at the address given above: *Papers* and vols. 1–30 (1932–1961), \$10.00; vols. 31–39 (1962–1970), \$10.00; vols. 40–49 (1971–1980), \$10.00 (\$8.00 for active, individual members of the Society). Add \$2.00 postage charges. Book reviews are indexed or abstracted in *Book Review Index*, *Historical Abstracts*, and *America: History and Life*.

Manuscripts and books for review should be sent to *Church History*, Swift Hall, 1025 E. 58th St., Chicago, Illinois 60637. Manuscripts submitted for consideration must be typed double-spaced in 12-point font on sturdy paper; footnotes must be typed double-spaced on separate pages following the text. Manuscripts exceeding twenty-five pages in length (including footnotes) cannot be considered. Please submit two copies of the manuscript and include correct return postage.

Advertising orders and requests for permission to quote should be addressed to the editorial office in Chicago.

*Church History* is printed by Science Press, Ephrata, Pennsylvania. Second-class postage paid at Red Bank, New Jersey and additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send Address Changes to: Church History, American Society of Church History, Henry W. Bowden, P.O. Box 8517, Red Bank, NJ 07701.

CHURCH HISTORY (ISSN 0009-6407)

# CONTENTS

- 175 The Puzzle of American Methodism  
NATHAN O. HATCH
- 190 Dilemmas of a Socinian Pacifist in Seventeenth-Century Poland  
PETER BROCK
- 201 Celebration of the Revolutionary Festivals Under the Directory:  
A Failure of Sacrality  
JOSEPH F. BYRNES
- 221 A Different Kind of Freedom? Order and Discipline among the  
Moravian Brethren in Germany and Salem, North Carolina  
1771–1801  
ELISABETH SOMMER
- 235 Adventism, Apocalyptic, and the Cause of Liberty  
DOUGLAS MORGAN
- 250 **Book Reviews**
- Watson, Alan, *The State, Law, and Religion: Pagan Rome* ..... Don S. Armentrout
- Becker, Jürgen, ed., *Christian Beginnings: Word and  
Community from Jesus to Post-Apostolic Times* ..... Glenn Hinson
- Martin, Jochen, and Quint, Barbara, eds., *Christentum und die  
antike Gesellschaft* ..... Thomas F. X. Noble
- Taylor, Joan E., *Christians and the Holy Places: The Myth of  
Jewish-Christian Origins* ..... Stephan Borgehammar
- Dawson, David, *Allegorical Readers and Cultural Revision in  
Ancient Alexandria* ..... Joseph W. Trigg
- Brown, Peter, *The Body and Society: Men, Women, and Sexual  
Renunciation in Early Christianity* ..... Robert M. Grant
- Benko, Stephen, *The Virgin Goddess: Studies in the Pagan and  
Christian Roots of Mariology* ..... Frederick W. Norris
- Pelikan, Jaroslav, *The Byzantine Apologia for Icons* ..... Joseph W. Trigg
- Corrigan, Kathleen, *Visual Polemics in the Ninth Century  
Byzantine Psalters* ..... George T. Dennis, S.J.
- Blowers, Paul M., *Exegesis and Spiritual Pedagogy in Maximus  
the Confessor: An Investigation into the Quaestiones ad  
Thalassium* ..... Joseph F. Kelly
- Tellenbach, Gerd, *Church, State, and Christian Society at the  
Time of the Investiture Contest* ..... Francis Oakley
- Merlo, Grado Giovanni, *Tra eremo e città. Studi su Francesco  
d'Assisi e sul francescanesimo medievale* ..... Daniel Bornstein
- Hamburger, Jeffrey F., *The Rothschild Canticles: Art and  
Mysticism in Flanders and the Rhineland Circa 1300* ..... William D. Carpe
- Rubin, Miri, *Corpus Christi: The Eucharist in Late Medieval  
Culture* ..... Donald D. Sullivan

- Milis, Ludo J. R., *Angelic Monks and Earthly Men: Monasticism and Its Meaning to Medieval Society* ..... John Coakley
- Amt, Emilie, ed., *Women's Lives in Medieval Europe: A Sourcebook* ..... Anne L. Barstow
- Rex, Richard, *The Theology of John Fisher* ..... Richard M. Spielmann
- Baylor, Michael G., ed. and trans. *The Radical Reformation* ..... George Hunston Williams
- Schneider, John R., *Philip Melancthon's Rhetorical Construal of Biblical Authority: Oratio Sacra* ..... Ralph Keen
- Stayer, James M., *The German Peasants' War and Anabaptist Community of Goods* ..... Donald F. Durnbaugh
- Parker, T. H. L., *Calvin's Preaching* ..... W. Fred Graham
- Gerrish, B. A., *Grace and Gratitude: The Eucharistic Theology of John Calvin* ..... Robert M. Kingdon
- Helmholz, R. H., *Roman Canon Law in Reformation England* ..... William S. Stafford
- de Las Casas, Bartolomé, translated and edited by Poole, Stafford, *In Defense of the Indians. The Defense of the Most Reverend Lord, Don Fray Bartolomé de Las Casas, of the order of Preachers, Late Bishop of Chiapa, Against the Persecutors and Slanderers of the Peoples of the New World Discovered Across the Seas* ..... Juan Durán Luzio
- Chorpenning, Joseph F., O.S.F.S., *The Divine Romance: Teresa of Avila's Narrative Theology* ..... Gillian Ahlgren
- Hamilton, Donna B., *Shakespeare and the Politics of Protestant England* ..... Karen Bruhn
- Lossky, Nicholas, *Lancelot Andrewes the Preacher (1555–1626): The Origins of Mystical Theology in the Church of England* ..... Cecile Zinberg
- Palmer, William, *The Political Career of Oliver St. John, 1637–1649* ..... J. Sears McGee
- Feingold, Mordechai, *Before Newton: The Life and Times of Isaac Barrow* ..... Rick Kennedy
- Greaves, Richard, *John Bunyan and English Nonconformity* ..... Paul S. Seaver
- Foster, Stephen, *The Long Argument: English Puritanism and the Shaping of New England Culture, 1570–1700* ..... John Corrigan
- Becker, Thomas Paul, *Konfessionalisierung in Kurköln. Untersuchungen zur Durchsetzung der katholischen Reform in den Dekanaten Ahrgau und Bonn anhand von Visitationsprotokollen, 1583–1761* ..... Robert Bireley, S.J.
- Gunter, Stephen, *The Limits of "Love Divine": John Wesley's Response to Antinomianism and Enthusiasm* ..... E. Dale Dunlap
- Chilcote, Paul Wesley, *John Wesley and the Women Preachers of Early Methodism* ..... Catherine A. Brekus
- Power, T. P. and Whelan, Kevin, eds., *Endurance and Emergence: Catholics in Ireland in the Eighteenth Century* ..... Emmet Larkin
- Delumaeu, Jean, *Sin and Fear: The Emergence of a Western Guilt Culture, 13th–18th Centuries* ..... Daniel Bornstein
- Gascoigne, John, *Cambridge in the Age of the Enlightenment: Science, Religion and Politics from the Restoration to the French Revolution* ..... John Corrigan
- Varley, E. A., *The Last of the Prince Bishops: William Van Mildert and the High Church Movement of the Early Nineteenth Century* ..... Robert Bruce Mullin
- Promey, Sally M. *Spiritual Spectacles: Vision and Image in Mid-Nineteenth-Century Shakerism* ..... Gerald E. Jones
- Allen, James B., Esplin, Ronald K., and Whittaker, David J., *Men with a Mission: The Quorum of the Twelve Apostles in the British Isles, 1827–1841* ..... William C. Ringenberg

Hempton, David, and Hill, Myrtle, <i>Evangelical Protestantism in Ulster Society 1740–1890</i> .....	Donald L. Kirkham
Alexander Crummell: <i>Destiny and Race: Selected Writings, 1840–1898</i> , edited by Wilson Jeremiah Moses .....	Susie C. Stanley
Van Wagoner, Richard S., <i>Mormon Polygamy: A History</i> .....	Carmon Hardy
Quinn, D. Michael, ed., <i>The New Mormon History: Revisionist Essays on the Past</i> .....	Kenneth H. Winn
Higginbotham, Evelyn Brooks, <i>Righteous Discontent: The Women's Movement in the Black Baptist Church, 1880–1920</i> .....	Susie C. Stanley
Tanner, Klaus, <i>Die fromme Verstaatlichung des Gewissens: Zur Auseinandersetzung um die Legitimität der Weimarer Reichsverfassung in Staatsrechtswissenschaft und Theologie der zwanziger Jahre</i> .....	Richard V. Pierard
Walker, Randi Jones, <i>Protestantism in the Sangre de Cristos, 1850–1920</i> .....	Evelyn A. Kirkley
Geige, Franz G. M., <i>The Varieties of Protestantism in Nazi Germany: Five Theopolitical Positions</i> .....	Daniel Borg
Brakelman, Günter, and Rosowski, Martin, eds., <i>Antisemitismus. Von religiöser Judenfeindschaft zur Rassenideologie</i> .....	Heiko A. Oberman
Marshall, David B., <i>Secularizing the Faith: Canadian Protestant Clergy and the Crisis of Belief, 1850–1940</i> .....	John G. Stackhouse
Sharp, Douglas R., <i>The Hermeneutics of Election: The Significance of the Doctrine in Barth's Church Dogmatics</i> .....	Mary Kathleen Cunningham
Carpenter, Joel A. and Shenk, Wilbert R., <i>Earthen Vessels: American Evangelicals and Foreign Missions, 1880–1980</i> .....	Melissa Kirkpatrick
Wuthnow, Robert, Hidgkinson, Virginia A., and Associates, <i>Faith and Philanthropy in America: Exploring the Role of Religion in America's Voluntary Sector</i> .....	Russell E. Richey
Wood, Forrest G., <i>The Arrogance of Faith: Christianity and Race in America from the Colonial Era to the Twentieth Century</i> .....	Milton C. Sernett
McDonough, Peter, <i>Men Astutely Trained: A History of the Jesuits in the American Century</i> .....	Steven M. Avella
Hillery, George A., <i>The Monastery: A Study in Freedom, Love, and Community</i> .....	R. Scott Appleby
Brereton, Virginia Lieson, <i>From Sin to Salvation: Stories of Women's Conversion, 1800 to the Present</i> .....	Mike Ashcraft
<i>The Papers of Martin Luther King, Jr.: Called to Serve, January 1929–June 1951. Volume I.</i> ed. Clayborne Carson, Ralph E. Luker, Penny A. Russell, Louis R. Harlan .....	David W. Wills