

comes from short-term business loans fail during depressions. He claim that not only Schiff but also Morgan and other big banking firms rescued the American railroads from the unprincipled behaviour of certain individual speculators. He distinguishes between the Kerensky revolution which overthrew the Czar and the Bolshevik revolution which overthrow Kerensky—Schiff supported the former. He quotes the Dictionary of American Biography to exculpate Paul Warburg, and finally distinguishes between the Federal Reserve Bank of New York, which did not participate in Bretton Woods, and the Treasury Department of which he suggests Mr Chesterton is ignorant. Mr Calderon's argument is vigorous if inconclusive, and for both these reasons the correspondence is now closed. THE EDITOR

---

R E V I E W S  
FOR THE UNITY OCTAVE

MR MASCALL, whose study of the traditional theism in *He Who Is* was so stimulating, has now put us further in his debt by his most recent book.<sup>1</sup> This, as its sub-title tells us, is 'A study of the Incarnation and its consequences', and one does not know whether to admire more the width of reading and thought which lie behind the book, or the charm and ease of Mr Mascall's manner of exposition.

Mr Mascall has attempted, on the whole with great success, to find an answer to the antimonies raised by modern theological writers in the traditional teaching of the Church, and he supplements his treatment by an extensive use of such writers as de Lubac, Vonier and above all Mersch. He further brings into play with effect his knowledge of the more traditional Anglican writers to illustrate their conformity with the orthodox teaching and to express in matchless English the truths of Revelation.

The scope of the work is large, perhaps too large for a work of 250 pages, treating as it does of the Theology of the Incarnation, Atonement, the Mystical Body, Eucharist and Prayer. It cannot be said, however, that this detracts from the unity of the work since all in it is related to the central theme of our adoption and incorporation into the Sonship of Christ. Mr Mascall's firm grasp of the teaching of Chalcedon enables him to treat such subsidiary themes as Theology in the Mystical Body with a balanced sanity and yet in an inspiring manner. This emphasis on the doctrine of the Mystical Body, springing, as it does, out of Scripture and tradition, provides us with a corrective and a warning against a current of opinion in our times. It has become the custom recently to oppose the Christian

---

<sup>1</sup> *Christ, the Christian and the Church*. By E. L. Mascall. (Longmans; 15s.)

doctrine of personality to secular systems of thought which may be described as being collectivist and totalitarian. While the opposition is real and the issue is vital, some of the Catholic exponents of Personalism appear to have lost sight of the corporate nature of Christianity and the fact that the human person must be discussed in that context if irreparable harm is not to be done. The tendency is reinforced by the willingness of political schools of thought to use Christian doctrines for their own ends. Against such a tendency Mr Mascall's book provides a corrective in its treatment of the doctrine of the Mystical Body. Mr Mascall's adoption of an ontological or realist standpoint enables him to avoid the pitfalls of psychological approach to the Incarnation, and in this respect his criticism and retutation of the Kenotic theories, associated with the names of Gore and Kenton, is one of the best parts of the book. Taking his stand on the teaching of the Scriptures as a whole he is able to show how the approach dictated by a liberal *Weltanschauung* only serves to distort the evidence of Revelation and finally to dilute the Gospel.

It would be ungenerous to stress the point, but two weaknesses are evident amid so much that is satisfying. In his exposition Mr Mascall is much influenced, and rightly so, by modern theological works, but these works, invaluable though their interpretations may be, do not exempt us from going to the sources. For instance, he follows Dr Prestige's view regarding the meaning of the word *Substantia* in Tertullian, but in spite of the great authority of Dr Prestige, one may doubt whether he has said all that there is to be said on the matter and in this case at least recourse should have been made to the text of Tertullian himself. There is indeed about many passages in the book a derivative air and on many points far greater enlightenment could have been drawn from the Fathers than even from the modern French school. The question, fundamental to the work, of our incorporation in Christ could have been developed with even greater fruitfulness if Mr Mascall had made greater use of St Irenaeus's teaching regarding the image doctrine as an integral part of the recapitulation of all things in Christ. Again, though the contrasts presented by the Liberal psychological approach are well stated, the argumentation has a tendency to peter out and become vague when the time for a positive reply arrives. This is perhaps most noticeable in Mr Mascall's treatment of the human knowledge of Christ and the impassibility of the Word. Mr Mascall has a clear grasp of the terms involved, but the difficulty of their reconciliation remains unresolved. This is not to suggest that the element of high mystery can ever be removed from such problems, but the statement or positing of the question is all important, and in this respect Mr

Mascall's treatment of the divine impassibility on page 15 is quite unintelligible to the reviewer—how does a distinction between the infinitely great intensity with which our actions 'affect' God, and the infinitely surpassing beatitude which he enjoys in 'interior fullness', serve, save in an imaginative way, to show that there is 'no incompatibility between the compassion and the impassability of God'? It presents the problem well but in no way resolves it.

What is, however, of great value, though even here there are curious ambiguities in the status given to grace, is the use he makes of the doctrine of the hypostatic union to illustrate the doctrines of Baptism and the Eucharist. The action of God in the ontological sphere of the soul, regenerated by Baptism, and the consequent incorporation of the Christian into Christ—a relation of Being—the dawning of the Great Day of the Lord, provides a basis for a treatment of the relation of the eternal to the temporal which is illuminating. The section on the Eucharist is much influenced by the work of Abbot Vonier but here again his use of the patristic teaching regarding the cosmic and high priestly action of Christ, and of the timeless state of the glorified body of our Lord united to the Word, provides a piece of theological writing worthy of the closest attention.

With regard to minor points; the argument which attempts to show that Article 38 is in complete conformity with the traditional doctrine of the Eucharist, must appear to the non-Anglican as a bit of special pleading.

Again, the vital problem of the vehicle through which the Church exercises her authority is avoided and it is surely time that Anglican writers of the standing of Mr Mascall refrained from remarks about 'Roman curialism' which have no relevance with regard to the dogmatic points at issue.

Allowing for all this, we must nevertheless greet Mr Mascall's latest work with enthusiasm as a real contribution to Theology, all the more so in that by its sturdy fidelity to the teaching of the Scriptures it does provide a basis for debate and discussion, and that in its very close relation to the teaching of the 'Great Church' it should prove helpful to many.

IAN HISLOP, O.P.

#### MEDIEVAL STUDIES

A SKETCH OF MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY. By D. J. B. Hawkins. (Sheed and Ward; 6s.)

REALISTS AND NOMINALISTS. By Meyrick H. Carré. (Cumberlege, Oxford University Press; 8s. 6d.)

THE EXISTENCE OF GOD. By Eric G. Jay. (S.P.C.K.; 4s. 6d.)

One does not often have three books added to the too-scarce library available to the English reader who may be interested in scholastic thought but lacking special training.