

THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

Edited by

Jeremy Avigad, *Coordinating Editor*

Rosalie Iemhoff

Hannes Leitgeb

Carsten Lutz

Paolo Mancosu

Graham Priest

Ian Proops

Alasdair Urquhart

Richard Zach

VOLUME 4 • NUMBER 3 • SEPTEMBER 2011 • ISSN 1755-0203

Copyright © 2011 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.



PUBLISHED QUARTERLY BY THE ASSOCIATION FOR SYMBOLIC LOGIC, INC.
WITH SUPPORT FROM INSTITUTIONAL MEMBERS.

THE REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

Coordinating Editor

Jeremy Avigad
*Departments of Philosophy and Mathematical Sciences
Carnegie Mellon University*

Editors

Rosalie Iemhoff
*Department of Philosophy
Utrecht University*

Hannes Leitgeb
*Faculty of Philosophy, Philosophy of
Science, and Study of Religion
Ludwig-Maximilians-University, Munich*

Carsten Lutz
*Department of Computer Science
University of Bremen*

Paolo Mancosu
*Department of Philosophy
University of California, Berkeley*

Graham Priest
*The Graduate Center
City University of New York*

Ian Proops
*Department of Philosophy
University of Texas at Austin*

Alasdair Urquhart
*Departments of Philosophy and
Computer Science
University of Toronto*

Richard Zach
*Department of Philosophy
University of Calgary*

Advisory Board

Steve Awodey
*Department of Philosophy
Carnegie Mellon University*

Hartry Field
*Department of Philosophy
New York University*

Kit Fine
*Departments of Philosophy
and Mathematics
New York University*

Michael Friedman
*Department of Philosophy
Stanford University*

Marcus Kracht
*Department of Linguistic and
Literary Studies
University of Bielefeld*

John MacFarlane
*Department of Philosophy and
Group in Logic and
Methodology of Science
University of California, Berkeley*

Ruth Barcan Marcus
*Department of Philosophy
Yale University*

D.A. Martin
*Departments of Mathematics
and Philosophy
University of California,
Los Angeles*

Lawrence Moss
*Department of Mathematics
Indiana University*

Ulrike Sattler
*School of Computer Science
University of Manchester*

Colin Stirling
*School of Informatics
University of Edinburgh*

James Tappenden
*Department of Philosophy
University of Michigan*

Johan van Benthem
*Institute for Logic,
Language
and Computation
University of Amsterdam and
Department of Philosophy
Stanford University*

Michiel van Lambalgen
*Institute for Logic,
Language and
Computation and
Department of Philosophy
University of Amsterdam*

Dag Westerståhl
*Department of Philosophy
Gothenburg University*

Mark Wilson
*Department of Philosophy
Pittsburgh University*

Crispin Wright
*Department of Philosophy
University of St. Andrews and
New York University*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Author Meets His Critics Forum from the 2009

APA East Coast Meeting

Introduction to *Author Meets Critics Session on Saving Truth From Paradox*

HARTRY FIELD 337

Field's *Saving Truth From Paradox*: Some Things It Doesn't Do

DONALD A. MARTIN 339

Truth, Logical Validity and Determinateness: A Commentary on Field's *Saving Truth From Paradox*

P. D. WELCH 348

Comments on Martin's and Welch's Comments

HARTRY FIELD 360

Articles

On the Termination of Russell's Description Elimination Algorithm

CLEMENS GRABMAYER, JOOP LEO, VINCENT VAN OOSTROM
AND ALBERT VISSER 367

Paradoxes of Intensionality

DUSTIN TUCKER AND RICHMOND H. THOMASON 394

Reasoning with Protocols Under Imperfect Information

ERIC PACUIT AND SUNIL SIMON 412

A Logic for 'Because'

BENJAMIN SCHNIEDER 445

Proof-Theoretic Semantic Values for Logical Operators

NISSIM FRANCEZ AND GILAD BEN-AVI 466

Reassurance for the Logic of Paradox

MARCEL CRABBÉ 479

Subscription Information: *Review of Symbolic Logic* (ISSN 1755-0203) is published quarterly by Cambridge University Press for the Association for Symbolic Logic. Annual subscription rates for Volume 4 (2011): Institutional subscription rates, print and online: US \$680.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £415.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, online only: US \$572.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £368.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, print only: US \$645.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £385.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, online only: US \$143.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £92.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, print only: US \$162.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £97.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription correspondence should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994, USA, for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

Association for Symbolic Logic. Individual Members of the Association for Symbolic Logic receive a print subscription to *The Review of Symbolic Logic* as a benefit of membership. Requests for information, applications for membership, orders for back volumes, business correspondence, and notices and announcements for publication in the *The Bulletin of Symbolic Logic* should be sent to the Secretary-Treasurer of the Association: **Charles Steinhorn, ASL, Box 742, Vassar College, 124 Raymond Avenue, Poughkeepsie, NY 12604, USA.** The email address of the Association's business office is asl@vassar.edu. The ASL website is located at <http://www.aslonline.org>. Links from that site provide further information on the *Review* and on submitting papers for publication.

Coordinating Editor: Jeremy Avigad, Department of Philosophy, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, USA. Email: avigad@cmu.edu.

Copyright: All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.: Copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying. General enquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; general enquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission enquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm; enquiries regarding Spanish-language translation rights (only) should be addressed to the Madrid office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/madrid.htm>

Copyright © Association for Symbolic Logic, 2011